

# PHILIPPINE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

Journal of the National College of Public Administration and Governance, University  
of the Philippines Diliman, the Association of Schools of Public Administration in  
the Philippines, and the Philippine Society for Public Administration

- |                |   |
|----------------|---|
| <i>Ocampo</i>  | Spatial Dimension of Public Administration                |
| <i>Manalo</i>  | Exploring the Challenges of Transformative<br>Citizenship |
| <i>Delfin</i>  | Regulating Vehicular Emissions<br>in Three Asian Cities   |
| <i>Legaspi</i> | HRD Reforms in the Bureaucracy                            |

PHILIPPINE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

OCTOBER 2004

VOL. XLVIII NO. 4

# PHILIPPINE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

## Editorial Board

LEDIVINA V. CARIÑO, *Chair*

JOSE V. ABUEVA, OSCAR M. ALFONSO, ALEX B. BRILLANTES, JR.,  
JOSE N. ENDRIGA, ROMEO B. OCAMPO, VICENTE D. MARIANO, *Members*

*Issue Editor:* VICENTE D. MARIANO

*House Editor:* OSCAR M. ALFONSO

*Managing Editor:* VINCENT Q. SILARDE

*Business Manager:* MERCEDITA M. MIRANDA

*Editorial Assistants:* MARICEL T. FERNANDEZ  
DUNSTAN T. DECENA

---

The *Philippine Journal of Public Administration* is the official journal of the National College of Public Administration and Governance, University of the Philippines Diliman. It is published quarterly during the months of January, April, July, and October. The opinions expressed in the Journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National College of Public Administration and Governance nor of the University of the Philippines Diliman.

	<i>Local</i>	<i>Foreign</i>
Subscription: Per Year:	P 500.00	US\$ 50.00
Single Issue:	P 140.00	US\$ 14.00

Manuscripts and communications should be addressed to the Managing Editor; orders for subscription should be sent to the Business Manager, *Philippine Journal of Public Administration*, National College of Public Administration and Governance, University of the Philippines Diliman, 1101 Quezon City, PO Box 198, UP Campus.

Articles in the Journal are indexed in the *Index to Philippine Periodicals* (University of the Philippines), *Publication Affairs Information Service* (P.A.I.S., Inc., New York), *Selected Philippine Periodicals Index* (Silliman University), *Ulrich's International Periodicals Directory* (R.R. Bowker Co., New York, N.Y.), *International Bibliography of Periodical Literature Covering All Fields of Knowledge* (IBZ, Zeller Verlag GmbH & Co., Osnabrück) and *International Bibliography of Book Reviews* (IBR, Zeller Verlag GmbH & Co., Osnabrück).

Entered as second-class mail at the Manila Central Post Office on 15 February 1957.

ISSN 0031-7675

---

## Notice to Contributors

Manuscripts are solicited for this *Journal*. Articles submitted for consideration should be approximately 5,000 words, either typewritten double-spaced on 8.5" x 11" bond paper, or encoded using MS Word or Pagemaker. As to style, contributors should take note of the reference format used starting with the January 1990 issue. The Editorial Board reserves the right to make the necessary editorial modifications including changes in the title of articles.

A brief biographical sketch of contributor/s and an abstract of approximately 100 words should accompany the article/s.

Author(s) of published materials will receive six complimentary copies of the issue where the article appears.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT RECEIPT

This is to acknowledge receipt of one (1) copy of the *Philippine Journal of Public Administration*, Volume XLVIII No. 4 (October 2004).

Received by: \_\_\_\_\_  
(Signature over printed name.)

Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_



**PHILIPPINE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**Volume XLVIII**

**October 2004**

**Number 4**

---

	<i>Page</i>
Spatial Dimension of Public Administration . . . . . Romeo B. Ocampo	321
Transformative Citizenship: Exploring its Challenges to Philippine Public Administration . . . . . Fermin P. Manalo, Jr.	338
Regulating Vehicular Emissions in Three Asian Cities: Comparative Analysis of Regulatory Program Design . . . . . Francisco G. Delfin, Jr.	370
Human Resources Development Reforms in the Bureaucracy . . . . . Perla E. Legaspi	397
2004 Index . . . . .	443

## ERRATUM

The fifth paragraph of page 223 in the article “Improving the Delivery of Extension Services in the Philippines: Lessons Learned and Future Directions” which appeared in the July 2004 issue of the *Journal* should have read:

**Quezon Province.** A five-year plan shapes and guides the future direction of the development of the agriculture and fishery sector. The formulation of the Integrated and Sustainable Agriculture and Fishery Plan (ISAFP) enables the municipal government to set the direction of agricultural development of the municipality. It serves as a framework for tapping opportunities and potentials offered by the agricultural sector, promoting extensive people’s participation, and rationalizing the allocation of scarce resources in attaining the municipality’s vision of sustainable and ecologically balanced agri-based industry.

The editorial staff takes full responsibility for the error.

## Editor's Notes

This issue of the journal contains commentaries on a myriad of issues concerning the study of public administration, citizenship, regulatory program design, and reforms in the bureaucracy.

In his essay "Spatial Dimension of Public Administration," Romeo B. Ocampo backs up the renewed importance given to the spatial dimension of public administration (SDPA). Indicating recent developments, such as, globalization and information and communications technology, the author underlines the importance of SDPA in accounting for factors like distribution of people, problems and services that directly concern governance. To illustrate his point, the author also provides a historical account of the development on the study of space in the practice and study of public administration.

Fermin P. Manalo, Jr. proposes a theoretical and ideological approach to transformative citizenship and participation in his article "Transformative Citizenship: Exploring its Challenges to Philippine Public Administration." Manalo emphasizes that the absence of an ideological anchor and a definition of citizen participation could render it vulnerable to manipulation by certain persons or sectors in power. By providing a development theory, the author redefines and reconceptualizes transformative citizenship outside the confines of republicanism in an attempt to provide an outline on how transformative citizenship can affect Philippine public administration.

The increasing concern to care for the environment in the developing world is analyzed in the policy perspective in "Regulating Vehicular Emissions in Three Asian Cities: Comparative Analysis of Regulatory Program Design" by Francisco G. Delfin, Jr. The regulatory program design concerning vehicular emissions in the Asian cities of Taipei, Manila and New Delhi is examined and analyzed by Delfin using the Cohen and Kaimieniecki strategic planning framework. Despite significant differences in social and policy contexts, the author identifies similarities in the design and implementation of the regulatory programs.

Just like in other discourses, globalization has become the context within which the practice and study of public administration is being viewed. Reforms in the bureaucracy have been characterized by paradigm shifts underlying the need to respond to the needs of the times, which is what is happening in government agencies in the Philippines. Perla E.



Legaspi provides an incisive look at how human resource development reforms are implemented in the National Statistics Office and the Land Transportation Office in the Philippines in her article "HRD Reforms in the Bureaucracy." She examines the problems and constraints in the implementation of reforms to draw lessons from the experience.

## **Spatial Dimension of Public Administration**

ROMEO B. OCAMPO\*

*The Spatial Dimension of Public Administration (SDPA) has been given renewed importance in recent times. This is widely reinforced by the incorporation of Information Communications Technology (ICT) in governance, which transformed geographical patterns from a boundary and time based to time-space compressed administration. This has several implications: 1) globalization made borders porous; 2) nation-states shared sovereignty with international organizations and superpower countries and; 3) information, people, money and technology could travel a much faster pace. On the other hand, definite influences in Public Administration (PA) result in "horizontalization" and "deterritorialization." Of similar impact is the use of geographic information system (GIS) which provides empirical accuracy in PA practice and in policy research. Despite the said developments, information divide is still a big factor to consider in the utilization of SDPA. This article traces the development of SDPA in the history of PA theories and its implications in the major trends of globalization.*

This exploratory essay aims to: 1) draw attention to the Spatial Dimension of Public Administration (SDPA) and its importance, partly in view of the National College of Public Administration and Governance's (NCPAG's) new Spatial Information Management (SIM) program; 2) revisit and reappreciate earlier works and suggest new perspectives on the subject; 3) examine some claims about the impact of technologies on space and government; and 4) write out this outline and develop and test ideas about the relations between physical and institutional spaces in PA.

"SDPA" refers here primarily to the geographic places, areas, locations, distances, and other such spatial elements and features which government considers when determining its jurisdictions, organization, policies, and operations.

Government must consider SDPA if it is to take better (more discriminating) account of the spatial distribution of people, problems, and processes over space. One can also learn more if one views organization

---

\*Former Professor and Dean, National College of Public Administration and Governance, University of the Philippines Diliman.

and administration as involving spatial relationships of a non-physical or institutional kind.

Otherwise, such issues as those concerning the following would arise or persist: territorial boundaries (external and internal), area-based organization and specialization, distribution of powers, functions, and resources between central and field units, i.e., decentralization; horizontal and vertical coordination of functional and area-based entities.

### **The Place of Space in Public Administration**

SDPA used to occupy a prominent place in political and administrative theories in earlier time, but it subsequently declined. Territory is a basic element of the State, along with people and government. Territoriality, however, is variable over time (Diamond 1999). Fixed on the small city-state, the political theory of the ancient Greeks could not accommodate the empires and nation-states when they emerged (Wolin 1960).

Early on in the study of PA, Wilson (1887) called attention to the significant development of field organization (from satraps to field bureaus) and the need to reorient European-style administrative science from its "compact" geography to the more fragmented U.S. context.

Later, American authors (like Gulick 1937; Fesler 1949; and Maass 1959) developed theoretical frameworks on SDPA. Powers and functions of government (and other social institutions) can be divided both areally and centrally to serve certain basic values, such as, liberty, democracy, and welfare (Maass 1959).

The work of organizations may be divided or aggregated by place or area as well as by major purpose, process, and clientele and material. An organization may do everything from its center or may deconcentrate to varying degrees, depending on its size, prevailing circumstances, including natural conditions and the state of the relevant technologies, among other factors (Gulick 1937).

Complex issues of coordination, centralization and decentralization<sup>1</sup> are bound to arise between area and other principles of "departmentalization." Fesler, who reduced the main contenders to "area" and "function," suggested useful guidelines for dealing with problems of delineating "natural" and administrative areas, and for providing vertical and horizontal coordination of "governmental areas" and "field service

areas" in the U.S. Area and function may be adjusted through structural reforms, but these dimensions should be supplemented by intergovernmental and inter-area cooperation schemes.

Maass and his co-authors (1959) presented a broader framework. The powers and functions of government and other social institutions may be divided (and also shared) both "areally" and "centrally" in order to serve the basic values such as liberty, democracy, and welfare prevailing in a society like the U.S. While areal division of powers (ADP) represents geographic subdivisions (federal states, local governments), central division (CDP) represents non-geographic, institutional subdivisions, including separation of powers in a presidential form of government, but also separation of Church and State in a secular system.

The interest in SDPA declined. This was probably partly because of Simon's (1945) devastating criticism of Gulick's principles, which misled readers away from his organization theory (Hammond 1990). Simon unfairly accused Gulick and his colleagues of trying to maximize their principles simultaneously, when Gulick said that there was no one best principle and that they were interrelated in a changing and dynamic balance, contingent on changing circumstances.

Simon (1945) himself made certain easy assumptions (e.g., purpose necessarily implied clientele and area). Significantly, he has reoriented administrative theory from "doing" to "deciding," focused attention on the information/knowledge premises of decisions, and devoted more attention to communication without much thought to transportation (in his classic book *Administrative Behavior*, 1945). He, thus, viewed the de/centralization issue in information-communication terms.

Other leading lights might have contributed to SDPA's decline. Riggs (1964) once said that geography was one of many environmental factors that did not have to be considered in "ecological explanations" of PA. An environmental advocate noted that the Canadian Association of Geographers (CAG) shared this negative bias (Heaphey 1971).

Later authors have tried to revive interest in SDPA (Smith 1967, 1985 in the UK; Heaphey 1971; and, most recently, Hutchcroft 2001); but these have been few and far between, and despite their allusions to geography, they seem still mainly concerned with the institutional or organizational dimensions of PA. Hutchcroft, for example, has drawn a conceptual matrix combining political and administrative factors for measuring degrees of de/centralization. Although he considers national as well as local variables, his 4-celled matrix does not reflect the spatiality of the variables considered.

At least two important aspects of SDPA have been glossed over. One is the fact that the effective scope of government has depended on the state of technology and infrastructure, among other important factors. The other is that it has also depended on the dominant patterns of spatial development of a country's population, economy, society, and culture, which overlay the geographic and strictly "natural" initial conditions of development and government.

### **Renewed Interest: The Impact of Technology on SDPA**

Interest in SDPA has been renewed with the help of other disciplines; however, these disciplines have brought a paradoxical message: "Geography is important, yes, but it has become irrelevant due to new high-technologies of information, communication, and transportation especially Information Communication Technologies (ICTs)." This view has been debated.

Gulick (1937) anticipated that emerging ICTs, such as TV, could offer "entirely new possibilities in the field of organization." Simon later made direct contributions to disciplines underpinning ICTs, expressed fears of information overload, expected increased centralization at middle levels of organizations, and observed that home governments had increased headquarters control over their diplomats abroad as a result of ICT advances (Simon 1947, 1965 in Gross 1971).

Contemporary political scientists, economists, sociologists, and other scholars (especially those with urban orientations) are reviving interest in geography and its relation to development and government. While geopolitics is avoiding old-style geographic determinism, economists like Krugman (1998) have reaffirmed the influence of geography (e.g., being landlocked) on the economic fortunes of nations, although they wonder if it will remain as influential in the future.

That geography is not immutable, but subject to technological and other developments, has been suggested by other authors.

Social theorists have addressed the way technologies have helped government project ("distanciate") administrative power over space and people. Foucault noted a shift in the mid-18<sup>th</sup> century from "territory" to "population" as the primary object of "governmentality" (in Shore and Wright 1997), and a shift in "technologies" of power and punishment from visible surveillance to invisible discipline (e.g., from public executions to incarceration in prisons) (Giddens 1993).

Giddens (1993) criticizes Foucault for saying that state violence has been replaced by subtler forms of power, and Weber (1964) for saying that traditional communities were less liberating than large-scale, diversified bureaucratic ("steel-hard cages"). He also usefully traces the expensive influence of technological advances on state power, including writing, printing, and the separation of communication from transportation facilities in reducing the "friction of distance."

Some authors have warned against technological determinism. For example, it has been argued that in the long term the formation of the state preceded and made possible the so-called "hydraulic society" rather than vice-versa (Diamond 1999). Yet, technological advances are credited with enabling states to shift from indirect to direct rule strategies in their "distal" territories and colonies – and thereby to expand their effective scope. Otherwise, they might remain states without governing structures and nationalism would not be stimulated (Hechter 2000).

Current discussions of globalization and postmodernism have drawn attention to new spatial patterns in the development of capitalism with new technologies, "time-space compression" used for "distanciation" (spatial projection), appropriation, and domination of space in the service of "flexible accumulation" (Harvey 1987). Castells (2000) has famously detected a shift in these patterns from "spaces of place" to "spaces of flows" that have interconnected cities and countries, forming "networked societies" on a global scale.

"Distance is dead," some have the declared. One of the first to do so was M. Webber (1964), who noted poetically that the "urban place" was being sidelined by the "nonplace urban realm." Physical propinquity no longer spelled social community, so the neighborhood was no longer as important as metropolitan and larger-scale planning units. The physical approach and maps were passe in the new urban planning then proposed.

Farther-reaching globalization effects have been seen. Borders have become porous, nation-states have lost (or shared) their sovereignty with international bodies, Multinational Corporations (MNCs), and superpowers, while (some) localities and regions have assumed new prominence.

With new technologies, people, goods, information, and money can travel much faster and farther, production and other investments can be located and relocated more easily to lower-cost (especially labor) countries, and command and control can be effected from greater distances.

One dramatic manifestation is the separation of back-office and other routine operations from headquarters to hinterlands and even distant countries. The Philippines is a global site for some of these multinational corporations; its participation is measured partly in terms of number of computer keystrokes.

Globalization, postmodernism, and technobabble have had some definite influences on current PA theory. Some see "horizontalization" and "deterritorialization" as major trends in PA practice (Frissen 1998), making it conceivable to speak of "steering from a distance" (Kickert 1995).

- Hierarchical organizations are breaking down in favor of horizontal units now better equipped and network-connected with ICT facilities.
- With ICTs enabling greater freedom from existing structures, time and space no longer pose significant constraints; thus, borders no longer count as much as before.
- Peripatetic leaders can now roam and still maintain command and control through portable virtual headquarters.

Nothing less than paradigm shifts have been detected in postmodern globalization.

- From Taylorist/post-Fordist mass-production and mass-consumption to "flexible specialization" strategies more precisely targeting smaller-scale market segments and niches, whose quickly changing tastes can be as quickly matched. May result in smaller but more profitable market share. (Esser and Hirsch 1989)
- From bureaucratic organization to network co-operation at different scales and levels of participants with common or complementary interests in certain areas and/or sectors, e.g., nodal "policy communities" and looser "issue networks" that may facilitate "policy transfers" domestically and globally.
- From "structuralism" to "structuration theory," which suggests that persistent actions enact structures, and that bureaucracy may be viewed as a pattern of "energy" flows (Bogason 2000).

These ideas have been persuasive partly because they find similarities and resonances in popular concepts in other influential disciplines (e.g., "stocks and flows" in economics, and "particle vs. waves" and "ghostly action at a distance" in physics), but they also show impressive credentials in practice.

Some of the more extravagant claims, however, have been challenged and may well be debated as follows:

- Much of the horizontalization tendency "has been a spontaneous and organic development which has yet to be confirmed by changes in legal and constitutional frameworks. . . ." Hierarchies are unlikely to disappear soon, having been the main mode of governance, itself "as old as government" (Pierre and Peters 2000).
- Nation-states have remained crucial players despite the apparent squeeze from above and below. They remain so even in the European Union. They have resisted MacDonalidization and other forms of isomorphic convergence (e.g., New Public Management [NPM] style reforms even in some Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development [OECD] member countries). They can regulate the Internet to some extent (Rodan 1998).
- Globalization, technology, and economic development have been uneven and have had uneven results, favoring some countries, regions, and localities (not to mention groups) at the expense of others; hence, "localization" has accompanied present-day globalization.
- The wider effects of technology have been more complex than unilinear and polar, neither solely in the positive direction as utopian visionaries see them, nor solely in the negative one of dystopians.

### **Uneven Patterns of Development**

Development disparities have not received as much attention as they deserve in discussions of SDPA issues; for example, decentralization has been discussed mostly in terms of its institutional dimensions and hardly in terms of the decentralization of development itself.



One needs to premise the views regarding the de/centralization of government partly on the prevailing spatial patterns of demographic, economic, social, and cultural development as well as the initial conditions presented by geography and natural resources.

The earlier administrative theorists were well aware of these dimensions when they addressed the area-delineation issues raised by organizing by place; however, Gulick (1937) and Fesler (1949) had rather very broad concepts of "natural areas" as embracing development areas as well as such natural forms as watersheds and river basins.

Development has assumed diverse spatial patterns, as reflected by the concepts developed to describe and analyze them. These reflect various forms of concentration and diffusion of development. For example, the planning literature is replete with discussions of:

- Firm and industrial location, "Marshallian" economic districts, urban agglomerations, and growth poles and growth centers.
- "Primate cities" in the urbanization especially of developing countries. Because they dominate their national hinterlands, primate cities have raised fears of giantism.
- Megalopolitan growth in industrialized countries, and mega-urban (desa-kota) regions in developing ones.
- Industrial dispersion and urban sprawl problems, involving locational mismatches between jobs and residents, and "leaf frogging" suburban developments that raise the costs of transport, other utilities, and public facilities.
- World cities, like New York City and Tokyo, and "global cities" that include several in global network complexes.

These patterns have raised equally diverse questions about appropriate locations, distances, sizes, shapes, and interrelationships of different places of work, residence, and leisure and the movements of people, goods, and information.

The pragmatic guidelines supplied by the theories of Gulick (1937) and Fesler (1949), may remain useful in dealing with these questions in area-based organization provided that:

- When all the relevant layers of natural and development areas have been considered for a more inclusive jurisdiction, in the end the boundaries chosen will be artificial and arbitrary but convenient from political, administrative, and/or statistics standpoint.
- If dealing with river basin problems, e.g., a special autonomous agency rather than a unit of a local or regional government is set up. In any case, intergovernmental and interagency cooperation should be provided.

Tougher issues, however, remain; one of these has been whether there is an optimum area size for any jurisdiction. Gulick (1937) alluded to the need to find such for area-based organizations, but students of cities have found such an optimum elusive, if not impossible to find (Alonso 1970). It is still hard to say what population or area size is optimal for an LGU or agency, though it may be possible to tell if a problem or function seems under-bounded or over-bounded by formal jurisdictions.

The older value conflict between efficiency through larger scales and democracy through smaller jurisdictions has, therefore, persisted. There have been obvious causes for concern when development disparities are discussed. These have been characterized by:

- Growing pockets of joblessness, poverty, and homelessness even in "world cities," segregated from gated communities of affluence in the "edge cities" and "New Urbanism" communities in the U.S., and
- Communal strife in the materially poorer and culturally heterogenous countries and regions of the world.

### **Technology and Space: ICTs vs. Transportation**

Technologies have helped reshape development and governance spaces. They have been partly responsible for both the solutions and the problems. Transport technologies and infrastructure have done much to extend the urban, regional, national, and international channels of movement, networks and nodes of human settlements, and overall patterns in the environment. New ICTs bid fare to do the same and to overtake transport technologies in the process.

Technologies' effects have also been uneven and diverse. Despite claims of democratic diffusion and universal access, resulting in e-government and e-democracy, the information highways have been marred by a widely perceived "digital divide" that is hard to bridge.

New technologies have always raised high hopes of bringing beneficial changes for everybody; but they have also often had unintended (and undesirable) effects, or at least inconsistent ones.

There have been technological breakthroughs before that have drastically reduced travel and communication distances and times. The latest ones owe much to electronic digitalization of data and devices, expansion and integration of computing and communication capabilities, and multi-media convergence. Such processes have resulted in:

- Increased inter-operability of computers and other office equipment.
- Formation of e-networks, which have changed ways of exploiting information:
  - (1) Inter-unit and extra-unit data linkages and connectivity
  - (2) Integration and commonalization of data sets from various sources
  - (3) Increased organizational memory, intelligence, and knowledge
  - (4) Interactive communication and data flows
  - (5) Network organization and operation through local area networks (LAN), wide area networks (WAN), and the Internet/world wide web (www).

A related technical change is "informatization" which has not only meant increased automation of production and other activities but also the incorporation of "informating," or the ability to generate and "harvest" data from operations for purposes of control, coordination, and decisionmaking (e.g., extraction of spending habits data from "loyalty cards," matching social security cards data with other agencies' records to detect fraud) (Bellamy 1999).

Advances in integrated ICTs (resulting in "telematics") have enabled the communication of various forms of information (data, voice, video) to serve as a substitute for the transportation of people, goods, and information in its older forms. This has permitted and encouraged "telecommuting" and other "distant forms of work," transactions, and collaboration. Example cases are:

- A growing number of people who used to commute to workplaces every day can now work at home, consult central files or experts from the field, and work together and with headquarters as employees or customers while staying at the street level. They can be assisted by mobile devices and public service kiosks.
- MNCs and other global organizations can relocate production plants, back-office operations, and representative field units to distant countries and still keep effective command, control, and coordination of field decisions and activities. Video-conferencing, for one, can help in central-field transactions.

The substitution effects of ICTs on transportation have probably played an important part in the decentralization, privatization, downsizing, and outsourcing strategies of government agencies as well as of business firms.

The substitution argument, however, has been strongly challenged by some critics, along with the technological determinism that they detect in both utopian and dystopian visionaries. While the substitution function has not been denied, it has been argued that ICTs have also had complementary and other impacts on travel and transportation. According to extensive studies of telecommunications and urban development (Graham and Marvin 1996), telecom facilities:

- focus infrastructure investments and operations in cities, like transport and other utility networks;
- do result in relative or absolute substitution for physical flows;
- stimulate physical movement and development, just as urban concentration of telecom facilities stimulates their use; and
- enhance the attractiveness, efficiency, and capacity of transport and other physical networks (road, rail, water and energy), and, thus, induce more trips.

New transportation technologies, of course, have by themselves contributed to more intensive and extensive use of space through travel; but the incorporation of ICTs into transport systems has pushed their efficiencies and attractiveness further. The same goes for logistical systems, which have viewed transportation as an integral part of supply chains. When all is said and done, people and goods still need to travel bodily. Some goods (e.g., journal articles) can be tele-sent in digitized form or locally sourced, but people still cannot (yet) be "beamed up" ala the transporter in *Star Trek*.

Adverse impacts of new technologies have also been noted. They have had both centripetal and centrifugal effects on urban development, and their social impacts may be double-sided. ICT investments and operations reinforce urban concentration. At the same time, telework may lengthen distances between homes and workplaces and encourage non-work trips instead of work-related travel. Some worry that telework may result in new forms of segregation that results in boredom at home and in new handicaps for the handicapped.

### **GIS in Passing Review: Sharing the Dilemma**

Similar observations may be made on geographic information systems (GIS). GIS is one development that has reasserted the importance of "where" in a world where some claim "There is no (longer) there there" (Stein 1946). It reminds and shows people how and why, taking geography more seriously, together with the complex things that happen on it, could lead to more precise, accurate, discriminating and, hence, more efficacious government, administration, and even politics.

A simple example: GIS can show a farmer just where in his farmland, he needs to apply fertilizer (or undertake other farm activities), depending on the soil and other conditions that have been detected and measured with greater precision with the use of GIS and other devices and methods. So, he need not broadcast his fertilizers indiscriminately over his whole farm, as he might have done before without that kind of information. This saves him a lot of money, time and effort (Longley et al. 2001).

Similarly in PA practice and policy research, where there is a premium or empirical accuracy instead of theoretical elegance, you have to know just where the remaining garbage piles are in order to collect them efficiently. The science as well as the technology of GIS reminds us of a familiar ground truth: "The First Law of Geography states that everything is related to everything else, but near things are more related than distant things" (Longley et al. 2001). This law accords more with Einstein's belief that nothing can exceed the speed of light and, therefore, there can be no such thing as "ghostly action at a distance." Experiments, though, have proved him wrong (Davies 1984).

GIS, however, has also shown a second bind. Like other ICT-based technologies, it has promised to transcend space even while accentuating its importance, not only through the layering of data sets of various kinds and origins, but also through their integration and sharing with increased connectivity among different organizations, units and participants.

Unfortunately, GIS can be mired in a sticky process. Connectivity does not guarantee free data flows, and data sharing does not happen easily due to cost constraints and proprietary tensions between data producers and users. To start with, capital investment and implementation seem exorbitantly expensive and time-consuming, partly because GIS software and hardware vendors dominate the market; but so are the costs involved in data "capture" and processing.

Consequently, what has been said of computerization may be more cogently said of GIS: the promised democratic diffusion can hardly happen here.

Not surprisingly, experience with GIS installation has raised doubts about the reality of deterritorialization and steering from a distance in the same country where these were proclaimed. GIS has been found to have "reterritorializing effects" with the reassertion of turf by the participating institutions (Snellen 2000; Lips et al. 2000). Other PA theorists have likewise found "informatization to have had a reinforcing rather than diffusing effect on power structure" (Hood 2000).

### Conclusion

It is suggested that SDPA is important and needs to be given renewed attention, along with the contributions of earlier PA thinkers like Gulick. After some decades of neglect, SDPA has been getting some good notices once more, due to other disciplines as well as some PA theorists. Like other dimensions, the spatial dimensions are a dynamic, mutable set of factors that are contingent on technological and other changes.

Some basic issues, especially those of de/centralization, are still present and are likely to remain. In discussing them, one should pay more heed to two aspects that seem to have been glossed over between the "natural" and institutional layers of governance: (1) the patterns and features of demographic, economic, and sociocultural development and (2) the technological changes that are helping influence the size, scope, and patterns of development and governance areas.

Technological advances have enabled or facilitated the existence, growth and expansion of states and governments. New advances, especially in ICTs, have been radically changing the landscape and inner spaces of governments and other organizations.

Some scholars, however, have proclaimed "the death of distance" as a result, making institutions seem freely transcendent. It has been argued

that such claims, though popular in discussions of globalization and technology, are extravagant. The effects of both on development and government have been uneven, reinforcing certain patterns of power, and, in any case, have been more complex than some authors or seers may lead one to believe.

In any case, at any given instance, one should, in dealing with SDPA issues, like area delineation, consider geography to start with, but also the development patterns that overlay it and the technological and other (e.g., sociocultural and political) factors that shape and reshape them. With new technologies, the scope for de/centralization may be greater than meets the eye, but whether it can take a more radical turn (e.g., federal form) is a question that must be analyzed carefully from a number of other standpoints.

In the distant future, one may have to leave the earth for another, hopefully, habitable planet, because Mother Earth will burn away in the sun's inevitable demise. Technology will probably make this necessity feasible; being also often the mother rather than the offspring (Diamond 1999), invention may make that necessity necessary sooner than later. Space travelers will have to cope with the absence or lack of gravity on board, and may have to morph to suit new living conditions in transit and at the distant destination.

Meanwhile, the rest of mankind will probably remain tethered to terra firma no matter how flexible its harnesses may become. One will still have to grapple with issues of geography, territory, development, de/centralization, and so on. To this end, it is proposed that institutional as well as geographic spaces (such as suggested by Maass' central division of powers and aerial division of powers) be further explored and see how they might be better reflected in common conceptual and theoretical frameworks.

### Endnote

<sup>1</sup> For brevity, we combine these terms as "de/centralization."

### References

- Alonso, William  
1970 *The Economics of Consumption, Daily Life and Urban Form*. Institute of Urban and Regional Development: University of California.

- Bellamy, Christine  
1999 Exploiting Information and Communication Technologies. In S. Horton and D. Farnham, eds. *Public Management in Britain*. London: St. Martin's Press.
- Bogason, Peter  
2000 *Public Policy and Local Governance: Institutions in Postmodern Society*. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar.
- Castells, Manuel  
2000 Toward a Sociology of the Networked Society. *Contemporary Sociology*, 29(5): 693-699.
- Davis, Paul  
1986 *Superforce: The Search for a Grand Unified Theory of Nature*. London: Unwin Paperbacks.
- Diamond, Jared  
1999 *Guns, Germs, and Steel: The Fates of Human Societies*. New York: W.W. Norton & Co.
- Esser, Josef and Joachim Hirsch  
1994 The Crisis of Fordism and the Dimensions of 'Post-Fordist' Regional and Urban Structure. In Ash Amin, ed. *Post-Fordism*. USA: Blackwell Publishing.
- Fesler, James W.  
1949 *Area and Administration*. University, Alabama: University of Alabama Press. (See Hutchcroft, below, for later works by Fesler.)
- Frissen, Paul H.A.  
1998 Public Administration in Cyberspace: A Postmodern Perspective. In I.Th. Snellen and W.B.H.J. van de Donk, eds. *Public Administration in an Information Age: A Handbook*, Amsterdam: IOS Press, Ch. 3: 33-46.
- Giddens, Anthony  
1993 Domination and Power. In Philip Cassell, ed. *The Giddens Reader*. London: The MacMillan Press, Ltd., Ch. IV: 212-283.
- Graham, Stephen and Simon Marvin  
1996 *Telecommunications and the City: Electronic Spaces, Urban Places*. London: Routledge.
- Gross, Bertram M.  
1971 Space-time and Postindustrial Society. In James Heaphey, ed. *Spatial Dimensions of Development Administration*. Durham North Carolina : Duke University Press, Ch. 6: 216-259.
- Gulick, Luther  
1937 Notes on the Theory of Organization. In L. Gulick and L. Urwick, eds. *Papers on the Science of Administration*. New York: Institute of Public Administration.



- Hammond, Thomas H.  
1990 In Defence of Luther Gulick's 'Notes on the Theory of Organization.' *Public Administration*. 68: 143-173.
- Harvey, David  
1987 *Flexible Accumulate Through Urbanization: Reflections on 'Post-modernism' in the American City*. *Antipode* 19/3: 260-286.
- Heaphey, James J.  
1971 *Spatial Dimensions of Development Administration*. Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press.
- Hechter, Michael  
2000 *Containing Nationalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hoggett, Paul  
1996 New Modes of Control in the Public Service. *Public Administration*, 74: 9-32. Reprinted in Michael Hill, ed. *The Policy Process: A Reader*. London: Prentice Hall/Harvester Wheatsheaf. 1997. 418-441.
- Hood, Christopher  
1995 Emerging Issues in Public Administration. *Public Administration*, 73: 165-183. Where the State of the Art Meets the Art of the State: Traditional Public-Bureaucracy Controls in the Information Age. *International Review of Public Administration*, 5/1 (2000): 1-12.
- Hutchcroft, Paul D.  
2001 Centralization and Decentralization in Administration and Politics: Assessing Territorial Dimensions of Authority and Power. *Governance: An International Journal of Policy and Administration*, 14/1: 23-53.
- Iacono, Suzann and Rob Kling  
2001 Computerization Movements: The Rise of the Internet and Distant Forms of Work. In JoAnne Yates and John Van Maanen, eds. *Information Technology and Organizational Transformation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE. Ch. 4: 93-135.
- Jafee, David  
2001 *Organization Theory: Tension and Change*. Boston: McGraw-Hill Higher Education.
- Kickert, Walter  
1995 Steering from a Distance: A New Paradigm of Public Governance. *Dutch Higher Education, Governance*, 8/1: 135-157.
- Krugman, Paul  
1999 The Role of Geography in Development. In Boris Pleskovic and Joseph E. Stiglitz, eds. *Annual Bank Conference on Development Economics* 1998. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank, 89-117.
- Lepawsky, Albert  
1949 *Administration: The Art and Science of Organization and Management*. New York: Alfred Knopf.

- Lips, Miriam; Marcel Boogers, and Rodney Weterings  
2000 Reinventing Territory in Dutch Local Government: Experiences with the Development and Implementation of GIS in the Amsterdam Region. *Information Infrastructure and Policy*, 6: 171-183.
- Longley, Paul A., Michael F. Goodchild, David J. Maguire, and David W. Rhind  
2001 *Geographic Information Systems and Science*. Chichester, England: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- Maass, Arthur (ed.)  
1959 *Area and Power: A Theory of Local Government*. The Free Press.
- Pierre, Jon and B. Guy Peters  
2000 *Governance, Politics and the State*. New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc.
- Rodan, Garry  
1998 The Internet and Political Control in Singapore. *Political Science Quarterly*, 113/1: 63-89.
- Shore, Cris and Susan Wright  
1997 Policy: A New Field of Anthropology. In C. Shore and S. Wright, eds. *Anthropology of Policy*. London: Routledge.
- Simon, Herbert A.  
1945 *Administrative Behavior: A Study of Decisionmaking Processes in Administrative Organizations*. The Free Press.
- Smith, Brian C.  
1985 *Decentralization: The Territorial Dimension of the State*. London: George Allen & Unwin.  
1967 *Field Administration: An Aspect of Decentralisation*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Snellen, Ignace Th.M.  
2000 Territorializing Governance and the State: Policy Dimensions of Geographic Information Systems. *Information Infrastructure and Policy*, 6: 131-138.
- Turban, Efraim, R. Kelly Rainer, Jr., and Richard E. Potter  
2001 *Introduction to Information Technology*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Webber, Melvin M.  
1964 The Urban Place and the Nonplace Urban Realm. In W.M. Webber, John W. Dyckman et al., eds. *Explorations into Urban Structure*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Wilson, Woodrow  
1997 The Study of Public Administration. In Jay M. Shafritz and Albert C. Hyde, eds. *Classics of Public Administration*, eds. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace College Publishers, . Ch. 1: 14-26. Originally published in *Political Science Quarterly*, 2 (June 1887).
- Wolin, Sheldon  
1960 *Politics and Vision: Continuity and Innovation in Western Political Thought*. Boston: Little, Brown & Co.

# **Transformative Citizenship: Exploring its Challenges to Philippine Public Administration**

FERMIN P. MANALO\*

*The lack of a clear social change theory from which participation is based could render it vulnerable to manipulation by the power holders for their own interest. It can mean differently to different people especially those who have the capacity to influence the institutions that conceptualize and employ it. More importantly, any attempt to make participatory governance/development part of Public Administration (PA) discipline without enough theoretical grounding can make it a constant bone of contention, the outcome of which will be decided by whoever has the greater resources to influence research and publication. This article, then, aims to establish a development theory to provide context to the discourse of transformative citizenship and participation. It is an attempt to provide an ideological anchor to participation by conceptualizing transformative citizenship out of civic republicanism, thus, redefining some basic assumptions on citizenship such as rights, group rights, agency, identity and location among others. Further, it discusses the role of transformative citizenship in transforming Philippine Public Administration both as a discipline and as a practice. It also seeks to redefine the significant role of Philippine Public Administration in pushing for democratic governance.*

## **Introduction**

Citizen or people's participation is widely being credited as a critical factor in pushing for more democratization and in facilitating social transformation (Cohen and Arato 1992; Nelson and Wright 1997; Hassal 1999; Davidson and Weekley 1999). In more specific governance concerns, it is considered as key to successful decentralization and ensuring responsiveness and efficiency of governance.

At the moment, there are at least four fields of policy and practice within which participation forms a key element—governance/decentralization; social capital/civil society; NGOs and participatory development projects; and social movements (Hickey and Mohan 2003).

---

\*Assistant Professor, College of Social Work and Community Development, University of the Philippines Diliman, Quezon City.

Yet the experiences in recent years also show how participation has meant differently according to who is defining and employing it. Its usage still ranges from pure tokenism to approximating citizen control if Arnstein's categorization<sup>1</sup> is followed. (Goldshack 1972: 31)

The notion of participation as a purely management tool for ensuring efficiency of governance, management of pre-developed projects and services delivery (by private and government development agencies) or participation as a *means* still persists. Yet at the same time participation *as an end*, or as a process of developing self-determining capacity of the marginalized and excluded and bringing them to the center is also making its weight felt in the discourses on politics and development.

Interestingly, participation has become the object of enthusiastic promotion by some global institutions which, decades ago, were openly supporting undemocratic regimes in pursuit of their agenda.

Participation has also been observed as becoming a rhetorical device which political leaders use to strengthen their hold to power. In many cases, talks about participation and decentralization are betrayed by the unwillingness on the part of the center to relinquish power. Similarly, moves toward participation and decentralization are being undermined by failure to address the inability of the broader and weaker or marginalized sections of the community to participate effectively in the structure of governance. These developments only further enable national and local elite and government functionaries to dominate (Osmani 2001).

Then there is also a naiveté among well-meaning groups in promoting participation without carefully reflecting on its implications for power issues and how power relations mediate much of public and private decisionmaking.

Perhaps one of the reasons why participation can easily be subjected to anyone's interpretation and purpose is what Hickey and Mohan (2003) regard as lack of clear descriptive and normative social change theory upon which participation can be based or anchored on. Any advocacy or assertion of participation that lacks adequate theoretical grounding, especially on democratic theory, could be used to serve any powerful group's interest. This could make participatory governance/development a constant subject of ideological contestation, the outcome of which will be determined not by integrity of praxis but by the amount of resources for influencing research, program development and public opinion, and decisionmaking that a particular interest group commands.

Participation can not be divorced from the issue of power, as it can be both an object of power and an instrument for challenging hold to power.

From this perspective, Stiefel (1987) categorizes the way participation is used as either *ameliorative* (participation without challenging the system and existing power structure) or *transformative* (participation aiming to change the system and power structure).

The apparent lack of clear democratic and social change mooring described above, also plagues the conceptualization and usage of participation in Philippine politics and Philippine public administration. Needless to say, it is preventing the Philippine government from taking a more transformative approach to structural problems and their day to day consequences. It is keeping crucial decisionmaking processes a turf for the experts, who by the nature of their appointments are not directly accountable to the public but to their appointing authorities. It is preventing knowledge and wisdom accumulated from day to day engagement with social problems and issues and the perspectives of those affected most from justly informing public decisions. It is continuously allowing the present power relations (which are very imbalanced) to mediate public decisionmaking, and thus hinder government from taking decisive steps to reduce poverty, injustice, inequality, as well as graft and corruption. It is widening the alienation between the government and its people. In short, it is undermining the prospect for good governance.

In attempting to contribute in establishing the theoretical mooring of participation, this article will seek to derive a notion of participation from conceptualizing transformative citizenship. The implications and challenges to Public Administration will then be explored.

### **Locating Citizenship from Its Roots and Riding with its Present Journey**

#### *The Intellectual and Political Milieu of Contemporary Discourse on Citizenship*

The present discourse on citizenship has increasingly been framed to participation, rights and accountability. This has made citizenship an emerging area of debate in development studies (Jones and Gaventa 2002) and by extension in political and governance studies. Jones and Gaventa attribute this development to several shifts and trends that occurred during the 90's:

- Shift in the focus of participatory development, from the domain of "community projects" where it has been traditionally located towards political participation and as means for increasing the poor and marginalized citizens' influence over the decisionmaking processes affecting their lives;

- Rise of "good governance agenda" and its concerns with increasing responsiveness of government to the needs and priorities of the citizens; and
- The growing relationship between human rights and development as domain of study and which crystallized into rights-based approach to development.

The emergence of rights-based approach to development made the accessing and the satisfying of needs a political concern (Ferguson 1999 cited in Jones and Gaventa 2002). The implications of this development to citizenship right and practice are far reaching. One of them is on the question of widening spaces for citizenship and participation as they relate to development, both as a field of study and area of practice.

Hauserman (1998) and Ferguson (1999) (cited in Jones and Gaventa 2002) analyzed this trend in human rights and development thinking as having prompted a "re-framing" of participation as a *fundamental human and citizenship right* and a prerequisite for claiming other rights.

- Globalization and its impacts on local and national situations and the related phenomena such as international migration, fragmentation or diminishing of the boundaries and power of nation-states, etc. One of its major impacts is the redefinition of the arena of citizenship from the nation state to a more transnational location.

The upsurge of social movements around issues that are caused by or attributed to globalization such as liberalization and whose impacts transcend national boundaries has given rise to what may be categorically considered *global citizenship* (Lamonier 2001; Friedman 2002; Clark 2002; Sklair 2002; George and Wilding 2002; all cited in Manalo 2004).

There are four more trends which contributed to the depth of the discourse on citizenship and participation:

- The emergence of an intellectual-political movement loosely referred to as "New Social Movement" which de-privileges class (in the Marxist sense) as the main locus of theoretical analysis and political action and gives equal importance to other areas of power relations such as identity-gender, ethnicity and ecology (Prior et. al 1997; Isin and Wood 1999; Sklair 2002; Co 1997). It has heightened the need to redefine participation as a function of citizenship from being purely pertaining to people's relation with the state to one that also covers the social relations sphere. Lister (1997) looks at

the latter sphere as where exclusion and contestations of right and unequal power relations take place. In this sphere, therefore, citizenship needs to be clarified, developed and fully exercised;

- The interaction between feminist and citizenship theories, one of the outcomes of which is the move towards deconstructing citizenship of its exclusion of women caused by ideological construction of public-private divide and reconstructing citizenship from a feminist perspective (Lister 1997);
- Perceived failure of liberal democracy, welfare system and market-based notion of governance (in Western democracies) to ensure accountability, efficiency and strong citizens' participation in public administration and governance (Prior et al. 1995).<sup>2</sup> All three political systems, Prior noted, weakened or stifled citizens' participation and capacity to intervene in the development and delivery of government services. This lack of strong participation resulted in the crafting of policies and services being dominated by experts who do not have clear accountability to the public. This puts to question the appropriateness and responsiveness of those policies and services; and
- The way citizenship is being deconstructed in the South. From an institution imposed as a tool for exclusion, control and containment during the colonial period and consolidating elite politics, "ideological construction" and "re-ordering of life" under a nation-state during the de-colonization and post-colonial period (Abeer 2002; Hassal 1999), citizenship is now being strengthened as a space for generating active participation and working for democratization<sup>3</sup> of all spheres of society. It is being invoked to exact accountability from those in power and counterveil their abuses. Citizen right is providing justification to intervene in the whole political setup of society and wrestle power with the state and elite who control the state (Cohen and Arato 1992). It is serving as a platform for asserting sovereignty, claiming, protecting and promoting existing rights and privileges from the state (Hassal 1997), and radically extending human rights into areas where they are not prevailing or respected (Weekley 1999).

Citizenship is, thus, becoming both a *description* of democratic tenets and a *normative* effort for democratization (Cohen and Arato 1992; Weekley 1999)

The above developments demonstrate how the praxis of citizenship is moving towards expanding space for participation and establishing the normative basis for facilitating shift in power relations. They make citizenship

an even more contested concept. Lastly, they point to how citizenship is being redefined according to the specific context of the societies where they are being promoted or invoked.

### Theoretical Traditions of Citizenship

Given the extent with which citizenship is being continuously redefined and becoming a contested concept (Lister 1997: 3), it will be helpful to review its theoretical roots. The review provides the baseline for assessing how far citizenship as a social praxis has progressed, for responding to the issues being raised about it and for assessing the constraints and potentials for further expanding the meaning.

There are three major intellectual traditions or schools of thought from which the praxis of citizenship was derived: liberalism, communitarianism, and civic republicanism (Oldfield 1990; Lister 1997; Van Gunsteren 1998; Voet 1998; Isin and Wood 1999; Jones and Gaventa 2002; Abeer 2002).

#### *Liberalism*

Liberalism denotes the set of beliefs that considers the individual as preceding polity and citizenship as specific rights protecting the individual. The bearer of rights is the individual and the granter is the nation-state (Isin and Wood 1999). Liberalism, thus, casts citizenship as a *status* involving primarily rights accorded to individuals.

Central to the liberal view is the notion that an individual citizen acts rationally to advance his or her own interests (self-regarding individual), and the role of the State is to protect the exercise of such rights. The granting of such right ensures equality as it makes a person's economic, political, and other social qualifications irrelevant in the entitlement (Jones and Gaventa 2002).

Liberal citizenship implies a commitment that emanates from a contract between the State and the individual citizen. The citizen is bound to pay allegiance to the State through republican principles and adhere to the constitution while the State is bound to assure the citizen of civil and political rights (Stivers 1990).

Participation under the liberal arrangement is a right and the citizen decides whether or not to exercise said rights. Traditionally, the main and most significant form of citizenship participation is electing representatives.



The rise of liberal notion of citizenship took place in the context of the major material and ideological upheaval characterizing the transformation of Europe, particularly England, from feudalism to capitalism. Among its major features was the shift in social relations from one being based on ascribed status to one being governed by *contract relations*. This feature came with the emergence of class system based on the institution of private property and the market's taking significant role in development (Barbalet 1988; Abeer 2002).

In this milieu, liberalism provided the foundation for other rights pertaining to protection of citizens from coercion or curtailment of freedom by the State. It provided the basis for espousing social equality according to a contract between the State and citizens and not by any traditional ascription.

The first comprehensive analysis of the development of modern notion of citizenship and citizen rights that came with this transformation is attributed to T.H. Marshall, a noted British sociologist, in his now classic *Citizenship and Social Class* (Barbalet 1988).<sup>4</sup>

### *Communitarianism*

Communitarianism denotes a set of views that criticize the liberal conception of self-regarding or sovereign individual as debilitating and demeaning for the common good (Inis and Wood 1999: 8). While it also looks at the individual as bearer of rights, it differs with the liberalism in its notion of socially embedded citizen and community belonging (Isin and Wood 1999) and where citizenship and identity can only be realized through "deliberation over the common good." It holds that an individual's sense of identity is created or defined only in relation to the historically developed community where he/she belongs (van Gunsteren 1998; Jones and Gaventa 2002). It prioritizes common good over the pursuit of individual interests, thus the focus of communitarian citizenship is serving particular civic virtues, such as, respect for others and recognition of the importance of public service.

The communitarian tradition opens space for giving legal meaning to group rights, something not conceived of in the liberal view. With communitarianism's assertion that the group is the defining center of identity (Jones and Gaventa 2002) a collective right of participation was made conceptually feasible.

Among its modern proponents are Michael Sandel, *Liberalism and the Limits of Justice* (1982), Alasdair MacIntyre, *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory* (1985), and Charles Taylor, *Sources of the Self: The Making of Modern Identity* (1989) ( all cited in Voet 1998: 10).

*Civic Republicanism*

Civic republicanism seeks to integrate the liberal notion of self-interested individual within the communitarian framework of egalitarianism and community belonging (Isin and Wood 1999). It upholds the value of participation in decisionmaking, public life and political deliberation, and realizing ourselves as political being.

At the same time, civic republicanism represents a reaction to individual liberal citizenship which "reduced citizens into...more atomized passive bearers of right and whose freedom consists in being able to pursue individual interest." It proposes on the other hand, to reclaim the active, collective politics, as articulated by Hannah Arendt (Lister 1997: 24).

Civic republicanism also rejects the kind of citizenship under liberalism that relies mainly on the contract with the state for legitimation and proposes various locations of citizenship in the social relations and how citizenship can be further expanded beyond what the state allows.

It also challenges the assumption of universalized rights under liberalism on the ground that social structures in many societies create unequal capacities for attaining and exercising citizenship rights.

As with communitarianism, civic republicanism defines citizenship in terms of social membership within a particular political community or collectivities (Turner 1993 in Hickey and Mohan 2003).<sup>6</sup> It casts citizenship, however, as a practice involving responsibilities to the wider society and sees citizens as having meaningful existence only in the context of social networks bound together by the ties of membership, loyalty, and mutual obligations. This is because civic virtue, which is at the heart of civic republicanism, places loyalty and duty to the polity or to the community. It requires citizen to participate in the process of public decisionmaking and public service. (Prior et.al. 1995). Citizenship, therefore, does not only denote status or belongingness, but an imperative to practice.

From notion of civic virtue, the concept of citizenship evolved into being "founded on the collective and participatory engagement of citizens in the determination of the affairs of the community, where the citizen plays an active role in shaping the future of his or her society through political debate and decisionmaking" (Hickey and Mohan 2003: 29). It is in this light that civic republicanism is being invoked to promote deliberative forms of democracy as an alternative to representative political system of the liberal tradition (Jones and Gaventa 2002; Kelley 2004).

Citizenship is even being expanded into a broader, more inclusive category, constituting not only of a set of legal obligations and entitlements,

but also the basis with which individuals and collectivities can formulate and claim new rights or maintain existing ones or even struggle to expand these rights to include previously marginalized groups (Hickey and Mohan 2003: 29). That makes it both as *status* which people possess and *practice* which people engage in (Prior et al. 1995; Lister 1997).

The expansive notion of rights under civic republicanism could only be possible if citizenship entitlements and participation are conceived of as not depending on the State for legitimation. This conceptualization frees citizenship from being confined to or tied up exclusively with state-defined location and limits like it does to liberal rights. Instead, citizenship could be anchored to one or more communities and these communities could be multiple and overlapping; thus, it is possible to have different levels and types of political community in which "different types of citizenship rights and obligations are competed for and realized" (Hickey and Mohan: 31). Then, it is permissible to treat with equal importance as the state and civic localities the household<sup>6</sup>, neighborhood, village, city, nation, beyond national level as location of citizenship and, therefore, as arenas for asserting and contesting rights. This gives room to identity-based citizenship.<sup>7</sup>

The civic republican conception of citizenship is also being seen as a potential space for resolving the public-private dichotomy in traditional conception of citizenship. Feminists argue that this dichotomy, which has privileged the public as male domain over the private as female domain, has historically excluded the women, minorities, etc. (Lister 1997; Abeer 2002; Hickey and Mohan 2003).<sup>8</sup>

Civic republicanism could also be extended to embrace new categories of rights and participation being demanded by social movements such as reproductive rights. David Held opened further spaces in civic republicanism with his seven clusters of rights corresponding to key sites of power—health, social, cultural, civic, economic, pacific, political right (Held 1989 in Lister 1997). He declared these rights as "key to the entrenchment of the principles of autonomy and to facilitating free and equal political participation."

Proponents of participatory democracy also build on civic republicanism in advocating the extension of participation to "broaden its meanings to organizations and relations of social and cultural life including child-rearing and living arrangements (in welfare states).

Among the modern proponents of civic republicanism are Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition* (1958), Richard Sennet, *The Fall of the Public Man* (1977) and Benjamin Barber, *Strong Democracy: Participatory Democracy for a New Age* (1984) (Voet 1998: 10).

### Deriving a Transformative Concept of Citizenship

Civic republicanism's sensitivity to social constraints on the attainment and exercise of citizenship rights, its refusal to confine citizenship to what the State will legitimize, and its space for expanding it to areas of social life make it a very potent instrument for confronting situations of social inequality and exclusion and where the state can not be relied on to promote, much more protect, the rights of socially excluded. From civic republicanism framework, one can derive a notion of citizenship that legitimizes right to intervene in or challenge the state to become more accountable, responsive and democratic or even wrestle with the state in order to promote those values. It also offers enough ground to combat inequities in social relations and promote egalitarianism and democratization.

In effect, one can derive from civic republicanism a notion of citizenship that is oriented towards reordering social, political, cultural life towards a vision of social order based on egalitarian, democratic and other principles that promote the common good and social dignity. This interventionist, proactive type of citizenship takes on a transformative character.

A transformative citizenship pays particular attention to the existing unequal power relations not only within the state but also within the realm of social and economic relations. It aims not only to redistribute power but more importantly, develop new ways of configuring power such that it does not become an instrument for power but a resource for enabling, for building inclusive communities, and for counteracting forces and institutions that undermine social integrity.

Transformative citizenship demands a continuing redefinition of its agenda and nature based on dialectics with the historical context it is in.

### Elements of Transformative Citizenship

Conceptualizing transformative citizenship would require a redefinition of some of citizenship's basic assumptions such as agency, rights, group rights, identity and location.

#### *Agency*

Lister (1997: 37-38) points to *agency* as a core assumption about citizenship participation. It means being "autonomous, purposive actors, capable of choice and in which individual actions and choices constitute a process of self development, of concretely becoming the person one chooses to

be through carrying out those actions that express one's purposes and needs." In this context, citizenship as participation represents an expression of human agency in the political arena.

Citizenship agency is based on consciousness, a "*sense of being an agency, the belief that one can act on it; [On the other hand] acting as a citizen, especially collectively, in turn fosters that sense of agency.*" Agency in this context, therefore, does not only refer to capacity to choose and act, but a conscious capacity. Such capacity is important to the individual self identity.

Being an agent means that an individual becomes a citizen when he/she performs the duties of the practice of citizenship, as it is not merely a status. A person becomes a citizen when he/she works to realize it (Oldfield 1990). This means that for the notion of agency to be realized into a more inclusive and participatory energy, people must have a sense of what it is to become a citizen (and his/her entitlements and obligations), an understanding of themselves as citizens and capacity to integrate this dimension of their identity (Lister 1997). This must be paralleled by a sense of the right to do so, a sense of being capable to participate effectively and a sense that participation will have an impact on political or social processes (Jones and Gaventa 2002).

In this light, citizenship and participation, more than anything else, entail commitment and conscious choice to become "active citizens" and learn to "judge our world in terms of how far it realizes the ideals of citizenship and community" (Oldfield 1990: 7).

This notion of agency could have an exclusionary dimension for those who are not able or are not capacitated to practice citizenship. This happens in societies characterized by social inequalities and structural exclusion and where citizenship is defined and realized only by the powerful; thus, to prevent agency from becoming an institution for exclusion, Oldfield insists on providing empowering or enabling support, sufficient motivation, and opportunities to those unable and disadvantaged so that they can participate and work out their citizenship (1990). This brings to fore the value of conscientization within the framework of facilitating liberation.<sup>9</sup>

### *Rights*

A central element in theorizing about citizenship is the notion of "right." Under liberalism, rights are conceived of as "political" and "civil" (freedom from coercive action of the State) and, later, "social" (entitlement). It is the duty of the political institutions to protect citizens in the exercise of right and freedom and to leave the citizens unhindered in the pursuit of whatever

collective or individual interest they may have. Rights, from the liberal position, are universal.

Transformative citizenship challenges this universal notion of right for disregarding the fact that not everyone, even if entitled, is equally capacitated to exercise rights as others. It also does not consider that there are individuals or groups who, on account of not possessing the conditions that will qualify for citizenship entitlements, are excluded.<sup>10</sup> As Lister (1997: 17) would put it: "it [liberal notion of right as universal] tends to abstract inequalities from the political and historical contexts in which they were produced and maintained" and "ignores inequalities' fundamental influence over people's consciousness of, and capabilities to advocate for their rights and needs" (Isin and Wood 1999: 11). It hides inequality and how those who have greater resources, power and knowledge can shape the discourse on rights and how these will be put into practice in their favor, while excluding others.

This inevitably brings to fore the issue of power relations and inequalities mediating in the way rights are defined and exercised. This issue means that any discussion or conceptualization of citizenship in the context of addressing the needs and rights of the disadvantaged groups must lead to the question of how to enable them to understand their rights and entitlements, and the basis of such rights and entitlements, how to articulate and struggle for the realization of their rights and create their own strategy for participation.

This leads to a new level in conceptualizing citizenship – *from entitlement or bundle of rights and corresponding obligations to "right to have rights" and being able to advocate what the citizens perceive as their right*. It shifts the discourse from substance of rights to claiming rights.

The process of claiming right is inherently political, that is, it is played out as struggle between interests, power and knowledge of differently positioned claimants (Jones and Gaventa 2002). This process further makes citizenship a highly contested area- both theoretically and operationally.

### *Group Rights*

The discourse on citizen rights as not merely about entitlement but also how it is being created or realized through collective efforts of citizens opens space for conceptualizing *group or collective rights*. These are rights specific to a particular group of people, with the same needs and interest, who are usually excluded and in need of protection and enablement to be able to realize particular needs, interests and priorities (Jones and Gaventa 2002).

Accepting the legitimacy of group/collective rights implies recognition of and respect for differences. It also conveys the notion of differentiated rights, meaning that different groups may legitimately require different sets of rights (Isin and Wood 1992) (Wilson 1997; Cowan et al. 2001, all cited in Jones and Gaventa 2002: 11).

In creating a space for group/collective rights and participation within the context of transformation, the group can be looked at as the "defining center of identity, and the integration of rights into this framework centers on the idea that the group is the logical focus of rights definition and claims making process" (Jones and Gaventa 2002: 12).

The recognition of group rights as legitimate citizenship right challenges and deconstructs any prevailing images or notions about which legitimize marginalization and exclusion of any particular group. Similarly, it calls for developing and nurturing the excluded group's sense of social *identity as citizens and its implications*.

### *Identity*

Another crucial dimension of citizenship bearing on citizen participation is *identity*. It refers to "how people see themselves as citizens and act upon this, and how it relates to their understanding of themselves in other aspects of life" (Jones and Gaventa 2002: 13). A common thread in many contemporary writings about citizenship is an assertion that the way in which people understand themselves as citizens is likely to have a significant impact on the perception of their rights and obligations and where, who, and why they will participate (Jones and Gaventa 2002: 13).

This self-understanding provides the basis of a group's political identity and is crystallized by having a common identification of issues at a specific moment with others.

The importance of self-understanding as citizen and how one's total identity is interpreted shapes understanding about institutions that affect citizens' lives and how this institution should relate with them with accountability.

From a transformative perspective, identity or self-understanding needs to be recognized as a construct defined by the powerful for themselves and for those who exercise power. It is, therefore, important that enough opportunities be created for those whose identities have been imposed upon or defined for them or denied from them, for them to be able to understand their dignity as human beings and all their rights and entitlements. It is enabling

them to define their identity from the perspective of equality and mutuality with the rest of society.

### *Location*

A new dimension in the discourse on citizenship, which should form part of transformative citizenship is *location* or the arena where citizenship's rights and obligations are defined, contested and exercised or even expanded.

As mentioned above, the expansive notion of rights under civic republicanism could only be possible if citizenship entitlements and participation are conceived of as not depending on the state for legitimation. This notion, and the notion of group identity and rights, make citizenship an ensemble of different forms of "belonging" (Isin and Wood 1999: 21)—gender citizenship, ethnic citizenship, ecological citizenship, etc. This has implications to the practice of citizen participation, making it not only political in the sense of relating with the state but also social, addressing inequalities/oppression or exclusion within social relations or the social sphere.

This brings the discourse to the space or location on which citizenship is expressed. Brown (1995) describes it as engaging in politics in actual location—public meeting, home, workplace, etc. It is, however, an identity and practice that is likely to differ across the space on which people's lives are played out.

Oldfield clarifies the issue, saying that in a diversity of arenas of citizenship, "the importance of citizenship lies in part in its creation of a sense of community...to a large extent, citizens will choose where to be active and when and where they are active, they will create a sense of community...which is found not in formal organization, but wherever there are individuals who take the practice of citizenship seriously" (1990: 174).

This statement means not only identifying and expanding the arenas where citizenship is actualized but enabling citizens to choose where and how to actualize them. This becomes a crucial concern in the process of reconceptualizing citizen participation as fundamental citizenship right. This calls for creating new mechanisms and spaces for citizenship engagement. It also entails moving from traditional mechanisms, such as election to other areas of social life that influence events and political decisions.

A radical possibility in the reconceptualization of citizenship location is a shifting away from arenas defined by the State for seeking grievances, to arenas defined by the citizens themselves. The two People Power experiences in the Philippines dramatically show how new arenas for engaging or



wrestling with the State were created after the traditionally defined institutions for effecting change or ventilating grievances had been proven or perceived as ineffective. In both experiences, the participants did not at any moment cease being citizens. In fact, citizenship provided the justification for the struggle.

### **Radical Dimensions of Participation under Transformative Citizenship**

#### *The Power Shift Dimension*

Participation in the context of transformative citizenship will necessarily deal with the issue of power and power shift. The arena of power is not only confined to that between the State and related political institutions and the people/citizens, but also those where citizens related with themselves. This is most relevant in societies characterized by social inequality and where power relations mediate in state behavior and most decisionmaking processes in society; thus, to be truly facilitative of social change, which is the agenda of transformation, citizen participation must necessarily be accompanied by or result in *power shift* or *power transfer* or *power distribution*. In fact, Stiefel (1987) emphasizes that power shift should provide the context for understanding the fundamental reasons for the success and failure of participatory experiences and struggles.

Liporada (1999) envisions this power shift as consisting of:

- Shift from governance of a people to participatory democracy; from public administration to management of public interest (or governance);
- Shift from a leader-led development to shared responsibility; from acquiring and holding power to empowering others through service and organizing work;
- Shift from centralized mechanism to decentralized and area-based management; and
- Dismantling mechanisms and structures that inhibit citizens' participation and the development of mechanisms for empowerment and the promotion of the ecosystem.

This power shift must occur within the structures and ethos of policymaking, resource holding, and others that impact on citizens' lives, in communities and between or among citizens and even among organizations promoting development and participation.

The kind of power shift envisioned is not necessarily a reversion, where domination is reversed. As mentioned above, it is both redistributing power and finding new modes of configuring power so that it becomes a resource for enabling and building community life rather than an instrument for domination and exclusion.

### **Power Shift in the Field of Knowledge Production and Distribution**

The envisioned power shift must be accompanied by a power shift in knowledge production and distribution as this is where the ideological basis of domination and marginalization flows through (Chambers 1983; 1997). Inequalities in the way information is accessed, in capacities to influence knowledge production and deciding which is legitimate or not, in deciding which knowledge to guide decisionmaking perpetuate social inequality and situation of domination (Sohng 1995). Using rural development as case, Chambers (1983), a scholar known for his advocacy of participatory research approaches, illustrates how modern scientific knowledge system's domination of knowledge production on issues of development such as rural poverty led to the marginalization and rendering as inferior of the local knowledge or non-scientific knowledge system. He emphasized that this situation of dominance in knowledge is associated with dominance in power; thus, in order for participation to become an effective means for causing power shift, it must be accompanied by a shift in the knowledge imbalance. Chambers describes this shift as a "*paradigm shift from externally-determined, product-based development, to participatory systems of research and decisionmaking which prioritize a process in which categories of people hitherto excluded become more powerful*" (cited in Nelson and Wright 1997: 7). This shift aims to bring "*parity in which the knowledge of the poor or 'non-scientific knowledge' is being valued in relation to scientific knowledge*" (cited in Nelson and Wright 1997: 7).

Power shift must, therefore, touch on the way knowledge necessary for decisionmaking and knowledge or technology that guides decisionmaking process are created and propagated. This means not only enabling the excluded to effectively participate, but most importantly, enable them to bring into the deliberation table their world view and means for decisionmaking. The inclusion of the world view and means for decision in the process should become part of the terms of negotiation between the excluded and other parties in the issue at hand.

#### *Economic Foundation of Power Shift*

The envisioned power shift must have a firm material foundation—that is, it must also impact on the means of producing, distributing and controlling

resources for meeting society's needs. Power shift must be anchored on and sustained by a compatible economic system; thus, power redistribution and reconfiguration must have economic parallel. This includes not only redistribution of resources but also broadening access to assets and regulating entities that tend to monopolize assets and resources. This shift must have implications for the way growth and factors/engine of growth and development are defined.

It is also in this light that theorizing work needs to establish how much and what kind of societal reforms can be achieved through citizens' participation in decisionmaking and what are best left purely for the market to achieve. What will be the logical interplay between participation and market? What conditions would complement rather than negate each other's role?

### **Development Theory as Providing Context to Transformative Citizenship and Participation**

Every participatory effort that seeks meaningful social outcomes must be firmly grounded on a keen analysis of the prevailing social situation in its historical, sociological and ideological sense, a vision of social order or institutional arrangement, the means for attaining the vision and the role of a participatory regime in the process of attaining such vision. Such constitutes a development theory.

Generically, a development theory provides an analytical framework for understanding present social condition: a) envisioning an alternative social order (social change); and b) setting standard (principles and strategies) with which to attain the envisioned social change (Martinussen 1997: 16-17). Preston (1996: 19) summarizes these elements into *model of change*, *methods of attaining the model*, and *morals* (ethics) that should characterize the change and methods.

A development theory that is compatible with the conceptualization of transformative citizenship should provide:

- the framework for analyzing the underlying causes of exclusion and marginalization, power inequality, poverty and related issues in their social, political, economic and ideological dimensions;
- a vision of "common good" or "good society" or quality of social existence that transformative citizenship seeks to uphold or promote; and
- the ethical norms, principles and strategies for attaining said vision.

A development theory, therefore, provides the context for addressing questions such as extent and nature of power shift that should accompany or result from transformative participation, the kind of economic system and development philosophy that is most compatible with transformative citizenship and the key players whose capacity for participation should be strengthened or given priority. In a governance context, this means defining the development path towards which society should be managed.

On the whole, a development theory as described above establishes the context for participatory citizenship and the dialectics between citizenship and development within the context of seeking transformation. This development theory has to be aligned with democratic theory.

### Insights

Transformative citizenship is founded on an inclusive and expansive notion of agency, rights, identity and location. The actualization of these elements logically leads to challenging existing power imbalance and mode by which power is defined and exercised.

Its orientation towards transforming present social order into an envisioned alternative along egalitarianism, democracy, human dignity, and other principles that promote common good, prevents transformative citizenship from being bigoted, reduced to narrow parochial interest, and easily co-opted.

More importantly, transformative citizenship or its evolution does only occur cognitively or as a matter of intellectual preference. It is prompted or accompanied by corresponding changes in the social world which challenge existing notion of citizenship; thus, in order to become truly responsive and a sustained social praxis, transformative citizenship has to be continuously redefined or reconceptualized, but such process has to contend with opposing forces that support the status quo, whether in the realm of intellect or politics. Transformative citizenship, therefore, should grow and be continuously redefined out of its own dialectics with the historical context.

It is in this context that participation should be understood, conceptualized and promoted. It is in relation to the attainment of transformation goals that the success of any participatory effort should be assessed.

## **The Public Administration Agenda of Transformative Citizenship: Be Transformed As It Transforms**

### *The Framework for Hope*

The exercise of transformative citizenship can not only enhances but even transforms Philippine Public Administration, both as a discipline (PA) and practice (pa). An interventionist, sustained and vision-guided citizen movement can continuously challenge the state and its public administration system to become more accountable, more responsive to the needs of the broad citizenry, more assertive against intransigent elite interest that has long captivated it and take a proactive posture towards defining development vision guided by social justice and equity, sustainable development and self respect. Transformative citizenship challenges PA/pa to become effective instruments of social transformation and develop a framework for attaining such.

### *A Visionary and Enabling Public Administration*

One fundamental step towards becoming a transformative PA/pa is for government to facilitate a credible consensus building among the broadest possible sectors of Philippine society as to the goal and the development that must be pursued in order to reach this social goal. In performing such role, it must be ensured that there is adequate space for enabling traditionally marginalized sectors to effectively participate and negotiate their position. Civil society can take a significant role in this regard but institutional guarantees and legitimation for their participation must be ensured by government.

## **A Self-Transforming Public Administrative System**

### *Facilitative and Enabling PA System*

For the Philippine government to be able to accomplish the above effectively and credibly, it will require another fundamental restructuring of its role—from commanding to facilitating. This restructuring entails reorienting and equipping public administrators and policy makers with ethos, perspective, knowledge and skills for enabling the disadvantaged, excluded and marginalized groups. It is in effect creating policy environment that enables these groups to become *social agents*—able to articulate their rights and interests, effectively participate and negotiate with other interest holders over any public issue and influence the design of public decisions and their implementation. This policy environment means *reconceptualizing PA so that*

*it can mould public administrators into professional enablers and facilitators, motivated by passion and commitment.*

#### *Facilitating Direct Democracy-Rethinking Decentralization*

This also implies making as a premise in policy making and development planning the given context of social inequality and how existing power relations mediate in all public decisionmaking. This requires recognizing how majority of the citizens may have or not have equal opportunities and capacities unlike the elite to influence policymaking and other public decisionmaking processes. The framework of policymaking must reckon with the fact that due to the prevailing power structure, the present system of representation has failed to faithfully represent the views, interests and aspirations of the majority for whom representation is supposed to be made; thus, PA must lead in identifying ways by which other venues for direct participation can be developed and institutionalized. This implies further reviewing the notion of local governance and decentralization, thus, wrestling with such possibilities as *devolving power not only within government structures but also to local communities of citizens. It could lead to making decentralization not only based on political-administrative subdivisions but also on ecosystem, or convergence of household interests, or existence of potentials for associative economies among groups of grassroots communities.*

#### *Rearticulating Public-Private Divide*

Another challenge is how to enhance PA/pa such that it can effectively reorient the science of policy making to give equal importance to issues in the public and private spheres. In so doing, it deconstructs privileging of public domain and the values and concerns associated with it over those of the private domain. In this regard, PA/pa will greatly benefit from gender theories. This can go further analyzing gender and other exclusionary biases that are probably embedded in existing research and policymaking/development planning methodologies.

#### *Drawing from Resources of Culture*

There is a need to discover and draw from the participatory and citizenship resources richly embedded in Philippine culture through time but rendered inferior or invisible by unquestioned privileging of Western knowledge system.

### *Promoting Multiple Location of Citizenship*

Philippine PA/pa must recognize the many locations of citizenship other than those defined by the State. This means supporting the elimination of any form of inequality and exclusion in various spheres of life, such as, in gender, ethnicity, households, and strengthening of rights in these areas. This effort broadens the scope of governance.

Promoting many locations of citizenship facilitates the development of citizenry that is not hopelessly dependent on the state for welfare and protection, but at the same time is able to confidently and effectively participate and even intervene in governance from wherever context or location. It also strengthens constituency for the government's development vision.

### *Recognizing the Bureaucracy as Location of Citizenship--An Arena for Rights Contestation*

It should be recognized that the bureaucracy is itself a location of citizenship. As a microcosm of society, there exist in bureaucracy various degrees of inequality and exclusion based on class, gender, ethnicity, education, political affiliation, etc. As such, it is an arena for contestation and claiming of rights.

As a self-transformation effort, the bureaucracy must address those inequalities and exclusions. The policies, procedures and practices must be expunged of any exclusionary or discriminatory elements. Unionizing, rights education, provisions for reproductive functions of women must be institutionalized.

Power shift has to take place within the bureaucracy itself. It requires change in structure for decisionmaking, language and procedures and even in ratio of staff engaged in direct field work and those in management and technical support (Nelson and Wright 1997: 1).

### *Counting the Cost of Institutionalizing Participation*

The institutionalization of participatory approaches will naturally create more demands from government for more resources and innovative structures; however, it need not be regarded as resource drain but rather as a new way of setting priorities in resource allocation. It can, in fact, be seen as a way of avoiding financial, logistical and credibility losses as a consequence of unresponsive or inappropriate programs, destabilization and conflicts arising from frustrated citizenry, etc. It can be a way of generating rich social capital

which government can mobilize as resource persons in crafting policies or securing partners in implementation. In effect, investing in meaningful participatory approach to public administration and governance can have gainful returns such as: a) ensured responsiveness of decisions and actions; b) broadened constituency and support base; c) a citizenry that is capable of providing check and balance function and exacting accountability; d) broad support to government; and e) meaningful reforms and institutional transformation that need not incur the social costs that authoritarianism or armed conflict could cause. On the whole, *it enhances constituency, legitimacy and stability of government and the governance process.*

*Developing Participatory Approach to Theory Building  
and Knowledge Construction in PA*

The transformation being sought above needs to have firm theoretical grounding. It should also induce a fundamental restructuring in the theorizing and ideological construction in PA.

One of its pressing implications is defining citizenship studies along with development studies as priority fields of PA. This definition means that PA/pa will not only focus on theories and practice of managing the bureaucracy but on theories about poverty, exclusion, inequality and even contemporary phenomena such as ecological degradation, gender violence, migration, peace, etc and how public administration can become an instrument for resolving them. The exploration of development theories for PA must be accompanied by theorizing a kind of citizenship that would serve as political force in addressing problems and accomplishing development goals.

This, therefore, would drive PA into playing a very crucial role—that of taking the lead in clarifying the development theory or development direction which must be pursued and whose attainment, Philippine Public Administrative system will allot substantial resources. A development theory that intersects with citizenship provides the larger context for PA/pa and governance.

A development theory that intersects with citizenship theory will help address important questions such as: Does policymaking process define citizen participation merely in the implementation and monitoring or even on the initiation, designing (including framework setting) and decisionmaking stage? It should also provide the framework for rationalizing any investment to participatory mechanisms and processes. On the whole, it ought to present the philosophy, the social analysis and the vision around which citizen participation will be theorized.



Consistent with building a theory of development and participation is making the theorizing process and knowledge construction in PA equally participatory. This means, among other things, valuing the perspective and accumulated bodies of knowledge of the groups which were traditionally excluded but are deeply immersed in the social realities that PA and governance attempt to address. How then can these perspectives and knowledge inform public policy making, program development and most of all academic theorizing?

One possible solution is deprivileging deductive approach and maximizing benefits from inductive, grounded theorizing approach to research. Such would lead research designs and capabilities towards discerning, distilling and navigating through the knowledge from the everyday lived experiences of people. This is the typology of knowledge construction referred to by Weber as *Verstehen* (Neuman 1997: 68). On the paradigm level, this requires opening up PA from being purely framed by *positivist approach* to exploring non-positivist ones such as interpretive *approach*<sup>11</sup> in its researches.

This also means rethinking the premises behind relying mainly on "experts," especially foreign ones, in understanding the social realities which PA seeks to address.

On the whole, the above discussion implies a revisiting of the philosophy and approaches by which knowledge is produced and reproduced by the academe, bureaucracy and technical and research units of government and development agencies.

### *The Post Modern Seduction*

Responding with integrity to the challenges posed above could lead to exploring what postmodernism offers to Public Administration. Bureaucracy, for example, from a postmodern view, is considered a *public energy field* (Fox and Miller 1995). As the context where administration or management occurs, the bureaucracy as public energy field is not a closed system but rather one that is very much "public," characterized by a continuing pattern of interaction—from cooperation to competition to conflictual among interest holders. These interest holders are not necessarily part of the formal organization where administration or management occurs. Fox and Miller (1995: 107) describe this situation as a "free flowing interaction among organizational actors and environmental actors, their intentions and the energy they bring to the field." This means that the bureaucracy is not a monolithic, closed, exclusive fixture that runs purely on formally established rules. Rather, it owes its life and energy to this interaction of varying interests which occurs mostly at the non-formal, non-official level. Its outputs,

e.g., public policies, are clearly the synthesis or negotiated result arising from the interaction.

A postmodern motivation should be pushed further so as to take a critical distance (without necessarily discarding their values) from the dominant and grand narratives associated with modernism and from which most of social sciences and administrative theories were framed. This should lead one to consider other possible sources of knowledge and ways of viewing or creating reality. Postmodernism suggests that such sources and ways are not necessarily inferior to the dominant ones (Neuman 1997: 81-83).

A postmodern approach to PA tends to look at issues not only from the perspective of the State as the ultimate interest holder, but also from other lenses provided by gender, multiculturalism, ecology, and even traditional culture. The latter may include the *non-western, non-indigenous* knowledge system that governs day to day life in a society but which was marginalized by the formal or scientific categories of knowledge and knowledge building processes. This could mean recognizing a multiplicity of possible ways of explaining or giving meaning and not privileging one approach. It also means being open to take seriously the cultural norm that runs parallel with formal and official norms of the bureaucracy (McSwite 1996; Neuman 1997).

This requires ascribing equal role to processes and discourses of communities of ordinary people as to formally generated knowledge. In recognizing the bureaucracy as a public energy field, the resolution of any question of truth will not be left to the "expert" as final arbiter of truth but a responsibility that will be shared or negotiated with the people who are immersed in the issues that PA seeks to address.

In acceding to the Postmodern invitation, PA academicians and practitioners would have to wrestle with the challenge to: (a) enhance the capacity and psychological readiness to deconstruct existing theories about the state, politics, administration, management, bureaucracy, etc.; and (b) acknowledge that much of the categories or assumptions that guide policies and behavior are probably social constructs and, therefore, are not immune to radical interrogation, reconstruction and reinterpretation.

### Conclusion

It was stated at the beginning of this article that the lack of clear social change theory upon which participation is based could render it vulnerable to manipulation by the powerful for their own interest. It can mean differently according to who has the capacity to influence the institutions that conceptualize and employ it. More importantly, any attempt to make

participatory governance/development part of PA discipline but without theoretical grounding can make it a constant subject of contestation, the outcome of which will be decided by whoever has the greater resources to influence research and publication.

The article, then, attempted to provide ideological anchor to participation by conceptualizing transformative citizenship out of civic republicanism. The latter provides the basis for rights definition, rights claiming, and rights expansion beyond what the state legitimizes. Transformative citizenship is seen as not only aiming to address power imbalance and redistribute power, but most importantly, reconfigure power so that it becomes a resource for enabling and inclusion and facilitating equality instead of a tool for domination. With the way agency, rights, identity and location of citizenship are given more radical meaning, transformative citizenship becomes a force for reordering society along the principles of egalitarianism, democracy, human dignity.

It was noted that participation in the context of transformative citizenship must be founded on power shift in the political, economic, social and ideological (knowledge construction) spheres. For it is only by such that the social change being envisioned by participation under transformative citizenship can be institutionalized and sustained. In this light, transformative citizenship must be defined within the context of an agreed development path provided by development theory.

In the end, the challenges of transformative citizenship to Philippine Public Administration were explored. In this light, transformative citizenship can challenge Philippine PA to become an instrument for social transformation; but in doing so, it must undergo transformation itself.

As part of its self-transformation, Philippine PA should integrate participatory approach and principles in its orientation, in its decisionmaking processes, and in its theory and knowledge construction process. True to this, the government must reconstruct itself from that of commanding to facilitating role, making as its priority, the facilitation of a broad consensus building process in drafting development direction and how this can be achieved. This shift requires shaping public administrators, bureaucrats and policy makers into professional facilitators and enablers who serve the public with passion and conviction.

The various locations of citizenship outside of the State must be supported in order to develop a citizenry that can confidently and effectively participate in governance. It must also be recognized that the bureaucracy is itself a location of citizenship where much inequality and exclusion exist alongside class, gender, ethnicity, educational attainment, political affiliation,

etc. A self-transforming bureaucracy must ensure that exclusions are removed from its policies and practices and ensure power shift within.

More fundamentally, participatory approach and principles must inform theory building and knowledge construction process in PA. It must be ready to deprive positivist and apply deductive approach to research and explore non-positivist, non-deductive approaches. That includes giving adequate space in policymaking, decisionmaking and even academic theorizing for the perspective and knowledge of groups or people who have always been marginalized or excluded politically and ideologically, but have long been immersed in issues and realities which PA seeks to address.

This also means taking as a basic premise in all its decisionmaking the existing power relations defined by social inequality.

Finally, an invitation is extended to explore what postmodernism could contribute in reconceptualizing Philippine PA into a discipline with a clearly participatory and transformative orientation. At the core of the invitation is to be willing and able to take a critical distance (without discarding them) from the dominant or grand theories that bind the present knowledge system, deconstruct the assumptions and categories behind this knowledge system and take a radical leap of exploring other sources of knowledge or ways of viewing reality, using other lenses than that of the State and including those provided by culture.

### Endnotes

<sup>1</sup> Arnstein (cited in Goldshack 1972: 31) created a device to show the various ways participation is being interpreted according to the balance of power between the state or any powerful institution and the citizens.

#### Non-participation

- *Manipulation* - there is semblance of participation but decisions have already been made and participants merely serve as rubberstamp committee.
- *Therapy* - where citizens are to be cured of their pathology through participation in groups

#### Tokenism

- *Informing* - where citizens are told of their rights and options as well as the plans and decisions made by authorities and are expected to accept the information.
- *Consultation* - where citizens' ideas are solicited through attitude surveys, neighborhood meetings and public hearings but in reality are not given much weight.
- *Placation* - where a few representatives of the poor or powerless are placed on public boards as a way of appeasing their hostile attitude against the authorities. They are allowed to

ventilate their views or grievances within the boards, but it is calculated that given their numbers and capacity, these representatives could not sway any decision.

#### Citizen Power

- *Partnership* - where citizens share planning and decisionmaking responsibilities through joint boards and decision rules. It is assumed that citizens "representatives" and government representatives share equal power. It is, however, a question of who set the agenda and parameters of any deliberation, although it can be assumed that in a partnership relationship, such are agreed upon by all parties.
- *Delegated Power* - where citizens have dominant decision-making authority over a particular plan or program. This happens usually in management of state owned natural resources where authority to govern is being delegated to community of users.
- *Citizen Control* - where citizens govern a program or institution, are in charge of policy and management and can negotiate any attempt at change by outsiders. In this, it is the citizens who initiate, design, plan and implement and make overall decision about the program or undertaking. They hold the power to decide the role of outsiders in the program or undertaking

<sup>2</sup>According to Prior et al.:

The representative process which is at the heart of representative /liberal democracy, and which operates mainly through elections, proves inadequate in as far as representing the citizens' voice, interests and diverging views. While there is adequate protection of the right of the individuals, there is less room for citizens to practice their citizenship and their duties.

The welfare system, on the other hand, developed a citizen who, from the perspective of the right is dependent on the state, and from the perspective of the left, is excluded from process of government and unable to influence public service. It not only failed to facilitate greater social equality but has spawned a bureaucracy that is unable or unwilling to respond to citizens' actual needs.

The market-based idea of citizenship which is derived from neo-liberal view of government that calls for opening up of public services to the market and market-led mechanisms reduces the citizen into a consumer. It is undermining the wholistic notion of citizenship which includes responsibility to the state and the mutual relations between the state and the citizens. Market-based services can marginalize citizens who can not afford private services.

<sup>3</sup>"Democratization" here essentially refers to "dismantling or reworking of institutions that facilitate power monopoly, oppression and exclusion, redistributing access and control over social resources which are traditionally in the hands of an elite and establishing the institutions through which the new mode of accessing and exercising power can be secured and take root in society."

<sup>4</sup>Marshall explicitly addressed the question of the relationship between citizenship and social class from the point of view of promoting social equality. He also outlined the material basis for citizenship. He showed how the clamor for civil and political rights is related with the need of the emerging bourgeoisie or capitalist class to secure a) freedom from arbitrary exercise of power by the state and therefore allowing capitalist relations to flourish and b) their emerging economic and political power; thus, civil right comes with the need for secured property rights and freedom to articulate themselves so that they can freely participate in the growing market economy. As the bourgeoisie consolidated, they demanded political right—or right to participate in political decisionmaking as member of the Parliament or elect their representatives to this institution, it being traditionally reserved for the

nobility. Social rights, the last to be conceived of, came as concession (to forestall more radical moves against capitalism) to the working class' demand for more share in the profit of production, better working conditions and other requirements of living based on growing standard of living and prosperity that time (Barbalet 1988; Abeer 2002).

<sup>8</sup>"Political community," according to Prior, refers to "collectivity whose members share a common system of governance, which includes both the institutions of government and the processes of collective decisionmaking...it simply refers to the existence of arrangements to enable a collectivity to govern itself, and the recognition of such arrangements by other polities. Individual members of the community who are entitled to participate in these political arrangements have the status of citizens" (1995: 6).

<sup>9</sup>Friedman (1992), in proposing to rearticulate the household as the basic political, economic and cultural unit of society in his *Theory of Politics of Alternative Development*, speaks of "household citizenship."

<sup>7</sup>Isin and Wood (1999) also enumerated the different areas of engagement and the form of citizenship that can be created, such as, diasporic and aboriginal, sexuality and identity, cosmopolitan, and cultural.

<sup>8</sup>Lister holds that running through in both these constructs is a set of dichotomies which are "saturated with gendered implications and associations [and] permeates the very fabric of citizenship."

These dichotomies are characterized as :

<b>Public, Male, citizen</b>	<b>Private, Female, citizen</b>
Abstract, disembodied, mind	Particular, embodied, and rooted in nature
Rational, able to apply dispassionate reason and standards of justice	Emotional, irrational, subject to desire and passion
Impartial, concerned with public interest	Unable to apply standards of justice
Independent, active, heroic and strong	Partial, preoccupied with private, domestic concerns
Upholding the realm of freedom, of the human	Dependent, passive, weak
	Maintaining the realm of necessity of the natural and repetitious

(Lister 1997: 69)

<sup>9</sup>Following Paulo Freire's approach to conscientization, space is created for the oppressed or excluded communities and sectors to analyze their situation of marginalization, exclusion or injustice, understand how they have internalized this condition as normal, define the possible options for addressing their situation, act on it, and reflect on the outcomes and then plan for action again. The whole process is being done evocatively and provocatively, and throughout, the participants discover confidence arising from a sense of being able to analyze their situation and envision a desirable life and act based on the vision. It also allows them to define their entitlements and understand the role of social and political institutions in the further denial of their entitlements or in realizing them. As they objectify their reality, their subjective strength develops; thus from being mere passive recipients of events and accepting their situation as a matter of faith, the participants are able to claim influence over events affecting them.

<sup>10</sup>During the period when liberal rights were conceived, the excluded groups could be slaves, unpropertied or unemployed persons, ethnic groups, women and others in the colonies held by countries where liberalism was born such as England, etc.

"In general, "interpretive approach" is the "systematic analysis of socially meaningful action through the direct detailed observation of people in natural settings in order to arrive at understandings and interpretations of how people create and maintain their social worlds." This is in contrast to positivist approach which relies mainly on established probabilistic causal laws. One of its interpretive approach varieties, hermeneutics, looks at the experiences and articulations as *text*, where the researcher tries to absorb or get inside the viewpoint it presents as a whole and then develop a deep understanding of how its parts relate to the whole (Neuman 1997: 68).

### References

- Abeer, Naila  
2002      *Citizenship and the Boundaries of the Acknowledged Community: Identity, Affiliation and Exclusion. IDS Working Paper 171*, Institute of Development Studies. Brighton; University of Sussex.
- Barbalet, J.M.  
1988      *Citizenship: Rights, Struggle and Class Inequality*. Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press.
- Brown, L.D.  
1995      *People-Centered Development and Participatory Research. Harvard Educational Review*, 55 (1), 69-75.
- Cariño, Ledivina V.  
2002      *From Traditional Public Administration to Governance Tradition: Research in NCPAG, 1952-2002*. A paper presented at the International Conference on Public Administration Plus Governance. Manila, 21-23 October.
- Chambers, Robert  
1983      *Rural Development: Putting the Last First*. Essex, England: Addison Wesley Longman, Ltd.  
1997      *Whose Reality Counts? Putting the Last First*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications.
- Clark, John  
2002      *Governance and Civil Society in a Globalized World*. A paper presented during the *International Conference on Public Administration Plus Governance*, Manila, 21-23 October.
- Cohen, Jean L. and Andrew Arato  
1992.      *Civil Society and Political Theory*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press
- Cornwall, Andrea and John Gaventa  
2000      *From Users and Choosers to Makers and Shapers: Repositioning Participation in Social Policy. IDS Working Paper 127*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.
- Davidson, Alistair and Kathleen Weekley (eds)  
1999      *Globalization and Citizenship in the Asia Pacific*. London: Macmillan Press, Ltd and New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc
- Fox, Charles and Hugh T. Miller  
1995      *Postmodern Public Administration: Toward Discourse*. Thousand Oaks, London and New Delhi: Sage Publications.

- Friedman, Steven  
2002 Democracy, Inequality and the Reconstitution of Politics. In Joseph S. Tulchin, ed. *Democratic Governance and Social Inequality*. Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.
- Friedmann, John  
1992 *Empowerment: The Politics of Alternative Development*. Oxford: Blackwell Press, Ltd.
- George, Vic and Paul Wilding  
2002 *Globalization and Human Welfare*. Hampshire and New York: PALGRAVE.
- Goldshack, David R.  
1972 *Participation, Planning and Exchange in Old and New Communities: A Collaborative Paradigm*. A PhD dissertation submitted to the Department of City and Regional Planning, University of North Carolina (Chapel Hill), Center for Urban and Regional Studies.
- Hassall, Graham  
1999 Citizenship in the Asia-Pacific: A Survey of Contemporary Issues. In Alastain Davidson and Kathleen Weekley, eds. *Globalization and Citizenship in the Asia Pacific*. London: Macmillan Press, Ltd and New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc.
- Hickey, Sam and Giles Mohan  
2001 Locating Participation Within a Radical Politics of Development: Citizenship and Critical Modernism. Draft working paper prepared for the conference on "Participation: From Tyranny to Transformation? Exploring New Approaches to Participation in Development" held at the University of Manchester on 27-28 February
- Isin Engin F. and Patricia K. Wood  
1999 *Citizenship and Identity*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: SAGE Publications.
- Jones, Emma and John Gaventa  
2002 Concepts of Citizenship: A Review. *IDS Development Bibliography 19*. Institute of Development Studies. Brighton: University of Sussex.
- Kelley, Terrence  
1999/2000 Unlocking the Iron Cage: Public Administration in the Deliberative Democratic Theory of Jurgen Habermas. *Administration and Society*, 36(1), March 2004, 38-61.
- Lamounier, Bolivar  
2002 Introduction: Globalization, Social Inequality, and Democracy. In Joseph S. Tulchin, ed. *Democratic Governance and Social Inequality*. Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.
- Lane, Jacqueline  
1997 Non-governmental Organizations and Participatory Development: The Concept in Theory Versus the Concept in Practice. In R. Nelson and B. Wright, eds, *Power and Participatory Development: Theory and Practice*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications.



- Liporada, Cesar D.  
1998 *Sourcebook on Effective Partnership for Local Governance*. Quezon City: Philippine Partnership for the Development of Human Resources in the Rural Areas (PhilDHERRA) and Philippine Canada Human Resource Development.
- Lister, Ruth  
1997 *Citizenship: Feminist Perspective*. Basingtoke and London: MacMillan Press.
- Manalo, Fermin Jr. P.  
2004 *Citizenship: Emerging Context and Evolving Concept: Challenges to Philippine Social Transformation*. Paper submitted to PA 301 under Dr. Ledivina V. Carino in March 2004 Quezon City: UP-NCPAG.
- Martinussen, John  
1997 *Society, State and Market: A Guide to Competing Theories of Development*. London and New York: ZED Books.
- McSwite, O.C.  
1995 Postmodernism, Public Administration and the Public Interest. In Gary L. Wamsley and James E. Wolf, eds. *Refounding Democratic Public Administration*. Thousand Oaks, London and New Delhi: New SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Nelson, Rici and Susan Wright  
1999 *Participation and Power*. In R. Nelson and S. Wright, eds, *Power and Participatory Development: Theory and Practice*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications.
- Neuman, Lawrence  
1997 *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Methods*. MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Oldfield, A.  
1990 *Citizenship and Community: Civic Republicanism and the Modern World*. London: Routledge.
- Osmani, S.R.  
2001 *Participatory Governance, People's Empowerment and Poverty Reduction*. UNDP-SEPED Conference Paper Series # 7. [www.undp.org/seped/conf.pub.htm](http://www.undp.org/seped/conf.pub.htm)
- Potter, David  
1999 *Democratization, Good Governance and Development*. In Tim Allen and Alan Thomas (eds), *Poverty and Development into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*: London: Oxford University Press.
- Preston, P.W.  
1996 *Development Theory: An Introduction*. Oxford and Malden: Blackwell Publishers.
- Prior, David John Stewart and Kieron Walsh (eds)  
1995 *Citizenship: Rights, Community and Participation*. London: Pitman Publishing.

- Sklair, Leslie  
2002 *Globalization: Capitalism and its Alternatives*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Sohng, Sung Sil Lee  
1995 Participatory Research and Community Organizing. A paper presented to *The New Social Movement and Community Organizing Conference*, University of Washington, Seattle, on 1-3 November <http://www.interweb-tech/nsmnet/docs/sohng.htm>
- Stieffel, Matthias  
1987 Social Participation in Development. A discussion paper presented to the *International Round Table on Social Participation in Development*, Laval University, Quebec, under the auspices of International Institute for Labor Studies, 25-28 May.
- Stivers, Camila M.  
1990 Active Citizenship and Public Administration. In Gary L. Wamsley, Robert Bacher, Charles T. Goodsell, Philip S. Kronenberg, John A. Rohr, Camila M. Stivers, Orlon F. White and James F. Wolf, eds. *Refounding Public Administration*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Van Gunsteren, Herman  
1998 *A Theory of Citizenship: Organizing Plurality in Contemporary Democracies*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Voet, Rian  
1998 *Feminism and Citizenship*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: SAGE Publications.
- Weekley, Kathleen  
1999 Introduction. In Alastain Davidson and Kathleen Weekley, eds. *Globalization and Citizenship in the Asia Pacific*. London: Macmillan Press, Ltd and New York: St. Martin's Press.

# Regulating Vehicular Emissions in Three Asian Cities: Comparative Analysis of Regulatory Program Design

FRANCISCO G. DELFIN, JR.\*

*Regulations governing vehicular emissions in Delhi, Manila, and Taipei are compared to examine how policymakers in democratic Asian cities anticipate compliance from target populations. Despite significant variations in their history and policy contexts, there is considerable similarity in the design of the three programs. The comparative analysis supports the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) strategic planning framework that states that size of the target population and the resources of the regulating agency affect compliance. Two additional elements are suggested which can affect compliance – dispersion of authority (Manila) and regulators' ownership of the program (Delhi). Economic climate in the outside arena does affect the choice of regulatory tools but not in the direction implied by Cohen and Kamieniecki. Costliness to implement coercive tools appear more common in poorer Manila and Delhi compared to well-off Taipei. The article suggests that such trend may be due to: 1) policymakers in developing nations discounting economic climate as a major criterion when planning regulatory approaches, 2) reliance on command-and-control measures in relatively poor countries arises not out of cost consideration but out of tradition, and 3) market-based incentives as a regulatory tool may be conducive only to certain societies that have reached a relatively advanced level of economic development.*

## Introduction

“Clean Air” policies were among the first environmental laws enacted by national legislatures in the US and other industrialized countries in response to modern environmentalism that started in the late 1960s (Desai 2002). Although concern for controlling air pollution, and for the environment in general, came much later in the Third World, serious efforts by many governments are currently underway. These efforts, however, must contend with at least two factors that could impede the

---

\*Assistant Professor, National College of Public Administration and Governance, University of the Philippines Diliman.

drive for cleaner air in developing nations. One is that while a post-materialist ethic is spreading in developed countries that favors environmental protection (Desai 2002), such is not the case in developing nations, particularly in Asia, where the predominant value in both public and private spheres is economic growth. As a result, urban areas in Asia are increasing with a growing middle class population (Desai 1998) who yearn for consumer goods such as automobiles. Second, the generally successful drive for clean air in industrialized countries has been achieved due, in large measure, to established and strong governance institutions. In contrast, effective institutional mechanisms for translating environmental goals into workable programs are lacking in many Asian nations; hence, while many of these nations are often enthusiastic supporters of international covenants on pollution and eager policymakers on local pollution control (Schubert 1993), many lack a realistic plan for translating national policies into effective programs at the local level (Tang et al. 1998). Given this weakness in governing institutions and the continued emphasis on economic development, an especially relevant research question is how specific air pollution control programs in Asian cities are crafted to suit local conditions to achieve maximum compliance.

This study explores how air pollution control programs for vehicle emissions in three Asian cities—Delhi, Manila, and Taipei—are designed and implemented. The article begins with a brief overview of the study's theoretical framework—the strategic regulatory planning model devised by Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991). Inasmuch as this framework was developed for a democratic political setting, Asian cities with democratic polity were selected for comparative study. Apart from this primary consideration, Delhi, Manila, and Taipei were chosen for two other reasons: (1) a significant number of publications on vehicular emissions are available for these cities, and (2) they also exhibit a range of economic and regulatory development. Empirical data on air pollution due to vehicle emissions including the corresponding environmental governance framework in these three cities are then summarized. These theoretical and empirical discussions provide the context for the subsequent analysis of specific regulatory programs and current outcomes of vehicle emissions reduction efforts in the three localities. Finally, lessons from this analysis of potential import to theory building and program implementation of environmental policies, especially in the context of democratic Asian nations, are highlighted.

### **Theoretical Framework**

How to achieve compliance to public policies is an enduring puzzle for both public managers and policy scholars. Recently, political scientists

have approached this issue by linking behavioral assumptions of target populations with the nature of policy tools and the dynamics of the political process (Schneider and Ingram 1990; 1993). Although the social construction of regulated parties remains controversial (Lieberman 1995; Schneider and Ingram 1995), there seems little doubt that the behavior of target groups is central to successful policy implementation. In this regard, effective regulation can be viewed as a deliberate attempt to promote appropriate behaviors by target populations towards desired ends. Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) introduced the concept of strategic regulatory planning through which governments can achieve such compliance by regulated parties. Borrowing from MacMillan and Jones (1986), Cohen and Kamieniecki devised a seven-step framework of strategic regulatory design that "encourages policymakers to approach regulation through a tactical, step-by-step process and to link policy formulation with implementation" (1991: 30). This seven-step model for strategic regulatory planning is given below.

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <b>I. Problem Recognition</b>              | What is at issue?   |
| <b>II. Identification of Parties</b>       | Who is involved?  |
| <b>III. Historical Analysis</b>            | How have different levels of government and the parties involved responded to this issue in the past? Why?  |
| <b>IV. Situational Analysis</b>            |   |
| A. Mission/Objectives                      | What outcomes are desired?  |
| B. Party Analysis                          | What are the motivations, goals, positions, and resources of each party to either comply with, ignore, or fight the desired behavioral changes?   |
| <b>V. Strategic Regulation Formulation</b> |   |
|  | Determination of the conditions in the regulated community, regulating agency, and the outside arena that affect the cost and level of coerciveness of alternative regulatory devices. The most appropriate devices are then chosen to influence target group behavior and to achieve compliance. |
| <b>VI. Ex Ante Review</b>                  |   |
|  | Addresses the fit and feasibility of the regulatory plan before implementation  |

### VII. Ex Post Review/Revision

Following implementation, how successful has the regulatory plan been at modifying behavior? Is further modification needed?

At the heart of the framework, indeed of most governments' approach to regulation, is the Step V process of strategic regulation formulation. Here, Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) developed a conceptual prescriptive framework that policymakers can utilize in selecting the appropriate regulatory tools for enforcing policies. This model requires an "in-depth examination of the conditions in the regulated community, regulating agency, and outside arena that might affect the cost and coerciveness of regulatory devices" (Cohen and Kamieniecki 1991: 62). In the regulated community, for instance, one needs to be sensitive to the presence of constituency organizations, the size and diversity of the target population, their resources and risk preferences, the amount of behavioral changes sought, and the ability of groups to hide non-compliance. Similarly, the characteristics of the regulating agency—the commitment of actors, the regulatory timetable, resources of the agency, and the precision of rules—influence the choice of specific regulatory devices. Finally, planners must take into account such things as political dynamics, the openness of rulemaking, the economic climate, and decision structures and demand patterns that constitute the external environment. The corresponding combination of restrictiveness and cost of regulatory devices represent the total government effort which affects the level of compliance from the target groups. Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991), recognize, however, that whatever set of regulatory tools is eventually chosen and implemented, feedback (Step VII) is crucial for ensuring successful compliance of target groups.

Applying this seven-step model to analyzing the development of vehicular emission regulation programs in the three cities requires thorough examination of documents and access to key personnel involved in framing and implementing these programs. Given the nature and constraints of this study, such comprehensive analysis is beyond the scope of this work. The aim of this analysis is more modest—to test whether the determinants to compliant behavior as developed by Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) have some application to regulatory outcomes in Asian nations. In this regard, three hypotheses are advanced:

*Hypothesis 1:* The larger the size of the target population, the more difficult it is to achieve compliance.

*Hypothesis 2:* The greater resources of the regulator, the more likely it is to achieve compliance.

*Hypothesis 3a:* Regulators in poorer states, compared to their richer counterparts, will tend to employ less coercive tools more because they are less expensive to administer.

*Hypothesis 3b:* Use of market-based incentives together with standard command-and-control measures will promote greater compliance rather than reliance on coercive means alone.

Each of the above hypotheses addresses a specific contextual factor out of the many that exist in the regulated community (hypothesis 1), in the regulating agency (hypothesis 2), and the outside arena (hypothesis 3a-3b); thus, their results can only be regarded as partial or, at best, initial explanations for the relationships that govern contextual conditions, characteristics of regulatory devices, and level of compliance. Apart from testing these hypotheses, it is equally important to note where the empirical data are inconsistent with other deductions from the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) framework, because such observations can raise alternative hypotheses that can guide future investigations.

### Vehicle Emissions in Three Asian Cities

The Asian Development Bank (2003) estimates that 20 percent of all vehicles in the world, about 140 million, are in the Asia-Pacific region. Increasing vehicle production, continuing growth in motorization, and high proportion of 2- and 3-wheeled motor vehicles with 2-stroke engines combine to make air pollution due to vehicle exhausts a pervasive and severe ecological problem in most urban areas in Asia (ADB 2003). Three Asian cities—Delhi, Manila, and Taipei—exemplify the magnitude and local contexts of vehicle emission pollution in Asian urban areas and illustrate the approaches of local governments in balancing the drive for clean air with the necessity of sufficient transport for a growing population. These three cities represent markedly different economic development (Table 1) but because all three are located in democracies, their regulatory approaches provide the contrast to strategic rulemaking for environmental policy in counterpart democracies in advanced societies, as exemplified by the US (e.g., Cohen and Kamieniecki 1991).

#### *Delhi*

The National Capital Territory (NCT) of Delhi encompasses an area of about 1,500 sq. kms. in the heart of the Indian subcontinent in northern India. A large part of the city lies between the Yamuna river in the east

**Table 1. Comparative Characteristics of Three Asian Cities**

<i>City</i>	<i>Income (US\$)<sup>1</sup></i>	<i>Currency (US\$ equiv.)<sup>2</sup></i>	<i>Land Area (sq. km.)</i>	<i>Population<sup>3</sup></i>	<i>Total Vehicles<sup>4</sup></i>	<i>Motorcycles</i>
Delhi	450	Rupee (Rs 45.80)	1,500	11.7 Million	3,555,504	2,261,132
Manila	1,643	Peso (P 44.20)	636	10.9 Million	1,255,140	171,696
Taipei	12,400	New Taiwan \$ (31.20)	272	2.6 Million	1,637,348	970,169

<sup>1</sup>Per Capita Income in 2001 based on *Asiaweek* (2001).

<sup>2</sup>Exchange rate as of end of 2000 from <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Books/ADB/2001/default.asp>.

<sup>3</sup>City population for Delhi and Manila for 2001 from <http://www.unfpa.org/swp/2001/english/tables.html>;

Taipei statistics from <http://english.taipei.gov.tw/TCG/index.jsp?recordid=116>.

<sup>4</sup>Refers to total registered vehicles in each city as of 2001;

Delhi data from Duggal and Pandey (2002), Manila data from Land Transportation Office (LTO 2003),

Taipei data from [http://w2.dbas.taipei.gov.tw/News/weekly/CE\\_Tree\\_Eng.asp](http://w2.dbas.taipei.gov.tw/News/weekly/CE_Tree_Eng.asp).



and the extension of the Aravadi hills that encircle the city on the west and northwest. Home to nearly 14 million people, Delhi is one of the world's megacities.

At the beginning of 2002, there were 3.5 million vehicles in the city (Table 1), 66% of which were made up of 2-wheelers (>2.2 million) and 3-wheeled auto rickshaws (0.09 million) (Duggal and Pandey 2002). This fleet makes Delhi the biggest fuel consumer among Indian cities, the bulk of which in 2000 was high sulfur diesel (Sengupta 2001). In 2000, 292,000 tons of carbon monoxide (CO), 112,000 tons of hydrocarbons (HC), and 14,000 tons of particulate matter (PM) emissions were released from vehicles. In all pollutant cases, 2-stroke-2-wheelers (2S/2W) contributed the largest share among vehicle types accounting for 38%, 63%, and 24% of CO, HC, and PM pollution, respectively (Sengupta 2001). Vehicular emissions of nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>x</sub>) and benzene amounted to 63,000 and 3,000 tons, respectively; private gasoline cars in Delhi accounted for 35% of the NO<sub>x</sub> and 41% of benzene emissions.

Although some progress since the mid-1990s in improving ambient air quality in Delhi is apparently being achieved, pollution from particulate emission continues to be the most worrisome. Ambient air quality with respect to particulate matter  $\geq 10$  microns aerodynamic diameter (PM<sub>10</sub>) and suspended particulate matter (SPM) pollutant in Delhi residential areas have reached critical levels, surpassing the national ambient standards; for instance, monitoring data for December 2002 in Delhi showed that six out of seven and four out of six monitoring stations for PM<sub>10</sub> and SPM, respectively consistently exceeded critical threshold values (CPCB 2003). Much of the improvement in Delhi's atmosphere comes from reduction in SO<sub>2</sub> pollution but nitrogen oxide (NO<sub>x</sub>) levels remain high. Although not attaining critical levels, NO<sub>x</sub> remains high in residential areas reaching 39-87 micrograms/cubic meter ( $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) (CPCB 2003) (Table 2).

India's federal government structure exerts a tremendous impact on environmental governance in Delhi, and other Indian cities as well. Responsibility for framing environmental laws is split between the central, state, and joint or concurrent jurisdiction (Sapru 1998). Although the central legislature cannot enact laws on subjects within state jurisdiction without the latter's consent, the central government has used its constitutional right to enforce international commitments to enact two national environmental statutes that are important for addressing air pollution problems. The Air Prevention and Control of Pollution Act of 1981 established the bureaucratic apparatus for implementation through central and state pollution control boards while the Environment

**Table 2. Ambient Air Concentrations and WHO Guideline Values for Key Pollutants in Three Asian Cities**

<i>Pollutant</i>	<i>Averaging Time</i>	<i>WHO (<math>\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3</math>)</i>	<i>Guideline<sup>1</sup> (ppm)</i>	<i>Delhi<sup>2</sup> (<math>\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3</math>)</i>	<i>Manila<sup>3</sup> (<math>\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3</math>)</i>	<i>Taipei<sup>4</sup> (ppm)</i>
Carbon Monoxide	1 hr	30,000	25		<20,000	
	8 hr	10,000	10		<15,000	1.4
Lead	1 yr	0.5			-0.4	0.02 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
Nitrogen Oxide	8 hr	120	0.06	39-87	58-124	
	1 yr	40	0.021-0.026			0.026
Ozone	8 hr	120	0.06		150-200	0.02
Sulfur Dioxide	24 hr	125	0.044	9-15		
	1 yr	50	0.017		20-30	0.007
PM <sub>10</sub> <sup>5</sup>	24 hr	150	130	170-344	50-100	
	1 yr	50	25			
(Total) SPM <sup>6</sup>	24 hr	230		430-777		52 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
	1 yr	90			125-150	

<sup>1</sup>Data from WHO (1999).

<sup>2</sup>December, 2002 values from CPCB (2003).

<sup>3</sup>Values read off from graphs in World Bank (2003).

<sup>4</sup>1999 values from Taipei Bureau of Environmental Protection (2003).

<sup>5</sup>PM<sub>10</sub> guideline values are from the USEPA; <sup>6</sup>SPM guideline values are Manila's standards.

Protection Act of 1986 provided guidance to these pollution boards in establishing national standards for air pollution (Sapru 1998). Enforcement of such national standards in Delhi, however, is the responsibility of the Delhi Pollution Control Board (DPCB) (Tang et al. 1998; CPCB 2003).

### *Manila*

Metropolitan Manila, composed of 12 cities and 5 municipalities, is the political, economic, and cultural capital of the Philippines with a population of 10.5 million people. Its land area of 626 sq. kms—less than 1% of the entire country—stretches between the Manila Bay on the west and the Sierra Madre foothills in the east on the main Philippine island of Luzon.

In 2001, there were 3.9 million registered vehicles in the entire Philippines, one-third of which were in Metro Manila (Table 1). Of the 1.3 million Metro Manila vehicles, public utility transport, such as taxis, passenger vans, and jeepneys, made up 44%; cars 36%; motorcycles and tricycles 14%; and buses and trucks 6% (LTO 2002). Public utility vehicles, both 4- and 3-wheeled, provide not only the cheapest mode of public transport but also a source of employment for low-income Filipino drivers in the metropolis.

Air quality conditions in Metro Manila, summarized below, are abstracted from the World Bank (2003). In 2001, total emissions of particulate matter ( $PM_{10}$ ) in Metro Manila were estimated at 127,000 tons annually, 31% of which came from mobile sources. A Manila Observatory study conducted in early 2002 for  $PM_{10}$  and  $PM_{2.5}$  monitoring revealed that while  $PM_{10}$  values in 3 sites in the metropolis averaged around 50, well below the 150 daily guideline value, 55-60% of  $PM_{10}$  is  $PM_{2.5}$  (particulate matter  $\geq 2.5$  microns aerodynamic diameter) which posed a greater health hazard as they could penetrate deep into the lungs.  $NO_x$  emissions in 2001 were estimated at 239,000 tons/year with transport sources accounting for 58% of the total. Diesel-fueled vehicles were identified as the principal contributor to  $NO_x$  pollutants. Mean monthly values of  $NO_2$  between 2001-2002 ranged from 58 to 214  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  compared to the 150  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  daily guideline level. Vehicle-generated emissions account for only 10% of the 176,000 tons/year of  $SO_2$  pollutant emitted in Metro Manila in 2001. Furthermore,  $SO_2$  levels have been declining since 1997 when several power plants in the metropolis were decommissioned, resulting in relatively low mean annual levels 20-30  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  during the past 2 years. Almost all (99.2%) the CO emissions in the city come from vehicles and monitoring shows CO

levels to be generally above the eight-hour guideline value but less than the one-hour value (Table 2). Finally, lead (Pb) concentrations have been slowly declining since 1994, and were generally below the  $1.5 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  threshold by 1995, but ambient monitoring has been discontinued since then.

Republic Act No. 8749, known as the "Philippine Clean Air Act of 1999," provides the comprehensive national policy for controlling air pollution. This law appointed the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) as the lead agency for air quality management in the country with responsibility for establishing emission standards from point and non-point sources. Implementation of emission standards for motor vehicles, however, was placed with the Department of Transportation and Communication (DOTC). The law allows the DOTC to deputize other law enforcement agencies and local government units (LGUs) for this purpose. Although each component city and municipality of Metro Manila has its own local government, administration of metropolitan-wide concerns, such as vehicle smog, is managed by the Metro Manila Development Authority (MMDA)—a regional administrative agency with a chairmanship that rotates among the mayors of Metro Manila LGUs every six years.

### *Taipei*

Situated in a basin ringed by mountains on all sides on the northern end of the country, the capital city of Taipei has a population of nearly 2.65 million people distributed over an area of about 272 square kilometers. Wang (2001) provides a summary of the air quality conditions in the city based on 1999 data.

Emissions of particulate matter ( $\text{PM}_{10}$ ) averaged 15,209 tons/year with nearly 60% estimated from vehicle exhausts. For  $\text{SO}_x$  emissions, the total rate was estimated at 2,658 tons/year with 37% attributed to road transportation. In contrast to this, 81% of the 22,023  $\text{NO}_x$  emissions in the city came from vehicles, with diesel transporting providing the bulk (44%). Non-methane hydrocarbon (NMHC) exhaust of vehicles accounted for 44% of the 72,769 tons/year emissions while for CO, the bulk (98%) of the 204,092 emissions came from road transportation pollution.

Using a pollutant standards index (PSI) where 100 denotes good air quality, Taipei's PSI statistics from 1995 to 2000 showed an average PSI of around 160, if days affected by sandstorm from neighboring China are excluded (Wang 2001). Because the number of days with PSI over 100 have remained more or less constant over the past six years, the general

consensus is that air quality improvement is being attained (Wang 2001). Table 2 supports this argument by showing that ambient air quality with respect to key pollutants is generally below WHO critical guideline levels.

The governing law for air pollution in Taiwan is the Air Pollution Control Act first passed in 1975 and amended in 1992 (EPA 2003; Tang and Tang 2000). In 1998, the Cabinet—the Executive *Yuan*—promulgated the National Environment Protection Plan (NEPP) with the aim of achieving air quality standards in Taiwan comparable to those of advanced countries (EPA 2003). Formulation of national air quality standards in Taiwan is the responsibility of the cabinet level Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). Implementation of the NEPP in Taipei and other cities, however, falls with each city's or municipal government's Environment Protection Bureau (EPB) whose director is appointed by the city or municipal mayor (Wang 1998).

### **Design, Implementation, and Outcomes of Vehicle Emission Regulations**

#### *Delhi*

Instead of a single policy or program outlining how vehicle emissions will be regulated, mobile emission reduction efforts in Delhi appear to have evolved from a number of diverse independent programs from different government agencies. Recently, many of these administrative programs have cohered as a result of rulings by the Indian Supreme Court in response to public interest litigation (CSE 2003; TERI 2003). Sengupta (2001) classifies the various administrative programs for vehicular emissions control into two broad groups—technical and non-technical—but six key components can be identified: (1) emission standards setting, (2) fuel quality regulation, (3) inspection and maintenance (I and M) program, (4) promotion of compressed natural gas (CNG) fuel in public transportation, (5) phase-out of old vehicles, and (6) public awareness campaign.

Emission standards setting in India is aimed at enforcement of progressively stringent emission standards for new vehicles with European vehicular standards as its model. In 2000, India adopted Euro-I<sup>1</sup> equivalent norms for all types of vehicles in the entire country except for passenger vehicles in Delhi which adopted the higher Euro-II standards, 1-2 years later than European schedule (Duggal and Pandey 2002; Sengupta 2001). Two-wheelers and three-wheelers with 2-stroke engines, because of their large numbers and their contribution to air pollution in Delhi, have more

stringent emission standards which even surpass the prevailing guidelines in advanced countries (Iyer 2002).

Fuel quality regulation mandated in the 1986 Environmental Protection Act (EPA) led to the phase out of leaded gasoline in 1998 and is designed to progressively reduce sulfur and benzene content in fuels. In Delhi, diesel sulfur content has been reduced from 0.25% in 1998 to 0.05% in selected outlets in 2000, and to all outlets by the first half of 2001 (Sengupta 2001). A complicating factor in regulating fuel quality to reduce pollution is the higher tax imposed on petrol (gasoline) compared to diesel. Petrol users are charged higher on the assumption that they have higher paying capacity (Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas 2003); thus, the equity principle that underlies price distortion in petroleum products actually promotes more diesel consumption that contributes to greater air pollution.

Public transport vehicles are required to undergo fitness check as a precondition for registration. The fitness certification, issued by Regional Transport Office (RTO), an attached agency under the state's Transport Department, centers only on vehicular safety and is good for two years for new vehicles and for one year for old vehicles. Private vehicles such as passenger cars and motorcycles, however, take the test only at the time of initial registration and are issued certification good for 15 years (Mehta and Salvi 2001; Rogers 2002). But apart from fitness check, all vehicles are required to obtain "pollution under control" (PUC) certificates every three months in any of the 400 test centers in Delhi located in filling stations and authorized private test centers (Sengupta 2001). PUC fees range from 150 Rupees (Rs) for heavy commercial vehicles to Rs 50 for medium to light commercial vehicles.

Public awareness campaign in Delhi has involved encouraging car pooling, using parking charges and fines to discourage motorization, and running surveys on public perception of traffic congestion (Sengupta 2001). Traffic management including the use of mass transit system is also an integral part of Delhi's pollution reduction effort.

The Indian Supreme Court, described by Tang et al. (1998) as very activist with respect to environmental matters, has provided some of the most sweeping vehicular emission regulations in Delhi in recent years. In decisions rendered in July and September, 1998, the Indian Supreme Court mandated the Delhi government and other concerned agencies to effect very specific rules pertaining to fuels, vehicles, and general administration with definite time schedules for implementation. Such directives, if viewed from the American context of policymaking, especially

of judicial environmental regulation (*e.g.*, McSpadden 1997), can be regarded as micro-management. For instance, the Indian Supreme Court ordered such things as the elimination of leaded petrol by September, 1998 and the ban on supply of loose 2T oils at gas stations and service garages by December 1998 (TERI 2003). The court also banned commercial vehicles more than 15 years old from Delhi streets by October 1998, required eight-year old buses or older run on compressed natural gas (CNG) or other clean fuels, and ordered that all Delhi public transportation shift from diesel towards CNG by end March 2001. On administrative matters, the Supreme Court ordered the establishment of two independent fuel testing laboratories by June 1999, the expansion of CNG supply outlets from 9 to 80 by March 2000, and the establishment of new and strengthening of existing air quality monitoring stations by April 2000.

Various aspects of Delhi's vehicle emission reduction efforts have been reviewed and criticized. In an evaluation done for the World Bank, Rogers (2003) concluded that the PUC certificate system in the entire country has been largely ineffectual. Inasmuch as private garages derive income from issuing PUCs, they are unlikely to issue failing grades to customers. Noting that institutional resources are limited, Rogers recommended the following for improving the PUC system: 1) its replacement by an enhanced inspection system targeted at the worst polluters, especially of particulate matter – 2-stroke 2- and 3-wheelers and diesel vehicles, 2) phase-out of private garages providing PUC tests, and bidding the system to a few commercial test centers for each urban area, 3) enhancing inspection system credibility by increasing the fines for not displaying PUC stickers, 4) ensuring that the PUC stickers are readily identifiable and credible indicators of system compliance through good design and minimizing fraudulent printing, and 5) penalizing filling stations supplying vehicles without PUC stickers.

Arguably, the most contentious issue of Delhi's vehicle emission regulation has been the decision to utilize only CNG-fueled public buses by March 2001. Because the Delhi government also operates city buses in competition with privately-owned units, the city government, assisted by the national government, has appealed and been granted several extensions of the deadline (CSE 2003). Not surprisingly, critics fault the Delhi city government and private petrol suppliers of sabotaging the regulations (CSE 2003).

### *Manila*

Regulation of vehicle emissions in Metro Manila and the rest of the country is contained in DENR Administrative Order (DAO) 2000-81 issued

in 2000 which sets the implementing rules and regulations for the Philippine Clean Air Act of 1999 (EMB 2000). This regulation superseded DAO 98-46 which was the previous governing mechanism for regulating vehicular pollution. Four key programs for controlling vehicular pollution are found in DAO 2000-81: (1) emission standards for new vehicles, (2) roadside inspection and emission control for in-use vehicles, (3) fuel quality regulation, and (4) public information campaign.

Standard setting for new vehicle types is targeted towards local manufacturers of vehicles with brand-new engines, assemblers of completely knocked down (CKD) imported new vehicle parts and components, and importers of new completely build up (CBU) units. No new vehicle will be allowed registration unless issued a Certificate of Conformity (COC) by DENR's Environment Management Bureau (EMB) after passing the actual emission test to be conducted by the DOTC's Land Transportation Office (LTO). Emission standards for new and in-use vehicles, however, will be reviewed every two years and revised if necessary to achieve compliance with air quality goals.

In-use vehicles are also subject to annual emission testing as a pre-condition to registration. Unlike emission test for new vehicles, testing of in-use vehicles can be conducted by authorized private Motor Vehicle Inspection Station (MVIS). Such inspection system first took place in Metro Manila in January 2003, while implementation in the rest of the country was expected 12-18 months later.

Roadside inspection of vehicles for excessive emission, designed to remove "smoke-belching" vehicles off Manila's streets, is the responsibility of DOTC-LTO and its deputized agents. Owners of vehicles who fail such inspection are fined and are required to have their emission systems repaired within seven days, during which time a vehicle plate is temporarily removed. After such repairs, a vehicle needs to be tested in a DOTC-LTO authorized testing center to obtain a Certificate of Emission Compliance (CEC) whose sole purpose is to obtain release of the vehicle's impounded license plate. Fines for smoke-belching are one thousand pesos (P1,000) for the first offense; P3,000 for the second offense, and P5,000 and attendance in a pollution seminar for the third offense. In addition, when the third offense is committed within a year of the first offense, the vehicle's registration will be suspended for one year. Franchise of operators of public utility vehicles who are proven to be repeat offenders will be revoked.

Regulation of fuel and additives as a tool for reducing vehicular air pollution is the responsibility of the Department of Energy (DOE). Leaded



gasoline was phased out in Metro Manila in April 2000 and the rest of the Philippines in December 2000 (World Bank 2003), but DAO 2000-81 strengthens the prohibition by making the manufacture, importation, and sale of leaded gasoline illegal. Another key component of fuel regulation is the specification of standards for fuel properties like anti-knock index, sulfur, aromatics, benzene. DAO 2000-81 mandates the reduction of aromatics and benzene content of unleaded gasoline to be lowered from 45% to 35% and 4% to 2%, respectively by 1 January 2003. Similarly, diesel sulfur content is targeted for reduction from 0.20% effective 1 January 2001 to 0.05% by 1 January 2004. Compliance with these fuel standards depends largely on coercive threats of three to five years imprisonment and fines of between PhP10,000 and PhP100,000.

DAO 2000-81 recognizes the importance of public information for curtailing air pollution from mobile sources. Thus, it calls for sustained and intensified public awareness campaign especially targeted to the transport sector emphasizing: 1) the harmful effects of vehicular emissions to the public and transport industry workers, 2) the technological options available for reducing emissions, and 3) the commitment of the government to apprehend offenders.

In addition to the above, the MMDA implements its United Vehicular Volume Reduction Program (UVVRP) designed to limit the volume of vehicles entering the capital. Popularly known as the "color-coding scheme," vehicles have assigned days when they are not permitted to drive within the city based on the last digit of their vehicle registration plates (those with plates ending in 1 and 2 are banned on Mondays, 3 and 4 on Tuesdays, etc.). Violators of the coding restrictions are fined P300. Initially covering only private vehicles, MMDA recently modified the program to include public utility vehicles (Antiporda 2003).

Although no major technical or scholarly evaluation of Metro Manila's emission control program has been published so far, the Clean Air Act has encountered stiff opposition from public utility tricycle drivers and owners who view it as unfair to low-income transport groups. In response to their petitions and strikes in late 2002, the DENR and the transport representatives agreed in early 2003 to: 1) seek a one-month suspension of the MMDA resolution urging local governments to stop granting franchises to 2-stroke tricycles; 2) reduce the emission fee for tricycles from P300 to P90; 3) work out a financing scheme with government-owned banks to provide credits to tricycle drivers wishing to upgrade their motorcycles from 2-stroke to 4-stroke engines; 4) fast-track the development of emission standards for tricycles which were not included in DAO 2000-81 (EMB 2003).

*Taipei*

The EPA has crafted pollution improvement strategy for mobile sources for Taiwan's urban areas (EPA 2003) which individual cities enforce through their own programs. Six principal measures are included in this strategy: 1) tightening emission standards, 2) promoting use of electric motorcycles, 3) using liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) cars and compressed natural gas (CNG) buses, 4) enhancing inspection/maintenance (I/M) and roadside inspection programs for motorcycles and diesel vehicles, 5) phasing-out old motorcycles and diesel vehicles, and 6) regulating fuel quality.

Tightening emission standards is directed at vehicle manufacturers with the goal of having each new vehicle model meet more stringent emission standards before they can be introduced in the market. This measure, however, is enforced in stages. The most stringent set of standards (Stage IV) will affect motorcycles and will be implemented by the end of 2003 while passenger cars and light to heavy duty vehicles are subject to Stage III standards that went into effect in 1999 (EPA 2003). The current emission standards for motorcycles in Taiwan, however, are comparable to those in India and are perhaps the most restrictive currently imposed in the world (Chuang 2001; Shu 2001).

Promotion of electric motorcycles is aimed at reducing exhaust emission from 2-stroke motorcycles. For producers, the EPA stipulated that beginning in 2000, two out of one hundred motorcycles sold must be electric powered. For consumers, the EPA granted subsidies ranging from NT\$12,000 to NT\$25,000 to encourage purchase of electric motorcycles (EPA 2003). By the end of October 2000, there were 1,623 registered electric motorcycles in Taipei with 73 recharging sites, 16 of which were located beside Mass Rapid Transit (MRT) stations for convenience (Wang 2001).

The promotion of low-polluting LPG vehicles and CNG buses, being implemented in Taipei by the city's Bureau of Transportation, began in 1996 when the EPA provided subsidies to taxis to convert into LPG fuel system amounting between NT\$20,000 to NT\$50,000 per vehicle (EPA 2003). To ensure availability of LPG fuel for these taxis, the EPA also actively encouraged the installation of LPG fuel stations through subsidies ranging from NT\$3 Million to NT\$4.5 Million for each LPG station. By late 2000, there were 10,000 registered LPG taxis, six CNG buses, and three LPG stations in Taipei (Wang 2001).

Enhanced I/M and roadside inspection as tools for reducing vehicle exhausts specifically targets motorcycles and diesel-run vehicles and relies

a great deal on penalties for enforcement. Annual inspections are mandated, and motorcycle owners who fail the test are fined NT\$3,000 (Chuang 2001). Apart from this routine inspection, random roadside inspection also result in fines of NT\$1,500 for motorcycles which do not meet emission standards. The EPA also encourages public support in this campaign by offering NT\$100 to persons who report high emission vehicles that eventually fail standards testing. As a result of these approaches, non-attainment rate of emissions standards by motorcycles in Taiwan has been decreased from 25% to 16% in recent years (EPA 2003).

Liberal use of subsidies has also accompanied the phase-out of old motorcycles and diesel vehicles. For the replacement of old motorcycles manufactured before July 1992 with new ones, subsidy amounting to NT\$2,000 were offered (EPA 2003). Shu (2001) reports that more than 200,000 old motorcycles were replaced in two years. For old buses, subsidies between NT\$ 200,000 and NT\$ 500,000 were granted for replacement by new buses meeting new standards or those using CNG. Lastly, between NT\$ 23,000 and NT\$ 1,000,000 were allocated for pollution improvements of diesel engines.

Regulation of fuel quality and the promotion of unleaded gasoline are the two major tools for meeting fuel quality targets. Sulfur content was mandated to be less than 0.05% in July 1998. Starting 1 January 2000 leaded gasoline for motor vehicles was totally prohibited and benzene content limited below 1% (EPA 2003). Collection of air pollution fees from users based on fuel quality and quantity provides another measure for helping dampen demand for gasoline. Although the policy of collecting air pollution taxes initially restricted to mobile users infuriated the public and was delayed for some time, the regulation was finally implemented in July, 1995 but at lower rates than originally conceived (Tang and Tang 2000).

Finally, apart from those measures mandated by the EPA, the Taipei city government also employs traffic management as a tool for reducing vehicle emissions (Wang 2001). These include improving transport flow through traffic signal computerization, rationalizing bus routes, and encouraging greater use of the MRT system.

### **Analysis Using the Cohen and Kamieniecki Framework**

The regulatory devices employed by the three cities are summarized in Table 3. Although the history and local contexts of vehicular emission regulation in the three localities differ significantly, there is similarity

**Table 3. Regulatory Devices for Reducing Vehicular Emissions in Three Asian Cities**

<i>Regulatory Object</i>	<i>Coercive Tools</i>	<i>Non-Coercive Tools</i>	<i>Delhi</i>	<i>Manila</i>	<i>Taipei</i>
1) Vehicles	Emission standards for new vehicles		X	X	X
	Compulsory inspection & maintenance		X	X	X
	Ban/phase-out of old vehicles		X		
		Subsidies for new vehicle purchase			X
		Subsidies for vehicles with clean fuels			X
		Subsidies for engine improvement			X
2) Fuels	Ban/phase-out of leaded gasoline		X	X	X
	Regulation of fuel quality		X	X	X
	Compulsory use of new fuels in buses		X		
	Expansion of CNG retail outlets		X		
		Subsidies for retailers of CNG/LPG			X
3) Traffic Behavior	Limits on private vehicle use			X	
	Parking fines on public spaces		X	X	X
	Rationalizing bus routes		X	X	X
		Encouraging car pooling	X		
		Promoting mass transit system	X	X	X

Author's own research.

and consistency in their regulatory program designs, especially in the use of specific coercive devices. In regulating vehicles, for instance, all three programs employ two standard command-and-control mechanisms: 1) emission standards for new vehicles, and 2) compulsory inspection and maintenance. In fuels regulation, two coercive tools are always present: 1) ban or phase-out of leaded gasoline, and 2) standards for fuel quality. In controlling traffic behavior, all three cities impose fines on parking in public spaces and rationalize public buses' routes in order to reduce the number of vehicles on the road at any time. Additionally, all three programs recognize the importance of regulating emissions from 2- and 3-wheelers, especially those using 2-stroke engines. Delhi and Taipei approach this problem by imposing very restrictive emission standards for new motorcycle models. Manila, on the other hand, has been reactive at best, having failed to even include emission guidelines for in-use 3-wheelers in its regulation (EMB 2003).

The key distinction in all three programs, as far as choice of regulatory tools is concerned, is Taipei's liberal use of market-based incentives for regulating vehicles and fuels specifically, compared to both Manila and Delhi. It has subsidy programs for private purchase of new vehicles (buses and motorcycles), vehicles using clean fuels (electric motorcycles, LPG taxis, and CNG buses), and for engine reconditioning of diesel-run vehicles.

The effectiveness of these devices can be qualitatively assessed by comparing compliance outcomes relative to the three specific contextual conditions identified earlier. If air quality status relative to WHO (1999) guidelines (Table 2) is taken as a measure of compliance, we can safely conclude that Taipei shows higher compliance rates compared to both Manila and Delhi. This is also supported by the increasing number of electric motorcycles, CNG- and LPG-run vehicles, and filling stations that provide cleaner fuels in Taipei. Insufficient common data make comparison of compliance between Manila and Delhi difficult but if  $PM_{10}$  pollution is used (Table 2), then Delhi appears to be significantly less able to reduce vehicular pollution assuming most of the  $PM_{10}$  comes from mobile sources. Manila, however, lags behind Delhi in terms of  $NO_x$  reductions; thus, one can suggest that compliance rates for Manila and Delhi are likely to be comparable.

#### *Size of Target Population*

A logical assumption in regulation analysis is that the greater the size and diversity of the population that needs to alter their behavior as a

result of public policy, the more difficult it is to meet regulatory goals. In all three cities, the target population consists of car manufacturers and importers, private emission testing centers, public transport owners and operators, riding public, and individual motorists and car owners. Given the diversity of such population, it is difficult to accurately determine the size of each sub-group based on the present study's constraint. The size of the vehicular fleet in each city (Table 1), however, provides a good proxy for the size of the population affected by emissions regulation. If meeting ambient air quality guidelines is the measure for compliance, Delhi's enormous target population may be the biggest factor in its difficulty to achieve compliance as predicted by the Cohen and Kamieniecki framework. The correlation for Manila and Taipei is somewhat mixed. With the smallest target population, Manila's results show it to be far less successful than Taipei in meeting air quality goals. Perhaps, the difference in numbers of vehicles between Manila and Taipei may not be that significant; but what is more likely is that for these two cities, other variables may be mediating the relationship between size and compliance.

#### *Resources of Regulating Agency*

The resources of the regulating agency are widely perceived to be crucial in gaining compliance. Testing this hypothesis is relatively straightforward for Taipei and Delhi because in both cities, a single agency is responsible for implementing and evaluating compliance to vehicular emission regulation—the Environmental Protection Bureau (EPB) in Taipei and the local Pollution Control Board in Delhi (DPCB). In contrast, authority to apprehend violators of vehicle emissions in Manila is diffused among a number of public agents with constantly shifting mandates—the LTO, MMDA traffic aides, and local police and highway patrols. Although more recent data are not available, the data reported by Tang et al. (1998) for Delhi and Taipei are still relevant. Taipei's EPB had the largest number of employees among similar agencies in Taiwan and its budget of roughly US\$68 million in 1997 was the biggest in the entire country. In contrast, the DPCB's annual budget for 1997-1998 was about US\$450,000 and its enforcement staff consisted of three Senior Environmental Engineers, 25 Junior Engineers, and 12 Assistant Engineers (Tang et al. 1998). While it is safe to assume that both budget and staff have grown in both EPB and DPCB, it is also realistic to presume that the difference in absolute amounts probably remains comparable to 1997-1998 levels. When the respective budgets are compared to the total number of vehicles in each city, it is clear that the resources of DPCB are stretched much too thinly compared to those of EPB for ensuring effective compliance by motorists.

Inasmuch as authority is clearly a form of agency resource, then Manila's experience provides a basis for developing another hypothesis for studying the relationship between compliance and the characteristics of the regulating agency. It is suggested that if authority for ensuring compliance is dispersed to several agencies, the level of compliance will likely be low even if the aggregate resources of all involved agencies may be substantial.

Lastly, the Delhi experience affirms a separate issue related to the commitment of actors which Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) identified as another condition in regulatory agency critical for attaining compliance. Given that most of the specific vehicular emissions control components in Delhi were mandated by the Indian Supreme Court, rather than generated in-house by DPCB staff and experts, it becomes understandable why the Delhi government itself has been delaying implementation of some of these programs. In other words, enforcement, and, thus, compliance, will likely be low if regulating agencies feel no ownership over significant parts of regulations that they are tasked to implement.

### *Economic Climate*

The relationship of target groups' compliance with business climate can occur in two principal ways, as a positive correlation between healthy business climate and compliant behavior and as differing responses of the same target population in areas with contrasting economic conditions (Cohen and Kamieniecki 1991). The coerciveness of the regulatory device can also be affected by economic conditions because the most coercive activities are often the most expensive to administer and are thus implied to be less likely to be employed by poorer states or in times of limited government revenues (Cohen and Kamienicki 1991).

If the per capita disposal income in each city (*Asiaweek* 2001) reflects economic wealth, then a rather different picture emerges from one predicted by the framework. Table 1 shows the cities can be ranked in the order of Delhi (US\$450), Manila (US\$1,641), and Taipei (US\$12,400) in terms of increasingly higher economic wealth. When this is compared to the propensity to utilize coercive tools (Table 3), the poorer cities of Delhi and Manila employ comparable, if not similar, number of coercive mechanisms as well-off Taipei. In fact, the reverse relationship occurs, less coercive and presumably less expensive market-based approaches are more frequently used by richer Taipei than poorer Delhi and Manila. While this correlation is admittedly crude, a few interesting factors may be the appropriate explanation. First, regulators may not even consider

the general economic climate when planning to institute command-and-control measures as predicted by the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) model. In the Delhi case, however, where most of the coercive programs were put in place by the Indian Supreme Court in response to perceived public need and apathy from the assigned regulators, the results do not negate the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) framework because other conditions in the regulated community came into play. A second item worth considering is that less advanced countries may actually tend to rely on command-and-control measures not out of cost consideration but simply out of tradition, as coercive regulation has been the historic norm in many countries. Conversely, non-coercive tools especially those based on market behavior which have been increasingly preached as more efficient solutions to environmental problems (Bryner 1997; Freeman 2003) may be more favored and conducive in societies that have reached relatively higher levels of economic development.

The relationship between the mix of coercive and non-coercive tools and the degree of compliance, postulated in hypothesis 3b, can be assessed by reference to Table 3. The fact that Taipei, which employs such a mix, has better compliance and cleaner air compared to Delhi and Manila where programs are biased towards coercive regulation supports the hypothesis that better compliance may be obtained if regulators do not rely on purely coercive means.

It is noteworthy that Taipei, which has the best air quality of the three cities, also has the oldest regulation concerning air pollution which dates back to the mid-1970s. In contrast, Delhi's current vehicular regulations were largely formulated in the early 1980s while Manila's program was put in place in 2000. If feedback is crucial in achieving higher rates of compliance, as emphasized in the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) model, then it is reasonable to expect that the older the program the more likely it can achieve regulatory goals as feedback allows corrective measures on the policy to be taken, assuming all other factors are favorable. Even so, this trend could be expected only in functional democracies where valid critiques of policies have a way of finding themselves included in subsequent policy iterations.

### **Concluding Remarks**

Analysis has shown that size of the target population and resources of the regulating agency do affect compliance according to that predicted by Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) model. The experience of Manila and Delhi provides additional insight on the theory and practice of regulatory



compliance, especially with respect to conditions in regulating agency. Where the authority to impel appropriate behavior, especially on command-and-control measures, is lodged in different public agencies, as in Manila, it is suggested that compliance is more difficult to achieve compared with where mandate is conferred in a single office. The Indian Supreme Court's activist involvement in Delhi's vehicular emissions regulation provides another modification of the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) framework. Where the regulatory programs are imposed externally on the regulating agency, loss of ownership and control by administrators of such programs is likely to promote sluggish implementation, at least initially.

Economic climate in the outside arena does affect the choice of regulatory tools but not in the direction implied by Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991). It appears that costly-to-implement coercive tools are more likely to be found in poorer nations, contrary to theoretical prediction. A contribution of this work for future investigations is to suggest that such trend may be due to: 1) regulators not weighing economic climate significantly when they plan and institute command-and-control measures, 2) reliance on command-and-control measures in Asian nations arises not out of cost consideration but due to tradition, and 3) non-coercive tools, particularly market-based incentives, may be favored and conducive only in certain societies that have reached a relatively advanced level of economic development. These propositions, however, must be squared with another finding relating choice of regulatory tools with compliance. Although limited to three case studies, the results support the idea that a healthy mix of coercive and non-coercive tools in a regulatory program has a greater tendency to achieve compliant behavior compared to reliance on restrictive tools alone or, for that matter, on market-based instruments.

Conclusions from a study of only three cities must obviously be regarded as tentative; thus, there is a need to extend the study of the vehicular emission programs in other Asian cities, democratic or otherwise, to test the general explanatory power of the Cohen and Kamieniecki (1991) framework.

### Endnote

<sup>1</sup> Euro norms refer to permissible vehicular emission levels for carbon monoxide (CO), hydrocarbon (HC) and nitrous oxides (NOx) established and being implemented in European Union (EU) countries. The norms require car manufacturers to make technical changes in their vehicles in order to reach specific emission targets by specific period. For Euro-1 (1992-1995), the standards are: 1) 2.75 kg/km for CO, and 2) 0.97 kg/

km for HC + NO<sub>x</sub>. For Euro-II (1995-1999), the standards for CO and HC + NO<sub>x</sub> are 2.20 kg/km and 0.50 kg/km, respectively (<http://www.indiacar.com/infobank/euroiii.htm>)

### References

- Antiporda, Jefferson  
2003 BF extends traffic experiment. *The Manila Times*.
- Asian Development Bank (ADB).  
2003 RETA 5937: Action Plans for Reducing Vehicle Emissions. Available at [http://www.adb.org/Vehicle\\_Emissions/reta5937.asp](http://www.adb.org/Vehicle_Emissions/reta5937.asp).
- 2001 Statistical Notes. *Asian Development Outlook 2001*. Manila: Asian Development Bank. Available at <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Books/ADO/2001/default.asp>.
- Asiaweek  
2001 Asiaweek Standard of Living Index. Available at <http://www.asiaweek.com/asiaweek/96/1025/cs3.html>.
- Bryner, Gary  
1997 Market Incentives in Air Pollution Control. In S. Kamieniecki, G.A. Gonzalez, and R.O. Vox (eds.). *Flashpoints in Environmental Policymaking*. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Center for Science and Environment (CSE)  
2003 Status of implementation of the Supreme Court order to convert public transport buses to compressed natural gas (CNG). Available at [http://www.cseindia.org/html/cmp/air/cng/cng\\_update20020304.htm](http://www.cseindia.org/html/cmp/air/cng/cng_update20020304.htm).
- Central Pollution Control Board (CBCP)  
2003a National Ambient Air Quality Standards. Available at <http://cpcb.delhi.nic.in/aaq/aaq>.
- 2003b Delhi Ambient Air Quality Data - Year 2002. Available at <http://cpcb.delhi.nic.in/bulletin/del/december2002.html>.
- Chuang, Jeff S.C.  
2001 Taiwan Motorcycle Emission Control Experience. Available at <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Events/2001/RETA5937/Hanoi>.
- Cohen, Steven and Sheldon Kamieniecki  
1991 *Environmental Regulation Through Strategic Planning*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Desai, Uday (ed.)  
2002 *Environmental Politics and Policy in Industrialized Countries*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.
- Desai, Uday  
1998 Environment, Economic Growth, and Government in Developing Countries. In U. Desai, ed. *Ecological Policy and Politics in Developing Countries*. Albany: SUNY Press.

- Duggal, Vinod K. and Gopal K. Pandey  
2002 Air Quality Management in Delhi. *Paper presented at the Better Air Quality in Asian and Pacific Rim Countries (BAQ 2002) 16-18 Dec., 2002, Hongkong.* Available at <http://www.adb.org/vehicle-emissions/IND/inuse.asp?pg=india>.
- Environmental Management Bureau (EMB)  
2003 News Release – Tricycle Owners Get Help. Available at <http://www.emb.gov.ph>.
- 2000 *DENR Administrative Order No. 2000-81, Series of 2000.* Quezon City: Philippine Department of Environment and Natural Resources.
- Environmental Protection Agency (Taiwan)  
2003 Improve Air Quality to Achieve the Targets of the National Environmental Protection Plan. Available at <http://www.epa.gov.tw/english/offices/bluesky/bluesky6.htm>.
- Freeman III, A. Myrick  
2003 Economics, Incentives, and Environmental Policy. In N.J. Vig and M.E. Kraft, eds. *Environmental Policy: New Directions for the Twenty-First Century.* Washington, DC: CQ Press.
- Iyer, Narayan  
2002 Efforts to Reduce Pollution from 2 Wheelers in India and Across Asia. *Paper presented at the Better Air Quality in Asian and Pacific Rim Countries (BAQ 2002) 16-18 Dec., 2002, Hongkong.* Available at <http://www.adb.org/vehicle-emissions/IND/inuse.asp?pg=india>.
- Land Transportation Office  
2003 Number of Registered Vehicles by Type and by MV Classification, CY 2001. Available at <http://www.lto.gov.ph/stats2006.html#sum1>
- Lieberman, Robert C.  
1995 Comment – Social Construction. *American Political Science Review*, 89(2), 437-441.
- MacMillan, Ian G. and Patricia E. Jones.  
1985 *Strategy Formulation: Power and Politics, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* St. Paul, MN: West Group.
- McSpadden, Lettie  
1997 The Courts and Environmental Policy. In J.P. Lester, ed. *Environmental Politics and Policy: Theories and Evidence*, 242-274. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Mehta, Kisan and Priya Salvi  
2001 State of Inspection and Maintenance Policy for Vehicles in Indian and Citizen Involvement. *Paper Presented at the GITE Regional Workshop on Inspection and Maintenance Policy in Asia, Bangkok, Thailand, 10-12 December 2001.* Available at <http://www.adb.org/vehicle-emissions/IND/inuse.asp?pg=india>.

- Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas  
2003 Economic Instruments for Mitigating Auto Emissions. Available at [http://petroleum.nic.in/Ch\\_16.pdf](http://petroleum.nic.in/Ch_16.pdf).
- Rogers, John  
2003 Assessment of the Pollution Under Control Program in India and Recommendations for Improvement. Available at <http://www.worldbank.org/cleanair/calasia/topics/transportap.htm>.
- Sapru, R.K.  
1998 Environmental Policy and Politics in India. In U. Desai, ed. *Ecological Policy and Politics in Developing Countries*. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Schneider, Anne and Helen Ingram  
1995 Response. *American Political Science Review*, 89(2), 441-446.  
1993 Social Construction of Target Populations: Implications for Politics and Policy. *American Political Science Review*, 87 (2), 334-347.  
1990 Behavioral Assumptions of Policy Tools. *Journal of Politics*, 52 (2), 510-529.
- Schubert, Louis  
1993 Environmental Politics in Asia. In S. Kamieniecki, ed. *Environmental Politics in the International Arena*. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Sengupta, Babu  
2001 Vehicular Pollution Control in India: Technical and Non-Technical Measure Policy. Paper presented at the *Regional Workshop on Transport Sector Inspection and Maintenance Policy in Asia, ESCAP/UN Bangkok 10-12 December, 2001*. Available at <http://www.giteweb.org/iandm/senguptapresentation.pdf>.
- Shu, Jet P.H.  
2001 Strategies to Reduce Two-Stroke Motorcycle in Taiwan. Available at [http://www.adb.org/Documents/Events/2001/RETA5937/Hanoi/documents28\\_shu.pdf](http://www.adb.org/Documents/Events/2001/RETA5937/Hanoi/documents28_shu.pdf).
- Taipei City Government  
2003 All About Taipei. Available at <http://english.taipei.gov.tw/TCG/index.jsp?recordid=116>  
Vehicle Registration. Department of Budget, Accounting and Statistics. Available at [http://w2.dbas.taipei.gov.tw/News\\_weeklyCE\\_TreeEng.asp](http://w2.dbas.taipei.gov.tw/News_weeklyCE_TreeEng.asp).
- Tang, Ching-Ping and Shui-Yan Tang  
2000 Democratizing Bureaucracy: The Political Economy of Environmental Impact Assessment and Air Pollution Fees in Taiwan. *Comparative Politics*, 33 (1), 81-99.
- Tang, Shui-Yan, Vandana Prakash, and Ching-Ping Tang  
1998 Local Enforcement of Pollution Control in Developing Countries: A Comparison of Guangzhou, Delhi, and Taipei. *Journal of Public Policies*, 18 (3), 265-282.

Tata Energy Research Institute (TERI).

2003 Supreme Court directives. Available at <http://www.teriin.org/urban/court.htm>.

United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA)

2001 State of the World Population 2001. Available at <http://www.unfpa.org/swp/2001/english/tables.html>.

Wang, Duan Jen

2001 Air Pollution Control Strategies for Taipei City. Available at <http://www.asiaair.net/org/publications/10.Taiwan.pdf>.

Wang, Juju Chin-Shou

1998 Economic Growth with Pollution: Taiwan's Environmental Experience. In U. Desai, ed. *Ecological Policy and Politics in Developing Countries*. Albany: SUNY Press.

World Bank

2003 Philippine Environment Monitor 2002. Available at <http://www.worldbank.org>.

World Health Organization (WHO)

1999 Air Quality Guidelines. Available at <http://www.who.int/peh/air/Airquality.gd.htm>.

## **HRD Reforms in the Bureaucracy**

PERLA E. LEGASPI\*

*Across the world, there is a strong call for attuning human resource development to the needs of the times. As a response, public sector reforms have been initiated by the central government and introduced by a number of public agencies in the Philippines. This article looks at the impact of Human Resource Development (HRD) reforms in two government agencies: the National Statistics Office and the Land Transportation Office. Changes pertaining to management of human resources, particularly the employees' performance, are documented and assessed. The article also examines the problems and constraints in the implementation of the reforms to draw lessons from the experience.*

### **Introduction**

The globalization process has called for paradigm shifts in governance, not only for productivity and efficiency but also for more responsiveness and relevance. There is a strong call for attuning human resource development to the needs of the times. In response to this call, public sector reforms have been initiated by the central government and introduced by a number of public agencies in the country. These reforms and changes are focused on reorganization or restructuring efforts to make the public agencies more efficient in their operations; on reengineering to make the systems and processes more flexible and customer-friendly; and on human resources development (HRD) strategies to enable the government employees to be attuned to the introduced changes and, thus, become more productive and efficient civil servants.

The implementation of reforms and changes in the public sector is replete with problems and issues most especially in regard to the changes in the quantity and quality of human resources, staffing patterns, and impact on the growth and development of the employees. These problems and issues raise questions regarding the effects and impact of restructuring and reengineering on the management and development of human resources in the public sector. To what extent have the changes

---

\*Associate Professor, National College of Public Administration and Governance, University of the Philippines Diliman.

and reforms affected the work environment? How do the changes and reforms influence and affect the motivation and performance of the employees? To what extent have the restructured or reengineered public agencies provided for the growth and development of the employees?

The study attempts to respond to the above queries. Specifically, it pursues the following objectives:

- To document the changes and reforms especially those pertaining to the management and development of human resources in the public agency;
- To assess the effects or impact of the changes and reforms on the employees' work performance, morale and motivation, and growth and development; and
- To examine closely the problems and constraints in the implementation of the introduced changes and reforms in the public agency.

### **Conceptual Framework**

The paradigm shift from the traditional model of public administration to the new public management model has brought into sharp focus a critique of the bureaucracy. The "old model of bureaucracy" emphasizes a "rule-bound" culture (Brown 2004); hierarchical and centralized structure; inflexible and unresponsive structures to the interests and concerns of the citizens; and characterized by a process of "top down" implementation which often results in inappropriate policies (Minogue 2001a). These characteristics point out the inefficiency, ineffectiveness and unresponsiveness of the bureaucratic model which necessitate a strong call for reforms in the public sector.

The emergence of the new public management model appears to respond to such call. The new model has the following characteristics that would seem to transform the government structure to a more responsive and efficient tool for service delivery and decisionmaking processes (Minogue 2001b: 21):

- Separation of strategic policy from operational policy
- Concern with results rather than process and procedure
- Orientation to the needs of citizens rather than the interests of the organization or bureaucrats

- Withdrawal from direct service provision in favor of a steering or enabling role.
- Changed entrepreneurial management culture.

The above characteristics stress the entrepreneurial type of government as espoused by Osborne and Gaebler (1992). The model focuses more on results than the process or procedure; on the steering or enabling role of the government; and on the reorientation of the bureaucracy to the needs and concerns of the clients or customers. Apparently, with the criticisms of the bureaucracy and its flawed system, the government would have to undergo a process of transformation whereby it would be able to adopt the entrepreneurial model of public management. To undergo such process, certain conditionalities have to be met. These partake of the following: 1) reorganize the civil services to reduce the size of the bureaucracy; 2) restructure and reduce the public sector through privatization; 3) introduce competition into the residual public services through contracting out of public services to the private sector; and 4) enhance efficiency and obtain "value for money" via performance management and auditing (Minogue 2001a). These conditionalities constitute the reforms needed in the public sector as emphasized in the new model of public management.

### **HRM in the Public Sector**

Evolving from the model of traditional personnel administration which is primarily concerned with the internal processes, such as recruitment, discipline, compensation, and the application of the rules and regulations of the civil service system, the new human resource management (HRM) in the public sector takes a broader and more people-focused definition of managing human resources in the organization. While it covers the domains of acquisition, selection, motivation and rewards, maintenance and development, public human resource management goes beyond all these, taking cognizance of the ever changing and dynamic external environment. Thus, it aims at marshalling the capabilities and potentials of the personnel in developing the capacity of the organization to adapt to the demands of the changing environment.

Following the principles of the new public management model, the public sector HRM has attempted to create more flexible structures and processes; restructure highly centralized public agencies via flatter management structures; grant more responsibilities and accountabilities to line managers and supervisors in the management of personnel; and implement programs of decentralization and devolution. At the job level,



the new system has introduced broader and multiskilled jobs and has stressed performance and output measures (Brown 2004).

In terms of the management of employees, the new HRM model has highlighted the capacity of the human resources in attaining performance outcomes of the public agency in accordance with the strategic direction of the organization. In other words, the new system has put emphasis on the acquisition and retaining of employees who can achieve the desired outputs and outcomes. It has relied on performance management for "workforce flexibility and productivity" (Brown 2004: 307).

There are criticisms, however, against the new system. It has been said that opportunities for career development have been lessened with the adoption of the principle of performance management for the flexibility of the employees in the work arena and productivity. The major changes in the structures of the public organizations have considerably reduced the number of staff. The restructuring has also resulted in lesser benefits and wages. The contracting out of public services to the private sector has arguably led to poorer quality of services and has undermined the role of the public servants.

Apparently, the above criticisms have led to further enquiries regarding the implications for and/or effects of the new model on the development of human resources in the public sector. The following section will try to delve deeper on the public sector reforms and their implications for human resources development.

### **HRD and Public Sector Reforms**

"Public sector reform" can be defined as "deliberate changes to the structure and processes of public sector organizations with the objective of getting them run better" (Pollitt and Bouckaert 2000: 8). There are certain organizational improvement strategies that have been used over the years to introduce changes in the structure and processes. Some of these take the form of reengineering, information technology, reorganization, empowerment, and performance measurement. Assessments made on the application of these strategies have highlighted the implications for the development of human resources in the public agency.

The concept of HRD goes beyond education and training. It implies the development of capabilities for work of all employees to enable them to become more efficient and productive members of the organization. With this definition, the various public sector reform strategies would

have effects on the development of each individual member of the organization; for instance, the downsizing process would reduce the number of the personnel and would create tensions between social expectations and job security, the provision of "safety nets" for the outplaced employees, and budgetary restrictions that may limit the range of services or the size of "safety nets" that the government may decide to offer to the displaced employees (ILO 1998).

Outsourcing could also have negative effects on managing knowledge and life-long learning. Knowledge is said to be in the heads of people and so, if employees are pushed out, then there would be knowledge problems in the organization. Information technology would not solve the problem, as employees would still need knowledge to handle it. Further, any reform that may be introduced would have implications on behavioral change. This kind of change would take some time to effect some positive or negative changes in the performance of employees.

The succeeding discussion will try to define the various reform strategies and the corresponding implications for and/or effects on the development of human resources in the work setting.

### *Reorganization*

One public sector reform assumption is that government or the bureaucracy has become very inefficient and ineffective because of its size. Others would contend that it has become bloated with so many personnel who cost much and little. This has led to the effort to reduce the size of the bureaucracy by abolishing structures or units that are seen to be non-functional in terms of the vision and mission of the organization; by merging offices or units to avoid duplication of functions and thus reduce cost; or by creating units or offices that would cater particularly to specific concerns and needs of the clients.

Restructuring of the bureaucracy could also involve decentralizing certain functions to the regional or field level to increase responsibility, accountability and responsiveness to the community.

In view of the reorganization efforts, public agencies necessarily would have to reduce the number of staff especially those who occupy positions that are declared to be redundant or non-functional in line with the redefined vision and mission of the organization. This reduction emphasizes the need for a forecast of strategic objectives that would prescribe targets for the numbers and kinds of personnel required to

perform the new and old functions of the agency. Unfortunately, experience would show that not many public agencies have made use of the strategic exercise.

The reorganization efforts could also result in the transfer or redeployment of personnel that could lead to the lowering of morale and motivation levels of the employees. Moreover, without proper preparation of the personnel to assume new positions or jobs in terms of acquisition of the necessary skills and knowledge, they could possibly end up as "square pegs in a round hole." This situation could give rise to discontent and dissatisfaction, which oftentimes could result in non-performance or poor performance of functions and responsibilities among the staff.

Restructuring could be seen as a costly exercise because the government should be ready with the provision of "safety nets" to the employees who would be displaced by the reorganization. These "safety nets" necessarily entail costs; for instance, the government could offer attractive early retirement schemes; financial incentives to leave the public sector jobs; or it could offer reemployment to the public sector in case there is a need for their services after the restructuring process.

### *Reengineering*

As defined, "reengineering" is the "process of redesigning the existing delivery processes to increase their accuracy, timeliness, and efficiency and thereby increase the stakeholder satisfaction" (Berman 2001: 330). It is called the "blank slate" approach in designing the processes in the organization. One good example of this approach is the establishment of a "one-stop shop or center" for obtaining permits for business operations. Such centers provide the clients or customers with a single point of contact and the employees are responsible for coordinating the various requests of the clients. This, in a way, provides satisfaction to the clients. Redesigning processes often result in eliminating unnecessary steps or "red tape" in decisionmaking; for instance, in the application for a driver's license or registration of a motor vehicle, only "value added" steps are required; other steps are eliminated which results in reducing the number of steps in the process.

Reengineering implies the elimination of old tasks, which necessitate the reassignment or retraining of employees for different responsibilities. Oftentimes, reengineering leads to the abolition or merger of certain departments or divisions, which in turn, leads to the reduction of staff. The employees are fearful of the resultant effects of the redesigning

processes because they might lose their jobs or they may be transferred to another kind of job that would need different skills and even new knowledge; hence, a very strong resistance to change. This concern calls for an assessment of the culture of change within the organization and for the further training of supervisors or managers for the implementation of the reengineering efforts.

### *Information Technology (IT)*

IT is common and needed in a modern organization. The application of IT is presumed to improve organizational performance by "increasing the speed of transactions; enhancing electronic access of stakeholders to agencies; reducing the cost of data storage, access, and utilization; and facilitating linkage among other databases in and between agencies" (Berman 2001: 331). The utilization of new technologies in the organization requires the upgrading of technical capabilities of the employees. Many personnel resist learning new technology because they are far more comfortable with their old or traditional approaches. Besides, they see no need to apply new approaches when they are successful in performing their own jobs.

Another implication is the acquisition and retention of technical personnel who are also IT professionals. It is recognized that public organizations need the services of these professionals. But due to the limited range of salary levels in the government, it becomes difficult for a public agency to recruit and retain their services. The public agencies usually lose them to the private sector that offers higher levels of salary.

### *Empowerment*

This is defined as "the process of increasing responsibilities while holding employees accountable for outcomes" (Berman 2001: 334). The empowering process is also recognized to be developmental in the sense that the employees would learn how to accept responsibilities and be held accountable for whatever consequences would result from the process. It has wide-range implications for management because supervisors have to learn how to delegate responsibilities to their subordinates. This means giving up certain decisionmaking responsibilities. In effect, both supervisors and subordinates must be trained in the empowerment processes where emphasis is made on the "consequences" rather than "commands" (Berman 2001).

The public agency may have to establish certain mechanisms for the empowerment processes; for instance, some public agencies have created committees where employee representatives sit in and participate in making certain decisions such as those concerning recruitment, selection and promotions of personnel. The mechanism could also be through partnership with the employees' union or association.

### *Performance Measurement*

It is recognized that performance measurement increases accountability of employees most especially those in the managerial level. Performance measurement flows from the strategic plan of the agency where numerical standards are set and processes are established for measuring performance. At the employee's level, performance appraisal is done with the supervisors where both look at the activities of the employee in relation to the attainment of the goals and objectives of the department or division. What is important is that both manager and employee agree to the standards set and processes established to measure performance at the agency and employee level. This agreement implies the full participation of the employees in the strategic planning exercise where goals and objectives are established that serve as the bases for measuring performance.

The above improvement strategies strongly convey the fact that the employees or the human resources of the public agency take center stage in the public sector reforms. The introduction of reforms and changes has various implications for HRD that have to be addressed to be successful in the efforts toward improving quality and productivity in the public service.

The succeeding sections of this article will showcase two public agencies that have undergone restructuring and reengineering to improve public services. The cases will present and discuss the changes and reforms in the management and development of the employees as a result of the restructuring or reengineering exercise as well as the application of information technology in the systems and processes. The cases will also try to show the effects of these improvement strategies on the work environment particularly on the employees' motivation, morale and job satisfaction. The problems and constraints in the implementation of the reforms and changes are likewise tackled in the discussions.

The last section will summarize and highlight the important implications and effects of the introduced reforms and changes on HRD. Some lessons will be drawn from the implementation of the public sector

improvement strategies, particularly in the area of the development of human resources.

### **Public Sector Reforms: The NSO and LTO Experiences**

The study made use of the case study method. It studied the experiences of two public agencies that deliver frontline services: the National Statistics Office (NSO) and the Land Transportation Office (LTO). The NSO has undergone restructuring that took effect in 2000, while the LTO has introduced computerization in its systems and processes since 2001. To obtain insights on the effects of the implemented improvement strategies, personal interviews were conducted with the division chiefs and personnel who were affected by the restructuring: those who were retained in their "old" positions or jobs; those who were transferred or redeployed; and those who were promoted and whose positions were upgraded. A number of clients or customers were also interviewed to get their perceptions about the quality of services being provided by the said agencies. The interviews were all conducted in the central offices of the two agencies.

On the part of the NSO, 12 division chiefs were interviewed; 27 employees out of the 30 who were identified to be affected by the reorganization were also interviewed; and 20 clients, randomly interviewed as they transacted business in the "Serbilis Center" along East Avenue, Quezon City. In the case of the LTO, five out of seven division chiefs were interviewed (two were out in the field during the conduct of the interviews); 19 out of the 20 employees who were identified to be affected by the reforms were also interviewed; and 20 clients who transacted business in the central office on East Avenue were randomly interviewed.

Reports and documents relevant to the reforms were looked into including the issuance of administrative and executive orders and accomplishment reports of the agencies.

### **The Case of the National Statistics Office**

The National Statistics Office (NSO) is the major statistical agency of the central government. Placed under the administrative supervision of the National Economic and Development Authority by virtue of Executive Order No. 149, dated 28 December 1993, it is responsible for collecting, compiling, producing, publishing, and disseminating general-purpose

statistics. It is also mandated to carry out and administer the Civil Registry Law as provided for in Act No. 3753, dated February 1931.

Recognizing the critical role of the NSO in the provision of quality statistical products and services for planning, policy formulation, and decisionmaking, the Office of the President issued Executive Order (EO) No. 5 dated 29 July 1998, to strengthen the organizational setup of the agency with the end in view of making the organization more efficient and effective in delivering its mandated functions. Based on the Executive Order, the reorganization of the agency focused on the following:

- Delegation of more substantive and administrative functions to the field offices to transform them from mere data collection arms to statistics-producing and civil registration units;
- Refocusing the functions of the central office units towards developmental planning, design and analysis of designated statistical activities, and other surveys and statistical studies requested by government agencies and international organizations; and
- Greater use of information technology to facilitate data processing and analysis and promote easy access to statistical information by interested government, private and international organizations, and the general public.

#### *The Restructuring of the NSO*

The NSO is headed by an Administrator. Before the reorganization, the agency had two line departments which were responsible for the implementation of the yearly plans and programs: Industry and Trade Statistics and Household Statistics. With the reorganization, the number increased to five with the addition of three departments, namely, the Information Resources Department, Civil Registration, and Administration Department.

At the field level, some functions have been decentralized, such as the conduct of surveys in the local areas; the processing of the data; and the dissemination of results through press releases and publications. The decentralized functions would enable the field units to perform more substantive roles in producing statistical data and in acting as civil registration servicing units. To date, there are 16 regional offices, 79 provincial offices, and 254 district offices. Part of the decentralization

efforts of the NSO is the reorganization of the NCR Regional Office into two divisions: the Statistical Operations Division and the Civil Registry and Information Management Division. The region is also divided into six district offices. Apparently, the reorganization would enable the NCR to assume full responsibility for generating some data, which used to be produced by the central office. These data include import and export statistics, and consumer price index and domestic trade statistics for Metro Manila.

*The Changes in the Personnel Complement.* At present, the NSO has a total personnel complement of 2,755. Out of this number, there are 957 employees (or about 34.74 percent) in the central office and 1,798 (or 65.26 percent) in the field offices. In addition to the regular employees, there are 386 casual employees, 186 of whom are in the central office and 200 in the field offices. The NSO also hires contractual personnel whenever there are special projects to be undertaken. To date, there are 530 contractual employees, 401 of whom are in the central office and 129 in the field offices (NSO Plantilla of Personnel CY 2004; Personnel Complement Report, CY 2004). The figures show that the central office has more special projects to implement than the field offices. That the field offices have more employees than the central office can be attributed to the fact that there are 16 regional offices, 79 provincial offices, and 254 district offices.

As a result of the implementation of EO No. 5, there have been personnel movements through of transfer or redeployment to other offices as well as changes in the plantilla positions. Thirty five employees (34 in the central office and 1 in the regional office) have been transferred and 1,027 have been redeployed (666 in the central office and 361 in the field offices). About 205 plantilla positions have been upgraded and 132 have been reclassified. Out of the unfilled positions, the agency created 14 new positions (NSO Plantilla of Personnel CY 2004; Personnel Complement Report CY 2004). The figures indicate that there is no decrease in the total number of personnel.

*The Changes in the Systems and Procedures.* The primary change that took place in the agency is the introduction of information technology into the work area. Basically, computer software programs were developed to facilitate the processing of papers and transactions particularly in the Civil Registration Department; for instance, the so-called DVSS 2000, a software program was introduced in line with the implementation of EO No. 5. This program intended to improve the decentralized processing of civil registry documents and generate important vital statistics particularly at the provincial offices.



Accompanying the above is the change in the system of data encoding. Some personnel used to record data manually. Now, data encoding is done through the computers. This is also the case for survey processing. It used to be done manually but with the use of computers, processing of data became a lot easier, especially in the field offices.

The measurement of work accomplishment has been noted to be altered particularly in the Business and Services Statistics Division. Before the reorganization, work accomplishment was measured in terms of the number of documents done. Now, accomplishment is gauged through the value of data, the time of transfer of the data, and whether the maximum number of released data is met.

*The Changes/Reforms in the HRM Structure and Systems.* The HRM Division plays a critical role in the restructuring of the organization. It is expected to lay the groundwork for the changes to take place most especially in terms of the effects or impact on the employees; thus, it is expected to upgrade and develop the capabilities of the work force not only for the work changes but also for the sustainability of the changes to further strengthen the effectiveness of organizational operations.

*The Changes in the Organizational Structure of the HRMD.* Before the implementation of EO No. 5, the HRM Division had two sections, namely, Personnel Management Section and Personnel Development Section. The former took charge of all the management of personnel processes, such as the recruitment and selection of employees, performance evaluation, and personnel records keeping. The staff also served as Secretariat to the Personnel Selection Board. The latter section was responsible for the implementation of development activities for all employees. It was in charge of the planning and implementation of all training programs and seminars designed to upgrade the skills of the personnel.

The Division, headed by a Human Resource Management Officer V and assisted by a Human Resource Management Officer IV, has a total of 32 employees, including the two HRM Officers.

After the implementation of EO No. 5, the number of sections in the Division has increased from two to four. The additional two sections are: the Human Resource Management Information System Section (HRMIS) and the Health Services Section (HSS). In recognition of the big role of management information system in decisionmaking processes in the area of human resource management, the said section has been established. The latter section is not a new section having been a part of the

Administrative Services Division before the implementation of the reorganization of the agency. Perhaps, its transfer could be due to the fact that the provision of health services to the employees is considered to be part of the benefits and privileges given to the employees, a function of which is a major responsibility of the Division.

The major responsibility of the HRMIS is the computerization of personnel data. The computerization system includes four modules: the personnel information, plantilla, attendance, and archiving and scanning images of inactive files. To date, the computerization of personnel data and records is still an ongoing activity, including archiving and scanning of inactive files.

With additional sections, the total number of personnel in the Division has increased from 32 to 43, including two casual employees in the HRMIS.

As claimed by the Division Chief, the important change that has taken place in the Division is not so much the expansion of the units but more the importance given to the human resource management functions. The said functions have been strengthened by the computerization of personnel data and by the top management support given to the training and development of personnel.

*The Changes in the HRM Systems/Procedures.* With restructuring, the NSO has raised the qualification standards for the position of Statistician. Based on the CSC standards, the person who occupies the position of Statistician 1 should at least be a college graduate. The NSO has raised this requirement by preferring graduates of BS Math or Statistics or someone who has completed 18 units of Math, Economics, or Statistics.

Meanwhile, the mechanism for the recruitment and selection of personnel has not been changed. It is still the Personnel Selection Board that deliberates on matters relative to the recruitment and selection of personnel; however, its membership has undergone some changes. Before the restructuring, the Board was chaired by the Deputy Administrator and co-chaired by the HRM Division Chief. The members included the two department heads, all division chiefs, and two representatives from the rank and file who were selected by management. In line with the implementation of EO No. 5, the Director of the General Administration Department became the Co-Chair of the Board and the members include all the directors of the departments, the HRM Chief, and two representatives from the employees union. This serves to assure that the

voice of the employees association would be heard in the Board through their own chosen representatives.

In regard to the recruitment and selection process, one major change is the entrance examination given to applicants. Before reorganization, applicants were not subjected to an entrance examination. The examination includes the application of psychological or personality tests to the applicants. This procedure ensures the entrance to the service of technically and psychologically prepared applicants.

Before reorganization, the recruitment and selection process was centralized. The regional and field offices were not responsible for the said process. With restructuring, the field offices are now given the responsibility to recruit personnel and to select service contractors needed for their projects. Because the process has been decentralized, the said process has been shortened. According to the HRM Division Chief, it used to take about five months to recruit and select personnel. With the changes in place, the process now takes only seven days.

The promotion system has also been noted to have a basic change in the announcement of vacant positions for promotion purposes. The process of announcing vacant positions was limited before restructuring such that employees were not properly informed of existing vacancies. With restructuring, interviewed employees reveal that the system has improved. Vacancies are now properly announced through various mechanisms such as memos and bulletin boards within the NSO. Most employees get to know of the vacant positions.

Many of the employees claim that before reorganization, they did not have to apply to fill up a certain position for the purpose of promotion. Now, one has to apply if one desires to be promoted. Before the reorganization, it was a policy to put insiders in vacant positions before outsiders could be considered. This policy has been changed. Employees from NSO have to apply and have to compete with those coming from other agencies or private organizations. Seniority is no longer considered as a major factor in determining who should be promoted. In other words, promotion has become competitive. Insiders are given preference if they are equally qualified as the outsiders.

The above policy has elicited mixed reactions from the employees. For some, this is good for the organization because the employment of personnel from the outside would infuse new ideas and perspective to the agency; however, to a number of personnel, this procedure does not provide opportunities for employees to move up the hierarchy considering that promotion opportunities in the government sector are very limited.

As regards performance evaluation, the NSO makes use of the CSC model. The criteria have not changed. Based on interviews, some employees agreed that the performance rating is influenced by the personal relationship between the supervisor and the employee; thus, the rating that one gets would depend on how close he/she is to the supervisor. This has served as a demotivating factor to them.

Other employees opine that many employees have tried to improve their performance rating due to the incentives that they get from management. The period during the implementation of EO No. 5 saw the installation of the Program on Awards and Incentives for Service Excellence or PRAISE (based on CSC policy). This program gives financial rewards or plaques of recognition to employees who excel in their performance at the central and field offices; for instance, they give awards to the "Best Improved Performance," "Best in Attendance," and "Best Office in terms of Productivity," at the end of the year; but then the sustainability of the program has been affected by the availability of funds. If the NSO does not have funds for the said purpose, then no financial awards would be given. Somehow, this has affected the motivation of employees to work harder for such awards.

#### *Training and Development Activities*

The NSO has the Personnel Development Committee that deliberates on matters relative to training and development. Although the HRM Division prepares the training designs and conducts training needs analysis to determine the kind of training to be undertaken, the Committee reviews the list of training courses and programs to be undertaken and the list of participants in the said programs or courses.

The membership of the Committee has expanded after the reorganization of the agency. Still chaired and co-chaired by the Deputy Administrator and the HRM Division Chief respectively, the Committee now includes all the department directors and two representatives of the employees union. Again, instead of representatives from the rank and file who are selected by management, the employees association is given the opportunity to select from its members who would sit in the Committee to represent their own interests.

When asked about the changes in the developmental activities that have been introduced after the reorganization, most of the division chiefs agreed that there are more opportunities for training and scholarships for the personnel most especially those involved in statistics and information

technology. Nevertheless, every employee is given an equal opportunity to apply for scholarship or study grants. There are more personnel now who can go on study leave to pursue further studies. All the department and division heads can nominate their staff to attend the scheduled training activities.

Moreover, one big change that has been introduced is the provision of more opportunities for the employees in the regional and field offices to attend training courses or seminars. According to the HRM Division Chief, before reorganization, seldom could an employee from the regional and field offices attend training courses and seminars. They could not compete with the employees from the central office for availment of study grants or scholarships. As a result of the reorganization, participants in training programs are distributed from the entire field and regional offices. The field employees also have the chance to apply for scholarships and study grants.

#### *Effects or Impact of the Restructuring/ Changes on the Employees*

The changes in the organizational structure and the systems and procedures in the NSO have produced both positive and negative effects on the work performance of the employees; on their work accomplishments; on their work morale; and on their level of job satisfaction.

*On Work Performance.* From the perspective of some division chiefs, the upgrading of their units to a division level does not change the units' functions. The employees still have the same set of responsibilities. Although there are additional workloads, the nature of their job remains the same; thus, their level of work performance remains the same.

Nonetheless, some employees view the additional workload negatively. In the case of IT personnel for instance, the increased volume of work has not resulted in the increase of salary. They perceive that their salary is not commensurate with their work.

On the positive side, some division chiefs see the restructuring as a factor in developing the expertise of employees; for instance, in the Census Planning and Operations Division, the employees get more focused on the planning and operations, which used to be separate. As they get more focused on their job, they tend to develop their expertise. In turn, this improves their job performance.

Some heads of divisions also see the restructuring as a positive variable in deepening the commitment of employees. To them, this is a result of the functions becoming more defined and with more direction. In the case of the HRM Division for instance, the functions of the employees have become more defined in terms of personnel management and development. According to the division chief, with more defined functions and direction, the employees tend to know more about their jobs and in the process, become more committed to their work.

To many of the employees, the computerization of the systems and procedures has reduced and lightened their workload. Although the workload of some employees has been increased, their work has become much easier and faster with the use of computer programs. In the case of the Civil Registry and Information Management Division in the NCR, the employees felt that their research work has become faster most especially with an e-library in place. This means that there is an improved system of researching data and documents; thus, resulting in improvement of work.

In the case of employees who have been reassigned or redeployed to other divisions or departments, some of them claim that they had difficulty in adjusting to their "new" work environment. Initially, they were not given enough work so that their work performance suffered. Others mentioned that they were given new and added responsibilities; however they had a hard time coping with the new job. Since they could hardly finish their work on time, their job performance was affected; but, as they become acquainted with their jobs, and learned new skills and knowledge, performing a new task has a positive effect after all. Moreover, some opine that their transfer to a new job has given them the opportunity to perform better because of the new responsibilities given them.

To certain employees whose position titles were changed and positions upgraded, however, the new and additional duties and responsibilities (such as the position title of clerk which was changed to inspector) of the "new" job did not sit well with them. For one, their training background did not match the requirements of the "new" job. They felt that they were not ready for the "new" job because of their feeling of inadequacy due to their different training and educational background.

*On Work Accomplishments.* In terms of office work productivity, most of the division chiefs are agreed that the computerization of the systems and procedures has resulted in higher work productivity of the divisions. Although there has been more workload, work completion has been made faster and more efficient, resulting in more accomplishments.

While decentralization of certain functions to the field offices would mean less workload on the part of certain departments in the central office, the experience of the concerned offices, particularly the Statistical Sampling and Operations Division, would show otherwise. The personnel in this division have to redo the work outputs of the field offices because the field personnel seem to lack the needed technical skills to perform the assigned tasks. This suggests the lack of technical training of field personnel. On the part of the central office employees, this is an additional work but necessarily an additional work output for the office.

Majority of the interviewed employees claim that they have accomplished more work after the reorganization and the computerization of the systems and procedures. Because their position titles have been changed and their positions upgraded, they have been given more tasks and responsibilities to perform. This means that they have more work to do. In effect, this has brought their work productivity to a higher level than before the changes. Those who were transferred to other divisions also stated that they have more workload. This has resulted in increased productivity. Only about two of the interviewed employees who were transferred to other divisions thought that their work output has not changed at all.

*On Work Motivation.* To some division chiefs, the upgrading of their sections to a division level has not affected at all the motivation of the employees in the work place. This is due to the fact that the functions of said sections have not basically changed after becoming a division during the reorganization. To them, their sections were already functioning as a division before the restructuring. Apparently, the structural change has not raised the level of motivation among the employees.

Some division chiefs, however, believe that motivation is a function of increased responsibilities. They noticed among their employees that the increased responsibilities given to them have increased their self-confidence in performing their assigned tasks. To the employees, the increased responsibilities also mean opportunity to give inputs and suggestions to improve work performance. In turn, this has increased the level of their motivation.

In addition to the increased responsibilities as a motivating variable, the assignment of new jobs to employees has motivated them to work harder and produce more. This is explained by the fact that the employees are able to build up their expertise as they perform a new set of duties and responsibilities attached to the job.

Based on the interviews, the kind of perks and benefits that an employee gets from the organization also serves as a motivating factor. According to some division chiefs, their employees are not motivated to perform well because their salaries have not been increased and there are no added benefits given them.

*On Work Morale.* The employees have mixed reactions about the effects of the structural and systems changes on their work morale. Out of the 27 employees who were interviewed, 14 (or 51.85 percent) stated that their work morale has been affected by the changes while a slightly smaller number, 13 (or 48.15 percent) said otherwise. To those employees whose positions have been upgraded and their salary levels have been increased, their work morale has improved. In effect, they consider this as a promotion (66.67 percent of the 24 respondent); however, those who were not given a promotion and were transferred to other sections or divisions were demoralized (25 percent). Those who have not been affected by the changes have the same level of work morale in the office (8.33 percent).

The level of work morale among the employees is also seen to be a function of the importance of the unit or division in achieving the objectives of the agency. According to a number of personnel especially those assigned in the mapping section, their unit is low in priority in terms of the training opportunities given them; for instance, the statisticians are given more training opportunities abroad than the cartographers who felt neglected. This feeling has given rise to discontent among them; hence, demoralization has set in.

A few of the interviewed employees state that their transfer to a new position did not motivate them to perform better primarily because they felt that they are not qualified to perform the duties and responsibilities attached to the position. They seem not to cope with the expected level of performance because of the difficulty of the job. In effect, this has considerably lowered the level of their work morale.

There are also employees who like very much their being transferred to a new or another position. Because their qualifications and background fit the requirements of the new job, they have not experienced any difficulty in coping with the demands of the new job. This has contributed to raising their level of morale in the work area.

*On Job Satisfaction.* It appears from the responses of the interviewed division chiefs that job satisfaction is a function of the responsibilities and challenges that the job offers to the employee.



According to them, the upgrading of certain sections to a division level spells out more responsibilities to handle. Their employees are challenged to perform better because they get satisfaction from their jobs with the new set of responsibilities, which to them, is recognition of the importance of their role in the division.

Some employees, however, have been affected by their transfer to other sections or divisions. They claim that their level of job satisfaction has been decreased because of the nature of the job assigned to them. Since they do not possess the required training and experience, they could not cope with the demands of the new job.

There is also the perception among the division chiefs that the transfer or redeployment of employees depended on their closeness to the power holders in the agency. This holds true in the case of personnel whose salaries were upgraded. Seemingly, they perceived such changes to be based on personalities and informal dealings with the top management and not on formal criteria. This perception has decreased the level of satisfaction among the affected personnel.

Nonetheless, the upgrading of certain divisions to a department status has provided more opportunities for development of certain employees, which to a large extent, has considerably increased their level of job satisfaction. For instance, the group of IT personnel has been given more scholarships and training abroad. Likewise, due to their developed expertise in the office, they get consultancy jobs that are allowed by the NSO. They can do their consultancy work and at the same time perform their assigned tasks in the office. This adopted policy of the office has contributed to increasing the level of job satisfaction among the IT personnel.

The equitable distribution of workload among the employees is also a factor that has affected job satisfaction. Based on the interviews, most of the employees do not mind the increased workload but they do mind a lot the inequitable distribution of workload. They feel satisfied with their work if employees holding similar positions are given the same workload as they have.

The job satisfaction of employees can also be traced to the faster and improved quality of services. Some employees stated that they are satisfied with their job because the waiting time of the clients has been cut short and that their queries have been answered promptly; their division does not have work backlogs; and they get satisfied with their new or increased set of responsibilities because of the challenges they face in the performance of their jobs.

Certain employees, however, contend that they are not satisfied with their jobs because their salaries are not commensurate to the duties and responsibilities that they perform. At times, they get overloaded but they do not get compensated for the extra work that they do.

In summary, majority of the interviewed division chiefs (10 out of 12 or 83.33 percent) and a large number of the employees (24 out of 27 or 88.89 percent) believe that the introduced changes in the work environment have positively affected their level of job satisfaction.

#### *Problems and Constraints in the Implementation of the Restructuring Plan*

The implementation of the restructuring plan brought about certain changes in the organizational structure, functions and systems and procedures. To the division chiefs, these changes affected the employees the most. Although consultations were held among the employees to discuss the plan and meetings and workshops were conducted to explain the changes particularly in regard to the new functions of the units or divisions, still, the employees were seen to be resistant to the changes. The fear of the innovations or changes introduced to the work design, work environment and work relationships caused strong resistance. To the employees who have been with NSO for quite sometime, the mere transfer of office location is stressful. It becomes even more stressful if they are given new assignments and functions.

Apparently, the dialogues and meetings conducted did not clearly discuss the criteria for the selection of employees who would be transferred or redeployed. Based on the interviews, the employees were not properly informed about the criteria for selecting employees to be transferred or redeployed. This added more to the negative reaction of the employees to the reorganization of the agency.

The resistance is also strong in terms of the exposure of the employees to new technology. The more "senior" staff members in the office were resistant to use the new technology of computers because they have been used to do their work manually. This poses a problem in preparing them for the new functions they have to perform.

In addition to the resistance to the application of new technology in the work setting, the employees stated that the management did not provide more computers to the staff, which is a big constraining variable in preparing them for the application of the new technology.

Another major concern raised by the staff in the reorganization process is the preparation of the staff to hold new functions and responsibilities. Apparently, the management did not equip the staff with the needed skills to enable them to perform their new jobs better. In other words, no training was conducted on their new functions and responsibilities. This is especially true in regard to the decentralized functions to the field offices. While the decentralization of some functions, e.g., conduct of surveys in the local areas, processing and analysis of data, and dissemination of results, is a good move towards strengthening the field offices, most of the field staff are not quite prepared for the performance of such functions. The field staff members contend that they experience work overloads because they still have to review the completed tasks of the field staff. This observation implies that they are not well-prepared for the assumption of new and additional functions.

To some personnel, however, the reorganization has brought forth positive changes. A number of plantilla positions was upgraded and position titles changed. There was no layoff of personnel. Some were transferred to other units where their knowledge and skills were deemed to be more needed; however, some employees complained that these changes, most especially those pertaining to the upgrading of positions, benefited the division chiefs and the regional statistical officers more than the ordinary employees. The position titles of some division heads and regional statistical officers were changed to department directors and regional directors, respectively; thus, the salary grade levels were increased; from SG 24 to 27 (division chief to department director) and from SG 24 to SG 26 (regional statistical officer to regional director). The upgrading of positions did not apply to their assistants and the rank and file did not have salary increases. This was seen to be a constraining variable in the introduction of changes and reforms in the organization.

The biggest constraint in the reorganization process is perhaps the political will in pushing through with the changes and reforms. Seemingly, there was lack of political will since some personnel who were supposed to be transferred to or redeployed to other units or divisions stayed in their old units. Based on the interviews, some employees made some "arrangements" with the management such that they remained in their "old" positions. To many of the employees, these arrangements ran counter to the overall goals and objectives of the reorganization of the agency

#### *Clients' Perceptions on Service Delivery*

Most responses of the clients show that they avail themselves of services from the NSO in securing a copy of birth certificate (about 33

percent of the responses); a copy or validation of marriage certificate (24 percent); and the rest are on validation or authentication of birth certificate (15 percent), a copy of death certificate (13 percent), legal services (9 percent), and publications and statistical data (4 percent). Half of the respondents stated that they transact business with the agency once a year and the others, at least twice a year.

Majority of the clients (17 out of 20) believed that the NSO services have improved since the agency has undergone reorganization and its systems and procedures have been computerized. Transactions became faster and much easier most especially in the "serbilis centers;" for instance, the processing of the application for a copy of birth certificate used to take three days. Now, the copy could be secured in less than two hours. Other certificates, such as a marriage certificate can also be secured on the same day of application.

The clients also observed that the employees render service even during lunch time which is not the usual case in other frontline offices. They noticed the absence of "fixers" in the centers. This could be attributed to the reduction and simplification of the steps involved in the processing of papers. The procedures have become more systematic and are strictly followed. Also, there is a big change in the behavior of the employees towards the clients. The employees, who used to be unfriendly and unhelpful, have become more customer-friendly. They, including the security guards, are now more cordial and considerate; however, not all feedbacks were positive. A few of the clients encountered some negative experience with the employees especially to the library services of the agency. The clients claimed that the employees are not knowledgeable about the NSO's publications. The clients said that although the document or information appears in the catalogue, the employees concerned could not find the materials requested. This could mean that they are lazy to search for the needed document or, they do not know where to look for it. To the clients, the employees providing library services need further training.

### **The Case of the Land Transportation Office**

The LTO envisions a "well-developed transportation system that will play a vital role in providing more viable means of land transportation and a secured travel for transport users and commuters." It is tasked to perform the following functions:

- Inspection and registration of motor vehicles;
- Issuance of licenses and permits;

- Enforcement of land transportation rules and regulations;
- Adjudication of traffic cases; and
- Collection of revenues for the government.

With the above functions, the LTO is committed to "rationalize the land transportation services and facilities and to implement effectively the various transportation laws, rules, and regulations."

### *The Organizational Setup*

The LTO operates under the Department of Transportation and Communications (DOTC). It is headed by the Assistant Secretary who is assisted by the Executive Director in providing overall supervision and direction of all activities of the office. There are two services: the Law Enforcement Service and the Traffic Adjudication Service. Directly under the Law Enforcement Service are three divisions, namely, Intelligence and Investigation Division, Field Enforcement Division, and Traffic Safety Division. Reporting directly to the Assistant Secretary through the Executive Director are four divisions. These are the Operations Division, Management Information Division, Finance and Management Division, and Administrative Division. The office has a network of 15 regional offices that have 141 district offices, 73 extension offices, 27 licensing centers, five motor vehicle inspection service units, and ten mobile units to meet the demand for public services.

*The Changes in the Organizational Structure.* The LTO did not restructure with the implementation of the computerization project; however, it created an additional section under the Intelligence and Investigation Division of the Law Enforcement Service. This is the section on Data Control, tasked to perform the following functions: 1) receive apprehensions; 2) upload TOP (temporary operator's permit) and IRMV (impounding receipt for motor vehicle) forms; 3) encode apprehensions; 4) proofread encoded information; 5) print RSU (request for system update); and 6) monitor apprehensions made and violations committed.

The section is composed of personnel transferred from other sections/divisions of the Office. It is headed by a Supervising Land Transportation Regulation Officer and assisted by an Information System Analyst, a Computer Programmer, Statistician, and two encoders.

*The Changes in the Personnel Complement.* As of December 2004, the agency had a total number of 2,967 personnel, 380 of whom come from the central office. Out of the total figures, 2,778 are regular employees, 11

are temporary, and 178 are casual employees. The agency saw a decrease of its permanent personnel from 340 in CY 2001 to 321 in CY 2004. The same is true in the number of casual employees, which was reduced to 56 in CY 2004 from 86 in CY 2001 (LTO 2004).

The same period also saw an increased number of personnel in the regional offices. From 2440 in CY 2001, it increased to 2587 in CY 2004 (LTO 2004).

*The Computerization or IT Project and the Changes in the Systems and Procedures.* The LTO IT, or computerization project, is said to be the first government computerization project implemented nationwide under the Build-Operate-Own scheme under the Build-Operate-Transfer Law. It is designed and operationalized in tandem with the Stradcom Corporation, a private firm. The project is aimed at improving the agency's public service delivery through faster online transaction, processing of applications for motor vehicle registration and drivers' licenses; improving the agency's revenue collection; providing real time flow of information among the agency's offices nationwide; developing data warehouse on the land transportation industry; providing connectivity to other government and private information networks, including access to worldwide information network; and reducing criminal activities, such as, "carnapping," falsification of official documents and forms.

The major systems of the project are the following:

- **Motor Vehicle Registration System (MVRS)** – caters to the automation of motor vehicle registration and renewal and other motor vehicle related transactions.
- **Driver's Licensing System (DLS)** – caters to the automation of the license and permits issuance, renewal and other license or permit related transactions. It has a subsystem called the **Automated Driver's License Examination System (ADLES)**, which automates the generation of exam questionnaires, captures answers, and checks results of the written examination portion of the application for driver's license.
- **Law Enforcement and Traffic Adjudication System (LETAS)**– automation of transactions of clearance issuance, case settlement and setting of alarms of the LTO. It has a subsystem called the **Traffic Violation System (TVS)** that enables field officers to verify motor vehicle and driver's license information using a handheld device.

- **Manufacturers, Assemblers, Importers and Dealers Reporting System (MAIDRS)** – automation of reports submitted to the LTO by manufacturers, assemblers, importers and dealers, containing information such as importation, manufacturing data and number of stocks.
- **Revenue Collection System (RCS)** – automation of the payment process along with its report consolidation and generation of the LTO.

Aside from the above systems, there are other systems that have to be developed further under the project. These include Human Resource Management System, Integrated Procurement and Disbursement Management System, Inventory Management System, and General Ledger System. So far, the first three systems, the MVRS, DLS, and LETAS, are being implemented by the agency.

It is contended that the benefits of the computerization project lie in the improvement of the quality of service being provided by the LTO. This improvement means faster and easier processing of transactions by the public. In particular, the transaction time being spent on motor vehicle registration would be reduced from 4-8 hours to 1-2 hours; on driver's license issuance, from 3-6 months to 1 hour or less; and on traffic violation settlement, from 8 hours to 1 hour or less.

*The Changes in the HRM Systems.* The LTO has a small unit in charge of the human resource management functions. It is a section under the Administrative Division, mandated to perform the following functions: (1) provide technical assistance to the planning, formulation, development and administration of comprehensive personnel programs and activities for the office; (2) be responsible for the conduct of judicious and systematic recruitment, selection and placement of personnel by providing the proper guidelines and policies in selection and promotion; (3) prepare and act on all matters regarding personnel actions, such as, appointments, leaves, transfers, movements, separation, retirement, discipline and other related personnel actions; (4) keep, maintain, safeguard, prepare all personnel records and reports; and (5) plan, develop, and conduct comprehensive training programs, and activities that will enhance and improve employees' knowledge, skills, and aptitude.

The section is composed of nine staff members headed by a Human Resource Management Officer (HRMO) IV. Four HRM Officers and one HRM Assistant assist the Chief of Section. Two clerks help out in the paperwork and a Utility Worker maintains the cleanliness of the office.

Interviews with the section chief and the employees reveal that not much has changed as far as the HRM systems in the office are concerned. According to the section chief, the processes followed regarding recruitment, selection and promotion of personnel have not changed before and after the implementation of the computerization project. They follow the CSC rules and regulations.

To date, the office still follows the Merit Promotion Plan formulated in 1990. Every employee can apply for existing vacancies as long as they are qualified. Nonetheless, the office emphasizes one important criterion, that is, the applicant has to come from the division or section where the vacant position exists. An employee who gets detailed to other divisions or sections has less opportunities to be promoted.

The Personnel Selection Board had already been in existence even before the implementation of the computerization project; however, its composition has been changed. According to the personnel section chief, the Board was constituted without proper guidelines in previous administrations. With the new administration, especially after the computerization project, proper guidelines have been instituted and observed. Before, the Board was composed of the Executive Director as Chair, the Administrative Division Chief as Vice-Chair, the Management Information Division Chief, Finance Division Chief, representative of the Assistant Secretary, President of the employees union, and representative from the rank and file employees as members. To date, the Board has the Assistant Secretary as Chair, and the personnel section chief, chief of the division where the vacancy occurs, employees' union representatives from the first and second level employees as members. Apparently, the inclusion of the personnel section chief as member of the Board speaks of the importance of the role of the said section in the performance of the recruitment, selection and promotion functions.

Some change has been noted in the selection and promotion of personnel, nonetheless. It is said that before, the Assistant Secretary did not conduct interviews of the applicants. She just made her decision based on the recommendation of the Board. Now, she prefers to be an active participant in the process. She sees to it that she interviews the applicants or candidates for promotion from the list submitted by the Board to ensure that only the best qualified and competent applicants are taken into the agency and that only the most deserving employee gets to be promoted. To many employees, the conduct of final interviews by the Asst. Secretary is a good sign that every employee would be given a fair chance to be promoted based on merit and that the agency would be able to recruit more technically prepared employees.



An important change that has taken place in the recruitment, selection and promotion of personnel is the decentralization of such functions to the regional offices. The Regional Directors are now given the power and authority to appoint and select personnel for promotion at the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> levels except for the division chief position. This is a good indication of delegation of authority to the regional offices.

Interviewed employees indicate that the established rules and regulations and processes regarding the recruitment, selection and promotion of personnel were not strictly followed before the implementation of the computerization project. The so-called "palakasan system" was rampant where employees who were close to the power holders would get more opportunities for promotion. And applicants who have relatives in the office could easily get in. Procedures are perceived to have been strictly followed and standards have become more rigid after computerization; for instance, the agency recruits more employees who are knowledgeable and skilled in information technology. Applicants now go through the process of interviews, examinations, and final interview with the Assistant Secretary.

Although some respondents perceived that the systems and processes have improved, a number of employees still raise questions regarding the procedures most especially those concerning promotion. They contend that vacant positions are not properly published. If ever the personnel section publishes the vacancies, most likely the vacant positions are already filled up. They believe that the criteria for promotion are not strictly followed, and those detailed or reassigned personnel are at a disadvantage because they do not get the chance to be promoted. Also, some of the employees argue that because the criteria for promotion are not strictly followed, management gets too much discretion in deciding who gets promoted.

The employees claim that they were given incentives before such as the medical insurance. Due to financial constraints experienced by the agency, the medicards issued to employees were taken away. The employees from the Law Enforcement Service receive awards for good performance, such as, an employee who has the most number of apprehensions, the highest percentage increase of collections done in a month, and the highest percentage increase in terms of volume of transactions. Employees who are low performers are given the so-called "Kalabasa" award. Employees strive to work hard and perform better to avoid being given this award. With regard to awards for good performance, some employees from the regional and district offices say that these awards are just given to the employees in the central office. They do not receive such kind of incentives at the regional level.

*Training and Development Activities*

The Management of Change Committee performed the task of "role mapping" where it identified the processes and the personnel who would do the specific functions and who would be involved in certain processes during the implementation of the computerization project; thus, the Committee identified the number of personnel for each function or process and the kind of training needed to be able to perform such assigned functions or processes. To complete a process, a district office for instance, should have at least six personnel.

With "role mapping," each employee has been given training on how to go about his/her job in the whole process of the computerization of systems in the office. The training centered on office automation (word, excel and powerpoint); introduction to computer system; MS outlook; core applications such as driver's licensing system, motor vehicle registration system, and law enforcement and traffic adjudication system; and geographical information system. Stradcom, the private firm in charge of the computerization project, has provided all of these training activities. This is part of the contract between the LTO and Stradcom to prepare the employees for the new technology.

To make the organization more efficient and orderly, Total Quality Management (TQM) was introduced in LTO. This was seen to complement the computerization of systems and procedures in the office; thus, training seminars were conducted among the employees on 5S and customer satisfaction. The ISO 9001:2000 TQM System of the LTO was launched for the issuance of licenses. This was packaged as more of streamlining the business process although it could be taken as an initiative towards lessening the opportunities for the commission of corruption in the office.

The data on training activities indicate that more training activities were conducted for the employees after the introduction of the computerization project (CY 2002-2004). Out of the 48 activities, 13 were provided by the LTO. This is an improvement from the previous period; however, many of the training courses availed of by the employees were not part of a training plan prepared by the agency. What is usually done is to send an employee to training upon invitation of other agencies. If there are no invitations, then employees are not sent for further training. This situation suggests that the agency has no prepared capability-building program for its employees.

*Effects of the Changes in the Systems and Procedures  
on the Employees*

The introduced changes in the systems have negative and positive effects on the employees as gathered from the personal interviews. The changes have affected their work performance and productivity, work motivation, and their level of job satisfaction and morale.

*On Work Performance and Productivity.* Due to the computerization of the processes and procedures at LTO, work performance has improved (100 percent on the part of division chiefs and 73.68 percent on the part of employees). The level of client satisfaction has to a certain extent been raised due to the reduction of time spent in transacting business with the clients. To most of the employees, there is a dramatic change in the processing of papers and this has made their work much easier. The workflow has become more organized, systematic and more convenient. They can easily obtain information through the use of the computers and this has made information in the agency more transparent. Furthermore, the preparation of their reports has been made much easier with the use of a report template that is readily available.

Because the work has become more convenient and much easier, the volume of transactions has correspondingly increased. For some employees, their functions and responsibilities have also expanded; for instance, they attend to certain problems in the district offices that cannot be addressed there. Nonetheless, a number of the employees contend that the increased workload has affected the quality of their work. Sometimes they get so overwhelmed with their workload that they cannot properly review and edit the documents. They are conscious of the time spent in processing papers in their workstation; thus, they approve the papers as long as they conform to the prescribed minimum requirements.

Most of the employees complain that their work performance and productivity have been affected by the problems in the system, such as computers hanging or being offline. These problems delay the processing of documents and licenses and the preparation of reports.

Some employees, however, are aware that they have become better workers because of the technology. There is some kind of a work rhythm and this has changed their attitude towards work and has improved cooperation and camaraderie among the staff. Before, they used to work only when "extra compensation" was given by the clients. Now, they work hard even without the "extras" that they used to get. They also acknowledge that the system has considerably reduced the presence of "fixers" in the office.

*On Work Morale and Motivation.* The division chiefs and employees are agreed that the changes in the systems and procedures have raised their levels of morale and motivation. The technology has brought about a "culture change" in the agency with the shift from manual to encoding through the use of computers. The application of technology in their work has increased their level of self-esteem and in effect, has motivated them to work harder.

Most of the employees view the changes positively (15 out of 19 or 78.95 percent). According to them, the computerization of the systems has boosted their work morale because it has to a large extent, increased their efficiency and effectiveness (57.14 percent of 28 responses). It has even lessened the opportunities for the commission of dishonest transactions where many employees used to get "bribe" or "grease" money from clients to hasten their business transactions (10.71 percent). As such, the changes have improved the image of the agency and made them proud of their office; however, some of them say that their motivation to work harder has been affected. This is because they experience some problems with the computers (75 percent of four negative responses). Most often the computers are offline or hang causing delays in the transactions and disappointment on the part of the client.

Comments from the employees of the Northern Licensing Center also emphasized that their levels of work motivation and morale have been increased not only due to the computerization of the systems but also because of the application of ISO standards in their office work. To them, the ISO has helped boost their morale and motivated them to work harder because of the positive feedbacks that they get from the clients; however, a few of them are demoralized because of the recent reshuffling of employees. This move by management did not sit well with them. It was viewed as a penalty instead of a reward for doing a good job based on the satisfaction of their clients.

*On Job Satisfaction.* The interviews with the division chiefs and employees reveal that the computerization of the systems and procedures has increased their level of job satisfaction (60 percent on the part of division chiefs and 84.21 percent, employees). This is due mainly to the fact that their workload has considerably decreased but their work accomplishments have increased. Moreover, the work environment has been improved due to computerization. Airconditioners were installed in the workstation for the convenience of the employees which eventually contributed in raising the level of job satisfaction of the employees. Nevertheless, a few employees still contend that they are dissatisfied with their job because their workplace has not improved unlike the other workstations.

The computerization has also resulted in the reassignment or transfer of certain employees to certain posts. This was not taken positively because the positions to which they have been transferred do not match their qualifications and skills. This makes it difficult for them to perform their jobs well; thus they get dissatisfied with their jobs.

Job satisfaction is also related to the increase in functions and responsibilities of a number of employees. With computerization comes additional functions and responsibilities on their part where they need to learn more from the process; hence, enabling them to acquire more skills. This challenge made them more confident in their work and increased their level of job satisfaction.

The job satisfaction of the employees could likewise be traced to the logistical support that they get from management. They get dissatisfied with their work when there are not enough equipment and supplies for all the employees. The computers that they use are not the latest models; thus, they are slow in processing documents.

#### *Problems and Constraints in the Implementation of the Changes*

According to the division chiefs, the most difficult part encountered by management was the attitude of the employees most especially the "old ones." There was a strong resistance to change their ways of doing things in the office. Initially, they refused to learn how to operate the computers because of the "fear" of new technology. Nonetheless, this resistance melted when they were able to acquire the necessary skills. They are now satisfied with their work as a result of the application of the new technology.

The strong resistance to change could also be traced to some employees who did not want to lose the "extra money" that they used to receive from the customers when work was manually done. They had more opportunities to receive "bribe" or "grease" money from the clients in business transactions before the computerization of the systems.

Another major constraint in the whole process of implementation is the lack of funds. Due to insufficient funds, the agency could not procure more modern computers and supplies for the use of the employees. The computers need to be updated and more printers need to be acquired to avoid delay and minimize loafing on the job. Also, poor airconditioning facilities affect the efficiency of the employees.

Apparently, some "political" interventions came into play in certain functions of the agency. Due to inadequate funds, the LTO could not establish many emission testing centers needed for the renewal of motor vehicle registration; thus, the agency has to accredit a number of testing centers owned by private entities. Unfortunately, the operations of these centers are not under the control of the LTO. When complaints arise regarding the efficiency of their operations, the agency could not just take away their accreditation because they get support from some politicians who incidentally are allied with or owners of the private firms.

#### *Clients' Perceptions on Service Delivery*

Based on the interviews with 20 clients, most of them (80 percent) go to the LTO more than once a year. They renew their driver's license (about 30 percent of the responses); renew the registration of their motor vehicles (about 23 percent); pay for violations or apprehensions (about 18 percent); register their new motor vehicles (9 percent); and get new driver's license (9 percent). Majority (55 percent) found the services on the renewal of driver's license and the registration of vehicles have been improved. According to the clients, transactions became faster when the agency computerized their systems; for instance, the renewal of driver's license that is normally processed for 2-3 hours can now be accomplished in less than an hour. The process is even faster in the license centers where it only takes about 15-20 minutes.

Others also observed that transactions are faster with the computerization of the system because of the adoption of the "first come, first served" policy. There is an order followed in transacting business with the agency where papers are assigned transaction numbers. It used to take three hours to renew registration; now, the processing time has decreased to one and a half hours.

On the other hand, 45 percent of the respondents claim that services have not improved at all. They still experience the long and tedious processing time. They keep on coming back to the office because the records could not be located. The computerization of the system should have dealt with the problem of records. Unfortunately, this is still a big problem.

Some of the clients also observed that the manual method is faster in the processing of documents and papers; for instance, the confirmation of the registration of buses used to take half day. With computerization, the processing time takes about two days. The processing of papers for the

certification of licenses is still done manually. It takes about three days before the records could be found.

Others said that the situation is still the same even if the systems or procedures have been computerized. To them, the only thing that hastens transactions in the agency is "money." During the period that the procedures were done manually, transactions were made faster because of the "grease" money given to employees. Many of the employees require the clients to pay "extra" if they want their documents or papers to be processed faster. Clients get the feeling that papers are acted upon quickly if they give some kind of "bribe" or "grease" money to the employees.

Another observation made by the clients is on the connectivity of data between and among the divisions or units in the agency. Their experience would show that the other offices could not access the data of one office; thus, the verification of data or papers would take some time. Furthermore, the computers often go offline or hang, extending the processing time. The clients have to wait for the computers to go online. With poor computers, the agency's delivery of services gets worse.

It has also been noted that there are additional steps or requirements in certain transactions; for instance, if a driver has been apprehended for certain traffic violations, he or she has to attend a seminar and take an exam before the license can be claimed. To them, these requirements delay the process most especially for those who need their license because of the nature of their livelihood.

Apparently, the computerization of the systems has not brought about only positive feedback from the clients. They claim that employees are still inefficient in their work. Perhaps, what is worth looking into is the allegation that the clients give "grease" money to the employees to facilitate the processing of their documents or papers with or without computerization.

### **Summary and Conclusions**

#### *The Reorganization of the NSO*

The structural changes in the NSO have elevated a number of units to the division level and, in the process, have introduced changes in the position titles and upgrading of certain positions in the office. Definitely, these changes have increased the work morale and motivation levels of the employees. Nonetheless, a few resented the process because they

perceived the process to be inequitable. They claimed that only the division chiefs and regional statistical officers benefited from it. This has given rise to dissatisfaction among them.

The structural changes have also brought about some changes in the functions and responsibilities attached to certain jobs. Such changes served as challenges to the employees in further improving their work performance and outputs. On the other hand, certain employees viewed their jobs as a demotivating factor because they are not technically prepared to assume their "new" jobs. The technical requirements of the "new" jobs do not match their educational background and training; hence, they could not perform better and accomplish more.

Moreover, the changes increased the workload of some employees due to the new or added functions to the existing functions of their divisions or departments. The affected employees clamored for a corresponding increase in their salary levels, commensurate to their expanded functions and responsibilities. Unfortunately, the reorganization agenda did not include increase in salary levels. Although the agency has considered the granting of financial work incentives and has started giving incentives to good performers, these are not given regularly. This has served instead as a dissatisfying factor.

What is worth noting in the reorganization of the agency is the emphasis given to the HRM functions particularly on the training and development of the employees. Certain changes in the HRM systems and procedures have taken place such as the giving of entrance examination to applicants; the proper announcement of vacant positions in the office; and the need to apply and compete with outsiders in the filling up of vacant positions for promotion purposes. These emphasize the fact that the agency has given credence to competition, professionalism and competence in the work arena as a result of reorganization.

Further, the agency has established the Personnel Development Committee, which reviews the list of training and development activities to be undertaken by the agency. The membership of the committee was expanded to include the representatives of the employees union who are selected by the union members. In a way, this empowers the employees through their participation in the deliberations of the committee.

A good effect of the reorganization is the opening of opportunities for training and scholarships for employees, most especially those involved in statistical operations and information technology where everybody is given an equal chance to apply for scholarship or study grants. In the case of the



employees from the regional offices, for instance, it used to be that the regional employees could not compete with the central office employees in availing of study grants or scholarships. They seldom attended training courses and seminars. With the reorganization, regional employees were given equal opportunities for attendance in training activities.

### *The Application of IT in the LTO*

The computerization of the systems and procedures in the LTO has not made dramatic changes in the organizational structure in the agency; however, it has affected, positively and negatively, the employees' work performance, productivity, morale, motivation and job satisfaction.

Most of the employees agree that due to computerization, their workload has been considerably reduced and their work accomplishments have correspondingly increased. To some of them, the application of the new technology has empowered them in the sense that they have acquired new skills and their functions and responsibilities have increased. The performance of additional or new functions and responsibilities has been a learning process on their part. In effect, this has contributed to raising their level of motivation and morale.

The increased level of their morale is also a function of the "culture of change" that has been effected by the computerization process. Many of the employees say that before computerization, they used to get "extra income" from the clients in facilitating business transactions. With the computerization of systems and procedures, opportunities for receiving "extra income" have been considerably lessened; however, they still work hard despite the loss of such opportunities. This "culture change" has given a new image to the agency that has resulted in increasing the self-esteem of the employees.

The job satisfaction of the personnel could likewise be traced to their improved work environment because of the provision of better airconditioning units in their workstations. Still, others complained that not all workstations have been improved which has given rise to discontent among them.

The computerization project has also provided some opportunities for the employees to acquire the needed skills to be able to apply the new technology to the work environment. A series of training activities, mostly on computer operations, was conducted for the employees. Unfortunately, such kind of training seminars are only good for the acquisition of

computerization skills. Not much has been given to fully develop their potentials as employees. In fact, there is no capability-building program for the employees. Seemingly, the growth and development of each employee has not been given much focus by the management.

The clients' perceptions on the quality of services that they have received from the agency have validated some of the employees' perceptions on the effects of the computerization on their work performance, morale, motivation, and job satisfaction. Most of the clients perceived that the services have considerably improved; however, a large number still believed that there are no improvements at all. Some of them even claimed that they get prompt action and immediate attention in facilitating transactions only when they provide "grease" money to the employee.

### *The Implementation Problems*

The NSO and LTO experiences show that the implementation of reforms and changes in the work environment encounters a number of problems. One of the major problems is the "strong resistance to change" by the employees particularly those who have been with the organization for quite some time. The reorganization and the application of new technology are threatening because they may lose their job if they get reorganized out or they may not be able to perform well because they lack the necessary skills.

As shown by the NSO reorganization, a number of employees have been transferred or redeployed. This situation has become problematic because the employees were not clear about the criteria for the transfer. They perceived that the transfer was based more on personal relationships with the top management than on objective criteria. This perception has led to discontent and lower morale among the employees. Likewise, the lack of training of the transferred employees has contributed to diminishing morale and job satisfaction.

The case of the LTO shows that the strong resistance to change has been engendered by the change in the work environment brought about by the computerization of the systems and procedures. Many of the employees used to get "extra income" before computerization; thus, any change in the work environment would affect the opportunities afforded them before the introduction of new technology.

The lack of equipment and facilities affected much the implementation of the changes in the two agencies. Apparently, not all of

the employees were given new computers in the NSO and the employees in the LTO complain about the quality of the hardware that they are using. The frequent breaking down of the computers adversely affected their efficiency in delivering services.

"Political intervention" has been cited as an implementation problem. Seemingly, this factor has affected the implementation of the introduced changes and reforms in the LTO. Akin to this is the "political will" in pushing through with the changes and reforms. It appears in the NSO case that management has not pushed through all the changes contained in the reorganization plan. Many of the employees viewed this negatively.

This article shows that public sector reforms, such as, reorganization and the application of information technology, have considerably affected the management and development of human resources. In line with the new public management model, the purported aim of the reforms is to increase the efficiency, effectiveness and responsiveness of the public agencies. The organizations' performance is much influenced by the employees' performance. In this case, the capacity of the human resources to achieve performance outcomes is essential as emphasized by the new HRM model.

As indicated in the case studies, the employees' work performance and outputs, as well as their motivation, morale and job satisfaction were affected, positively and negatively, by the introduced reforms. As such, the efficiency of the organization could be gauged through the work efficiency of the employees. This was validated by the assessment made by the clients on the quality of services delivered. In other words, the changes in the work environment can be a function of the work performance, morale, motivation, and job satisfaction of the employees.

With this interactive relationship between the organization and the employees, focus is placed on the development of the capacity of the human resources in the attainment of performance outcomes of the public agency. Apparently, the reforms introduced in the two public agencies have not centered much on developing the capabilities for work of all the employees. The training and development activities came in as secondary to the efforts of reorganization as an improvement strategy. For instance, the transferred or redeployed employees in the NSO were not given appropriate training to prepare them for their "new" jobs. Also, those who were given new functions and responsibilities were not provided the opportunity to be trained; thus, affecting their work performance and efficiency.

In the case of the LTO, the employees were given training on computer operations to prepare them for the new functions relating to the computerization of systems and procedures; however, the training was focused more on the acquisition of skills rather than on developing their potentials for further growth in the organization.

Closely related to the concern on developing the capabilities for work of the employees would be the human resource management functions of the organization such as the recruitment, selection, motivation and rewards, and promotion of personnel. The introduction of public sector reforms would have to consider introducing changes in the HRM functions for a more effective implementation of reforms. This is in line with the new HRM model, which puts premium on performance management for workforce productivity. Changes in the systems and procedures in the acquisition and selection of personnel based on merit and competence would definitely be seen as a step towards the achievement of desired outputs and outcomes by the organization. Changes in the management functions pertaining to the promotion and motivation of personnel would also be of value to the organization in terms of making broad strides towards effective performance management. Performance criteria can set the direction for greater organizational output and efficiency.

As seen from the case study of the NSO, the agency attempted to make some changes in the HRM systems and procedures; for instance, in the recruitment and selection process, a major change that was instituted was entrance examinations for applicants, including psychological or personality tests. This examination ensures the acquisition of technically and psychologically prepared personnel. Likewise, the agency made "promotion" very competitive where both insiders and outsiders are given equal chance to be employed and promoted in the agency if they meet the job requirements. This procedure ensures professional competition in the acquisition and promotion of personnel. Such changes have been received positively by many of the employees, although a number of them still found such changes to be wanting. To a certain degree, this has affected their productivity.

In the case of the LTO, not much has been changed insofar as HRM functions are concerned. This situation has considerably affected the performance output of the agency as evidenced by the complaints received from the clients. It has also contributed to the lack of motivation and the lowering of the levels of morale and job satisfaction among a number of the employees.

As mentioned earlier in the conceptual framework, any reform that may be introduced would have implications on behavioral change. To a

certain extent, the introduced new technology in the LTO has effected some kind of a "culture change" as indicated by the responses of the employees. They admitted that they used to get "extra income" from the clients in facilitating their business transactions. With computerization, their work attitude has changed. They still work harder even without the "extra income" that they used to earn from the clients; but then, these are just a few of the many employees. As claimed by the interviewed clients, many employees demand "grease money" to facilitate the processing of their documents or papers. Seemingly, the introduction of the new technology has not yet changed much the behavior of the employees. There is doubt as to whether the application of the new technology has been intended really to change positively the behavior of the employees. As contained in the objectives of the computerization project, the application of the new technology has been intended to improve service delivery through faster transactions. Although majority (55 percent) of the interviewed clients claimed that transactions have become faster and services have improved, a large number (45 percent) still believed that services have not improved at all.

To a certain extent, the introduced improvement strategies have some empowering effects on some employees. To them, the changes in their functions and responsibilities provided them with the opportunity to learn new skills and knowledge. This has increased their productivity and self-confidence. Nonetheless, this kind of an opportunity has been limited as shown in the case studies most especially in the LTO experience.

It is worth noting though that both agencies have mechanisms for the participation of the rank and file employees in the decisionmaking processes as they pertain in particular to the recruitment, selection and promotion of personnel. Representatives of the employees union sit in the personnel committees of the agencies. Such kind of participation has some empowering effects on the employees through their unions. Membership in the personnel committees has afforded them opportunity to discuss with management their concerns.

The case studies strongly suggest the need for an enabling work environment where efforts towards developing the capabilities of the employees for work would be sustained. As seen from the case studies, however, the agencies, particularly the LTO, have not done much to create such environment. For instance, rewards and incentives for good performance are seen to be a tool for enhancing capabilities of employees for work. But then, the agencies, due to financial constraints, have not been able to provide these incentives. Further, in instances where rewards are given, the issue of inequity has cropped up.

An important aspect of an enabling work environment is the provision of logistical support for more efficient performance. The case studies show the negative effects on the performance of the employees of insufficient and unreliable equipment and facilities. As cited in the case study of the LTO, the computers being used by the staff often go offline and hang. This has very much affected their work efficiency. In the case of the NSO, there seems to be an inadequate number of computers for use of the staff. Even supplies and facilities like printers are not sufficient. With insufficient logistical support from the management, efforts to improve staff performance would be difficult to achieve.

As seen from the case studies, the introduction of the public sector reforms has attempted to broaden the concept of HRM under the principles of new public management model. There is still the need to focus on the internal processes of managing the personnel such as recruitment, selection, promotion and the application of civil service rules and regulations to ensure efficiency and productivity. There is also the greater need to mobilize and develop the capabilities of the workforce for more productivity and greater efficiency. Further, the case studies have shown that the new public sector HRM has attempted to create more flexible structures and processes and has tried to decentralize authority to the subnational level for faster decisionmaking and transactions. At the job level, the new HRM system has emphasized performance and output measures. Indeed, the concept of HRM has taken a broader perspective under the principles of new public management.

### **Lessons Learned**

As depicted in the case studies, certain lessons can be drawn from the implementation of public sector reforms, among which are the following:

- 1. The need to include in the public sector reform agenda the changes to be made in the HRM and HRD functions and activities.*

The performance, motivation, morale, and job satisfaction of the employees are closely related to the changes in the management of human resource functions as well as to the development of the capabilities of the employees for work. In this regard, the implementation of the improvement strategies should be accompanied by changes in the HRM and HRD functions and systems to effectively carry out the objectives of the reforms and ultimately improve the organization's performance; for instance, changes in the system and procedures in the recruitment of

personnel should be instituted where only the technically and psychologically prepared applicants are employed. Promotion of personnel should be subject to criteria applicable to all employees and promotive of competition between insiders and outsiders.

At the job level, it is important for the employees to know their job responsibilities and accountabilities to be able to perform well. In this regard, management should develop and enhance their employees' knowledge and skills to meet the requirements of their jobs. Management should also come up with performance measurements for assessing job performance.

*2. The need to technically prepare the employees for the new jobs or functions and responsibilities assigned to them.*

The preparation would entail a clear understanding on employees' part of their functions in relation to the overall goals and objectives of the office. This would include training to enable them to acquire the needed skills and knowledge before they assume their new jobs or functions.

*3. The need to orient and involve the employees in the processes contained in the reform agenda.*

As found in the case studies, dialogues and meetings with the employees to explain the overall goals and objectives of the reforms are wanting; thus, their lack of understanding of the principles and criteria involved in the changes has given rise to fears and anxieties about the changes in their work environment and strong resistance to the improvement strategies.

*4. The need to create an enabling work environment for the implementation of the reforms.*

A work environment where the introduced changes and reforms are sustained by management could be seen as an enabling or facilitative kind of environment. One way is the provision of good equipment and facilities to aid the employees in their work. As indicated in the case studies, the lack of and the poor quality of equipment and facilities has largely contributed to the job dissatisfaction of many employees. A comfortable working place appears to be a must.

Another way by which the work environment can enable the employees to be more productive and efficient is to maintain an incentives award system. As seen in the case studies, awards or incentives to good performers set the work standards in the office for emulation by all

employees. They motivate them to work harder and perform their best. Unfortunately, as experienced by the sample agencies, the employees got discouraged and demotivated when the incentives stopped owing to financial constraints.

The inequitable way of giving awards and incentives to employees could lower the morale of employees. A basic assumption is that all are qualified to receive the awards as long as they meet the set standards for work. As long as there are perceptions that the management does not heed to the written "rules of the game," then the enabling process is hampered.

5. *The need for a strong "political will" to implement the reform agenda.*

One of the cited constraints in the implementation of the improvement strategies is the lack of "political will" on the part of the management to push through all the changes and reforms contained in the agenda. This gives the wrong message to the employees that the management is not "sincere" in instituting reforms in the organization; thus, this contributes strongly to the disenchantment of the employees regarding innovation and reforms.

### References

- Berman, Evan M.  
2001 *Human Resource Management in Public Service: Paradoxes, Processes and Problems*. California, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Brown, Kerry  
2004 *Human Resource Management in the Public Sector. Public Management Review*. United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis Group.
- International Labor Organization (ILO)  
1998 *Human Resources Development in the Public Service in the Context of Structural Adjustment and Transition*. Geneva: December.
- Land Transportation Office (LTO)  
2004 *Personnel Complement, CY 2003*. Statistics Section Management Information Division.
- Minogue, Martin  
2001a *The Internationalization of Public Management*. In Martin Minogue and Willy McCourt, eds. *The Internationalization of Public Management: Reinventing the Third World State*. Cheltenham, United Kingdom: Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. 1-19.



- 2001b      Should Flawed Models of Public Management be Exported? Issues and Practices. In Martin Minogue and Willy McCourt, eds. *The Internationalization of Public Management: Reinventing the Third World State*. United Kingdom: Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd.
- National Statistics Office
- 2004a      NSO Plantilla of Personnel, CY 2004.
- 2004b      Personnel Complement Report, CY 2004.
- Osborne, David and Ted Gaebler
- 1992      *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit is Transforming the Public Sector*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publication Co.
- Pollitt, Christopher and Geert Bouckaert
- 2000      *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis*. New York: Oxford University Press.

**2004 TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**Volume XLVIII Nos. 1-4**

*Numbers 1 & 2*

Indigenous Leadership and Governance . . . . .	Ma. Oliva Z. Domingo	1
Coming to Terms With Indigenous Governance Institutions in the Cordillera Region: A Preliminary Look at the Kalinga Experience. . . . .	Ma. Carmen V. Peñalosa	40
The Bontok Igorot Tribe: An Internal Scanning of its Governance System . . . . .	Susana Evangelista-Leones	86
Exploring the Indigenous Local Governance of Manobo Tribes in Mindanao . . . . .	Ma. Leny E. Felix	124
The Traditional Maranaw Governance System: Descriptives, Issues and Imperatives for Philippine Public Administration . . . . .	Liberty Ibañez Nolasco	155

*Number 3*

Improving the Delivery of Extension Services in the Philippines: Lessons Learned and Future Directions . . . . .	Remigio D. Ocenar, Alex B. Brillantes, Jr., Sandy Cuthbertson and Michael A. Tumanut	205
A Critique of the Local Poverty Diagnosis and Planning System . . . . .	Victoria A. Bautista	235
Reform as Policy Theory: The Case of Public Management Reform in the Philippines . . . . .	Simeon A. Ilago	249
Public Administration and Political Determination: A Review of Theoretical and Rhetorical Notions in "Healing the Nation" . . . . .	Ananda Devi Domingo-Almase	260
Postmodernism in 21st Century Medicine: Implications for Philippine Healthcare and Public Administration . . . . .	Julius A. Lecciones	281

*Number 4*

Spatial Dimension of Public Administration .....	Romeo B. Ocampo	321
Transformative Citizenship: Exploring its Challenges to Philippine Public Administration .....	Fermin P. Manalo, Jr.	338
Regulating Vehicular Emissions in Three Asian Cities: Comparative Analysis of Regulatory Program Design .....	Francisco G. Delfin, Jr.	370
Human Resources Development Reforms in the Bureaucracy .....	Perla E. Legaspi	397
2004 Table of Contents .....		441
2004 Index .....		443

**2004  
Author-Title Index  
Volume XLVIII Nos. 1-4**

- Almase, Ananda Devi Domingo. Public administration and political determination: a review of theoretical and rhetorical notions in "healing the nation," 260-280.
- Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.
- The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, by Susana Evangelista-Leones, 86-123.
- Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, by Ma. Carmen V. Peñalosa, 40-85.
- A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, by Victoria A. Bautista, 235-248.
- Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.
- Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.
- Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, by Ma. Leny E. Felix, 124-154.
- Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.
- HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, by Perla E. Legaspi, 397-440.
- Illago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.
- Improving the delivery of extension services in the Philippines: lessons learned and future directions, by Remigio D. Ocenar, Alex B. Brillantes, Jr., Sandy Cuthbertson and Michael A. Tumanut, 205-234.
- Indigenous leadership and governance, by Ma. Oliva Z. Domingo, 1-39.
- Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-204.

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

Ocenar, Remigio D., Alex B. Brillantes, Jr., Sandy Cuthbertson and Michael A. Tumanut. Improving the delivery of extension services in the Philippines: lessons learned and future directions, 205-234.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

Postmodernism in 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, by Julius A. Lecciones, 281-320.

Public administration and political determination: a review of theoretical and rhetorical notions in "healing the nation," by Ananda Devi Domingo-Almase, 260-280.

Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, by Simeon A. Ilago, 249-259.

Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, by Francisco G. Delfin, Jr., 370-396.

Spatial dimension of public administration, by Romeo B. Ocampo, 321-337.

The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, by Liberty Ibañez Nolasco, 155-204.

Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, by Fermin P. Manalo, Jr., 338-369.

**2004  
Subject Index  
Volume XLVIII Nos. 1-4**

**ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE**

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**ADMINISTRATIVE REFORMS**

Iligo, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**AGRICULTURAL EXTENSION SERVICES — CASE STUDIES**

Ocenar, Remigio, Alex B. Brillantes, Jr., Sandy Cuthbertson and Michael A. Tumanut. Improving the delivery of extension services in the Philippines: lessons learned and future directions, 205-234.

**AIR POLLUTION CONTROL PROGRAMS — DELHI**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**AIR POLLUTION CONTROL PROGRAMS — MANILA**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**AIR POLLUTION CONTROL PROGRAMS — TAIPEI**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**BODONG (PEACE PACT SYSTEM)**

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**BONTOK IGOROTS (TRIBE)**

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

**BONTOKS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**BUREAUCRACY**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**BUREAUCRATIC REFORMS**

Illago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**CITIZEN PARTICIPATION**

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

**CITIZENSHIP**

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

**CLEAN AIR ACT OF 1997, PHILIPPINE**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**CLEAR AIR POLICIES**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**CONFLICT RESOLUTION AND MANAGEMENT**

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

#### CORDILLERA REGION

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

#### DECISIONMAKING

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

#### DELHI

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

#### DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

#### DEVELOPMENT THEORY

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

#### EMPOWERMENT

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

#### EXTENSION SERVICES

Ocenar, Remigio, Alex B. Brillantes, Jr., Sandy Cuthbertson and Michael A. Tumanut. Improving the delivery of extension services in the Philippines: lessons learned and future directions, 205-234.



**GENDER SENSITIVITY**

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

**GEOGRAPHIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**GLOBALIZATION**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440, .

**GOVERNANCE**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. . The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

**GOVERNANCE INSTITUTIONS AND SYSTEMS**

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

**HEALTHCARE**

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

**HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (HRD)**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT (HRM)**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**IFUGAOS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**INDIGENOUS CULTURAL COMMUNITIES (ICCs)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**INDIGENOUS GOVERNANCE**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**INDIGENOUS GROUPS**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**INDIGENOUS LEADERSHIP**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**INDIGENOUS PEOPLES (IPs)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**INDIGENOUS PEOPLES RIGHTS ACT (IPRA)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY (ICT)**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**INTEGRATED CONFLICT RESOLUTION AND MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (ICRMP)**

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**INTEGRATED REORGANIZATION PLAN (IRP)**

Illago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**JOB ADMINISTRATION**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**JUDICIAL SYSTEM, INDIGENOUS**

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**KALINGA (PROVINCE)**

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**KALINGAS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**LAND TRANSPORTATION OFFICE (LTO)**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**LEADERS**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**LEADERSHIP**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**LEGISLATION AND POLICY MAKING, INDIGENOUS**

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**LOCAL CHIEF EXECUTIVES**

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

**LOCAL GOVERNANCE**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT UNITS (LGUs)**

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

**LOCAL POVERTY DIAGNOSIS AND PLANNING SYSTEM (LPDPS)**

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

**MANDAYAS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**MANGYANS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**MANOBOS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

**MARANAOS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Nolasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

#### MEDICAL CARE

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

#### MEDICINE

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

#### METROPOLITAN MANILA

Delfin, Francisco G., Jr. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

#### MINIMUM BASIC NEEDS (MBN)

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

#### MOUNTAIN PROVINCE

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

#### NATIONAL STATISTICS OFFICE (NSO)

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

#### NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT (NPM)

Ilago, Simeon Agustin Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

#### PEACE PACT SYSTEM

Felix, Ma. Leny E. Exploring the indigenous local governance of Manobo tribes in Mindanao, 124-154.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

#### **PARTICIPATION**

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

#### **PARTICIPATORY DEVELOPMENT**

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

#### **PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

#### **POLICY THEORIES**

Ilago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

#### **POLITICS AND ADMINISTRATIVE DICHOTOMY**

Almase, Ananda Devi Domingo. Public administration and political determination: a review of theoretical and rhetorical notions in "Healing the Nation," 260-280.

#### **POLITICS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

Almase, Ananda Devi Domingo. Public administration and political determination: a review of theoretical and rhetorical notions in "Healing the Nation," 260-280.

#### **POSTMODERNISM AND HEALTHCARE**

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

#### **POVERTY ALLEVIATION**

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

**POVERTY INDICATORS**

Bautista, Victoria A. A critique of the local poverty diagnosis and planning system, 235-248.

**PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION ON GOVERNMENT REORGANIZATION (PCGR)**

Ilago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**PRESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE ON STREAMLINING THE BUREAUCRACY (PCSB)**

Ilago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

Almase, Ananda Devi Domingo. Public administration and political determination: a review of theoretical and rhetorical notions in "Healing the Nation," 260-280.

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

Manalo, Fermin, Jr. P. Transformative citizenship: exploring its challenges to Philippine public administration, 338-369.

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**PUBLIC HEALTH ADMINISTRATION**

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

**PUBLIC MANAGEMENT REFORM**

Ilago, Simeon A. Reform as policy theory: the case of public management reform in the Philippines, 249-259.

**REENGINEERING**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.



**REGULATION**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**REORGANIZATION**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**REPUBLIC ACT NO. 8371 (INDIGENOUS PEOPLES RIGHTS ACT)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**REPUBLIC ACT NO. 8749 (PHILIPPINE CLEAN AIR ACT OF 1999)**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY**

Lecciones, Julius A. Postmodernism in the 21st century medicine: implications for Philippine healthcare and public administration, 281-320.

**SOCIAL ORGANIZATIONS, INDIGENOUS**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**SPATIAL INFORMATION MANAGEMENT (SIM)**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**SPATIAL SYSTEMS**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**TAIPEI**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**T'BOLIS (INDIGENOUS GROUP)**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

**TRADITIONAL GOVERNANCE INSTITUTIONS**

Domingo, Ma. Oliva Z. Indigenous leadership and governance, 1-39.

Leones, Susana Evangelista. The Bontok Igorot tribe: an internal scanning of its governance system, 86-123.

Noñasco, Liberty Ibañez. The traditional Maranaw governance system: descriptives, issues and imperatives for Philippine public administration, 155-203.

Peñalosa, Ma. Carmen V. Coming to terms with indigenous governance institutions in the Cordillera region: a preliminary look at the Kalinga experience, 40-85.

**TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT**

Legaspi, Perla E. HRD reforms in the bureaucracy, 397-440.

**TRANSPORTATION**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**UNIVERSITY OF THE PHILIPPINES NATIONAL COLLEGE  
OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND GOVERNANCE**

Ocampo, Romeo B. Spatial dimension of public administration, 321-337.

**VEHICULAR EMISSION REGULATION PROGRAMS — DELHI**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**VEHICULAR EMISSION REGULATION PROGRAMS — MANILA**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**VEHICULAR EMISSION REGULATION PROGRAMS — TAIPEI**

Delfin, Francisco, Jr. G. Regulating vehicular emissions in three Asian cities: comparative analysis of regulatory program design, 370-396.

**FACULTY**  
**NATIONAL COLLEGE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND GOVERNANCE**  
**UNIVERSITY OF THE PHILIPPINES**

JOSE V. ABUEVA, *Professor Emeritus of Public Administration and Political Science*

ERWIN GASPAR A. ALAMPAY, *Assistant Professor*

MA. CONCEPCION P. ALFILER, *Professor\**

VICTORIA A. BAUTISTA, *Professor and Director, Center for Leadership, Citizenship and Democracy*

EMILIA T. BONCODIN, *Professor\**

ALEX B. BRILLANTES, JR., *Associate Professor and Dean*

LEONOR M. BRIONES, *Professor and Director, Center for Policy and Executive Development*

WILHELMINA L. CABO, *Assistant Professor*

LEDIVINA V. CARIÑO, *University Professor*

EDNA ESTIFANIA A. CO, *Assistant Professor*

JOCELYN C. CUARESMA, *Assistant Professor\*\**

RAUL P. DE GUZMAN, *Professor Emeritus*

J. PROSPERO E. DE VERA III, *Associate Professor\*\*\**

MA. OLIVA Z. DOMINGO, *Assistant Professor\*\**

GABRIELLE R. IGLESIAS, *Assistant Professor\*\**

SIMEON A. ILAGO, *Assistant Professor and Director, Center for Local and Regional Governance*

PERLA E. LEGASPI, *Associate Professor*

JOEL V. MANGAHAS, *Associate Professor, College Secretary and Director, Center for Public Administration and Governance Education*

VICENTE D. MARIANO, *Associate Professor*

MA. FE V. MENDOZA, *Assistant Professor*

PERLA C. PATACSIL, *College Librarian*

MILA A. REFORMA, *Professor*

DANILO R. REYES, *Associate Professor*

DAN A. SAGUIL, *Assistant Professor and Residential Program Coordinator*

JOSE P. TABBADA, *Professor*

PROSERPINA D. TAPALES, *Professor*

NORIEL CHRISTOPHER C. TIGLAO, *Assistant Professor*

**Lecturers**

REYMUNDO S. ANDALLON, JR., *Lecturer*

HAYDE B. ARANDIA, *Senior Lecturer*

WALDEN BELLO, *Professor*

CHESELDON GEORGE V. CARMONA, *Senior Lecturer*

BENJAMIN ENDRIGA, *Senior Lecturer*

PIO P. FRAGO, *Professorial Lecturer*

LILIBETH JOVITA J. JUAN, *Lecturer*

JESUS L.R. MATEO, *Senior Lecturer*

ELEANOR E. NICOLAS, *Lecturer*

AGNES MARIA D. NONOG, *Lecturer*

REMIGIO EDGARDO D. OCENAR, *Senior Lecturer*

NIEVES OSORIO, *Professorial Lecturer*

---

\* On Secondment

\*\* On Study Leave

\*\*\* On Sabbatical Leave



9 770031 767524

ISSN 977-0031-7675-2